Student Graduation Lab Project duration Graduation committee



# Smart Stadium Tools

Exploratory case study of the Johan Cruijff ArenA: identification and optimization of smart tools

AND ALLENGER ALLENDE

# Measure space use

# Measure space use

Y

# Measure space use







"Service or product which collects real-time information on space use to improve the space use on the current campus on the one hand, whilst supporting decision making on the future space use on the other hand"

(Valks, Arkesteijn, Den Heijer & Vande Putte, 2018, p. 23)







1. (Real-time) data is obtained from different sources (such as sensors, raw data)

2. The data is place in an integrated platform, also named a **data lake**. In this data lake, **analytics** are done in order to turn the data into **information**. Also, data can be stored in a **data storage**.



**1**. (Real-time) **data** is obtained from different sources (such as sensors, raw data)

2. The data is place in an integrated platform, also named a **data lake**. In this data lake, **analytics** are done in order to turn the data into **information**. Also, data can be stored in a **data storage**.

**3**. The information is visualized: **dashboard** or **apps**, which can be accessed by users.



1. (Real-time) **data** is obtained from different sources (such as sensors, raw data)

2. The data is place in an integrated platform, also named a **data lake**. In this data lake, **analytics** are done in order to turn the data into **information**. Also, data can be stored in a **data storage**.

**3**. The information is visualized in **dashboard** or **apps**, which can be accessed by users.

#### **ABN AMRO - Lone Rooftop**



(Valks et al., 2018, p. 74 - 75)

#### Hypothesis of smart tools



#### Hypothesis of smart tools



Time

Stadiums are an important part of our society; the first known stadium was built in the ancient Greeks in the 8th century BC.

TI



Coca Cola.

TURKISH AIRLINES

The physical environment of the stadium has a significant effect on the extent to which spectators will desire to stay and return to the stadium (Wakefield, Blodgett & Sloan, 1996, p. 15).

0

RODLAVERARENA

Today's stadiums face increasing competition from home-viewing options, powered by better camera angles and multiplatform, multimedia experiences (Giorgio, Deweese, Reichheld, & Ebb, 2018, p. 3).

Today's smartphone owner carries a device with processing power that would have required a computer the size of a stadium fifty years ago (Campbell & Giorgio, 2018, p. 2).





Which smart tools can be identified in stadiums, and how can the use of these smart tools be optimized?

Which smart tools can be identified in stadiums, and how can the use of these smart tools be optimized?

Which smart tools can be identified in stadiums, and how can the use of these smart tools be optimized?

1 | Smart tools

2 | Stadiums

3 | Optimized

## Sub-questions



Smart tools

What are smart tools?

How is the integration of smart tools related to real estate management theories?



Stadium

What are the characteristics of a stadium and how is this related to the need for smart tools?

What is a 'smart stadium'?

Which smart tools are integrated within stadiums and what are the objectives for integrating them?



Optimize

What is the progress since the integration of the smart tools and how can this be improved?

What interventions can be recommended to improve the use of the smart tools?

# Methodological fit



# Methodological fit



# Methodology

- Qualitative research method:
  - Useful for (nascent) theories that do not exist yet

#### - Exploratory case study and literature review:

Investigate a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context (Yin, 2014) Suitable method due to the contemporary character of integrating smart tools in stadium

# Methodology





#### Real estate management theories



#### Corporate Real Estate Management (CREM)

"[...] aligning the portfolio and services to the needs of the core business, in order to maximize the added value for the business and to optimally contribute to the overall performance of the corporation" (Dewulf, Krumm & De Jonge, 2000).

Relevant for smart tools due to the hypothesis: to align real estate portfolios more frequently in time and on a higher level of detail (Valks et al., 2018).

"[...] every business needs some sort of property in which to carry on its activity." (Edwards & Ellison, 2005, p. 9)









Value adding attributes of CREM



(Lindholm et al., 2006)

## **Added Values**

Nourse & Roulac	De Jonge	Lindholm & Leväinen	Scheffer et al.	De Vries	Den Heijer	Van der Zwart	Valks, Den Heijer, Arkesteijn
1993	1996	2006	2006	2008	2011	2011	2018
Occupancy cost minimalization	Reduce costs	Reduce costs	Cost reduction	Reducing costs	Decreasing costs	Reducing costs	Decreasing costs
Facilitate and control production, operations and service delivery	Improve productivity	Increase productivity	Increasing productivity	Increase productivity	Support user activities	Improving productivity	Support user activities
Promote human resource objectives	Improve culture	Increase employee satisfaction	Changing the culture	Increasing satisfaction	Increasing (user) satisfaction	Increasing user satisfaction	Increasing (user) satisfaction
					Improving quality of place		Improving quality of place
Facilitate managerial process and knowledge work	Marketing	Promote marketing and sale	PR and marketing	Supporting image	Supporting culture	Supporting image	Supporting culture
					Stimulating collaboration		Stimulating collaboration
Promote marketing message		Increase Innovation		Stimulating innovation	Stimulating innovation	Increasing innovation	Stimulating innovation
Flexibility	Increase flexibility	Increase flexibility	Increase of flexibility	Enhancing flexibility	Increase flexibility	Improving flexibility	Increase flexibility
Capture real estate value creation	Improve availability of finance (increase of value)	Increase value of assets	Increase of value	Expanding funding possibilities	Increase real estate value	Improving the financial position	Increase real estate value
	Risk management		Risk control	Controlling risks	Controlling risk	Controlling risks	Controlling risk
				Improving culture	Supporting image	Improving culture	Supporting image
					Reducing ecological footprint		Reducing footprint (m2)
							Reducing footprint (CO2)


#### **Development of stadiums**



(based on Dunning & Sheard, 2005)

#### **Development of stadiums**





- Stadium developments can have an economic impact on the (local) area.
- Stadium development can be used as a driver for new area developments.
- Justifications for investing with public money.









- Investors in stadium developments are often municipalities, sports clubs and banks.
- Income: lease for organizing events
- Costs: operations





- Spectator important user
- Customer Journey Method

CUSTOMER									
JOURNEY	HOME				STADIUM			BAR   HOTEL   RESTAURANT   HOME	
SPECTATOR.	Announcement of	Ticket sell	Preparation & Mood	Transportation to the	Check-in stadium	Waiting in stadium	Live event	Event ended: leave	After event: re-
	event	Heree Sen	making	event		before start of the		stadium	experience the event
				. 114		event			
					Contraction of the second s			V 🗮 🖉	
		1			η Ι	1		T	
	1	 			I	 	- 	 	
	1	I I	1	1	I I	1	1	l I	 
ACTIVITIES	The visitor get informed and is aware of the event by	The spectator visits an online platform to buy a ticket or	Reading news items about the live event. Spread the	Reaching the stadium based on the best transportation	<ul><li>Arrival at the stadium. Find</li><li>the right entrance gate.</li></ul>	<ul> <li>Use of facilities, such as</li> <li>toilets, food and beverages.</li> </ul>	Live experience, focus on the events. If available, watch	Leave the event, find out the best transportation method	Leisure activities: Restaurants and cafes. Re-experience the
	(social) media channels, social activities, or other.	goes to a shop to buy physical ticket.	news with social connections that you are going to the	method. This can be by public transport, private car, or by	Waiting in the line to check-in the ticket. Eventually food	Find your seat in the stadium. Social sharing of your	pictures of the event. Enjoy	to leave.	match experience. Watch highlights at home. Share
		1	transportation of the event.	combinations are possible.	and beverage consumption around the stadium,	channels. Connect with Wi-Fi.	the the team.	1	social media updates.
			Print the ticket.		purchase of merchandise.	• 			
MOTIVATIONS	As a result of personal	The spectator does not want	Excited to go the event.	Motivation is to be on time at	Excited to be in the stadium	Start well-prepared for the	Don't want to miss a single	Leave the stadium most	Discuss the match experience
	mood making, the visitor	perspective keeps the fan	Important to find out how to go to the event and how to	a minute. Strive for the most	ambiance. Don't want to be	event. Visitors care about the view and surrounded people	Emotions are affected by the results during the match	nuisance as possible.	event.
	event.		check in there.	option. Don't want to be	proper seat.			1	
				transportation plan.					
QUESTIONS	When is the event? Do I	Where to buy the tickets, are	What is the best way to go to	Will I be on time at the	Where is the gate where I	Where are the facilities?	What is the best moment to	Where is the closest exit?	What is a nice place to have a
	already have other plans that date? With whom are we	there enough tickets and how expensive are the	the event? What do I have to bring to the event? Do I have	event? Is there no delay in arrival time? Is there enough	have to check in (way finder)? Where did I left my ticket?	Where is my seat? How do I feel? Am I hungry or thirsty?	use the facilities? When shall I take a picture?	Where do I have to go? Where is it not crowded? Is	drink? Where can I watch the highlights? Where is a place
	going? Where is the event?	tickets?	to print my ticket? Do I have to bring food?	parking space? Are there no other uncertainties?	Which queue is the quickest?	Can I go to the toilet? How is the view? How are the	1	my transport not delayed?	left? What's on the route home?
	1	l I	1	1	I I	<ul> <li>people surrounded by me?</li> <li>Will I be on time when buying</li> </ul>	1	l I	 
BARRIERS	Other plans at the date of the event. Nobody is able to join	of the ticket and the effort it	No transportation means available. No possibility to	New uncertainties that will influence the estimated time	The waiting time in the line. The wayfinding of the right	Long waiting lines for the different facilities. Bad view	event impacts the emotion of	times. Transportation issues.	location. Too expensive.
	unreachable within time and	Performance of the sports	print the ticket. Costs of transportation are too high.	of arrival at the event.	gate.	people surrounded by the			
		1	No possibility to park a car.		l I		1	-   	
	1	l I	1	1	1	l l	1	l I	 
TOUCH POINTS	(Social) media channels	Online platform for ticket sell (and ticket resell), ticket shop	(Social) Media channels & Transportation planner	Transportation services and transportation infrastructure	Ticketing check in, queue management, F&B facilities,	Safety management, stadium facilities (F&B / toilets),	Live experience, Wi-Fi, safety, emotions	Transportation services.	Leisure facilities, social media.
		1			merchandise sale.	waiting lines, way finder, Wi-			
		I				• 	-		
	I I •	1	1	1	1				
EMOTION	Excited	·		L	!	E Excited			Relayed
			Anticipation	•	Stressed		Joy	Hurried	NeidAeu
	1	Irritated		Hurried	I.	1	(anger or happiness, depends on the result)	I	









































# Case: Johan Cruijff ArenA

#### Why?

- In 2015, the Johan Cruijff ArenA opened an innovation centre in the stadium
- "[...] by 2020 the Johan Cruijff ArenA must be the most innovative stadium in the world" (Johan Cruijff ArenA, 2017)
- Smart tools and other innovations in the Johan Cruijff ArenA are among the frontrunners

#### How?

- Data collection: semi-structured interviews, observations, documentation.
- Interview protocol based on smart tool research of Valks et al. (2016)
   & (2018)



#### 9 smart tools are identified





CONCEPTS THEORIES PRACTICE SYNTHESIS



- The crowd density in is estimated by anonymous, non-participatory, indoor Wi-Fi localization of smart phones.
- By detecting the MAC addresses by Wi-Fi access points (API's).
- The Wi-Fi signals that are transmitted from phones are captured by Wi-Fi access points.
- Based on this information, an estimation of the coordinates of a visitor can be given.
- The Wi-Fi tracking is done inside the stadium, the 'ring' around the stadium, and close around the stadium.



## **Enhance** safety and security



# **Enhance** safety and security



# **Enhance** safety and security


# **Enhance** safety and security



# Analysis

					F		<b>P</b>		
Name smart tool	Smart turf monitoring system	Crowd control	Mobility portal	Technical maintenance	Cash registers	Cleaning	Staffing	Ticketing check-in	Energy consumption & battery
Priority goal (4 perspectives)	Strategic	Functional	Functional	Functional	Financial	Financial	Financial	Financial	Physical
Phase	Implementati on	Research and Product development	Implementati on	Product development	Implementati on	Product development	Product development	Implementati on	Implementati on
Goal of the tool	"Higher quality of the pitch & higher utilization of the pitch"	"To understand and possibility to control the behaviour of people within the stadium" "Safety"	"Better travel experience for visitors to the area" "Reduce motorized transport"	"To realize a cost reduction for energy consumption, maintenance, facility management" "Improve quality of living areas"	"Increase revenues, better service, cost reductions, more certainty and less risks."	"Reduce cleaning costs"	"Higher efficiency in communicati on and better idea of the time registration "	"A more efficient ticketing check-in"	"To reduce energy consumption"
Progress since implementing the tool	"The pitch only needs replacement ones a year instead of multiple times a year"	The tool is not implemented yet.	"750.000 travel advices given to people"	The tool is not implemented yet.	"Based on the current information it can be confirmed that the extension on the second ring are generating more revenues."	The tool is not implemented yet	The tool is not implemented yet	"Better insights in the attendance of visitors during events".	"Better insight in the energy consumption" "Sustainable energy production"
Specific points of improvement and ambitions to achieve the goal	"Historical data"	"Historical data"	"Better real- time response"	Not available	"Historical data" "Better real-time response" "Connect to ticketing check-in"	"Better real- time response"	"Connect to a digital check- in" "Historical data"	"Historical data" "Better real-time response"	"Connect to the building management system"
Points of attention	"Measuremen t method"	"Privacy" "Measuremen t method" "Technical layer"	"Measuremen t method" "Collaboratio n with partners" "Privacy"	"Technical layer"	"Collaboratio n with partners (suppliers)" "Privacy"	Not available	Not available	Not available	Not available

# Analysis

					F			1	
Name smart tool	Smart turf monitoring system	Crowd control	Mobility portal	Technical maintenance	Cash registers	Cleaning	Staffing	Ticketing check-in	Energy consumption & battery
Priority goal (4 perspectives)	Strategic	Functional	Functional	Functional	Financial	Financial	Financial	Financial	Physical
Phase	Implementati on	Research and Product development	Implementati on	Product development	Implementati on	Product development	Product development	Implementati on	Implementati on
Goal of the tool	"Higher quality of the pitch & higher utilization of the pitch"	"To understand and possibility to control the behaviour of people within the stadium" "Safety"	"Better travel experience for visitors to the area" "Reduce motorized transport"	"To realize a cost reduction for energy consumption, maintenance, facility management" "Improve quality of living areas"	"Increase revenues, better service, cost reductions, more certainty and less risks."	"Reduce cleaning costs"	"Higher efficiency in communicati on and better idea of the time registration "	"A more efficient ticketing check-in"	"To reduce energy consumption"
Progress since implementing the tool	"The pitch only needs replacement ones a year instead of multiple times a year"	The tool is not implemented yet.	"750.000 travel advices given to people"	The tool is not implemented yet.	"Based on the current information it can be confirmed that the extension on the second ring are generating more revenues."	The tool is not implemented yet	The tool is not implemented yet	"Better insights in the attendance of visitors during events".	"Better insight in the energy consumption" "Sustainable energy production"
Specific points of improvement and ambitions to achieve the goal	"Historical data"	"Historical data"	"Better real- time response"	Not available	"Historical data" "Better real-time response" "Connect to ticketing check-in"	"Better real- time response"	"Connect to a digital check- in" "Historical data"	"Historical data" "Better real-time response"	"Connect to the building management system"
Points of attention	"Measuremen t method"	"Privacy" "Measuremen t method" "Technical layer"	"Measuremen t method" "Collaboratio n with partners" "Privacy"	"Technical layer"	"Collaboratio n with partners (suppliers)" "Privacy"	Not available	Not available	Not available	Not available

# Goals

- The tools clearly express two goals reducing costs and supporting the user activities.
- Specific numbers / targets were not clearly stated and available.
- Some strategic and physical goals.

Smart Tool 📘	Priority 🙎	Strategi	Strategic 🧐					Functional 👗 Fi		Financi	Financial		Physical 💡	
		Stimulating innovation	Stimulating collaboration	Supporting image	Supporting culture	Improving quality of place	Supporting user activities	Increasing user satisfaction	Increasing flexibility	Decrease costs	Increasing real estate value	Controlling risks	Optimize m2 footprint	Reduce CO2 footprint
Cash registers	Financial						4	<b>,</b>					<b>,</b>	
Cleaning	Financial						<b>(</b>			4				
Crowd control	Functional													
Energy consumption & battery	Physical		<b>,</b>	4								<b>(</b>		<b>(</b>
Mobility Portal	Functional		<b>,</b>											<b>(</b>
Smart turf monitoring system	Strategic	<b>,</b>				<b>,</b>	4			<b>,</b>				
Staffing	Financial						<b>"</b>							
Technical maintenance	Functional					.4		<b>,</b>		4				<b>(</b>
Ticketing check-in	Financial	4					4			<b>,</b>				

# Analysis

					F				
Name smart tool	Smart turf monitoring system	Crowd control	Mobility portal	Technical maintenance	Cash registers	Cleaning	Staffing	Ticketing check-in	Energy consumption & battery
Priority goal (4 perspectives)	Strategic	Functional	Functional	Functional	Financial	Financial	Financial	Financial	Physical
Phase	Implementati on	Research and Product development	Implementati on	Product development	Implementati on	Product development	Product development	Implementati on	Implementati on
Goal of the tool	"Higher quality of the pitch & higher utilization of the pitch"	"To understand and possibility to control the behaviour of people within the stadium" "Safety"	"Better travel experience for visitors to the area" "Reduce motorized transport"	"To realize a cost reduction for energy consumption, maintenance, facility management" "Improve quality of living areas"	"Increase revenues, better service, cost reductions, more certainty and less risks."	"Reduce cleaning costs"	"Higher efficiency in communicati on and better idea of the time registration "	"A more efficient ticketing check-in"	"To reduce energy consumption"
Progress since implementing the tool	"The pitch only needs replacement ones a year instead of multiple times a year"	The tool is not implemented yet.	"750.000 travel advices given to people"	The tool is not implemented yet.	"Based on the current information it can be confirmed that the extension on the second ring are generating more revenues."	The tool is not implemented yet	The tool is not implemented yet	"Better insights in the attendance of visitors during events".	"Better insight in the energy consumption" "Sustainable energy production"
Specific points of improvement and ambitions to achieve the goal	"Historical data"	"Historical data"	"Better real- time response"	Not available	"Historical data" "Better real-time response" "Connect to ticketing check-in"	"Better real- time response"	"Connect to a digital check- in" "Historical data"	"Historical data" "Better real-time response"	"Connect to the building management system"
Points of attention	"Measuremen t method"	"Privacy" "Measuremen t method" "Technical layer"	"Measuremen t method" "Collaboratio n with partners" "Privacy"	"Technical layer"	"Collaboratio n with partners (suppliers)" "Privacy"	Not available	Not available	Not available	Not available
				CON	ICEPTS	THEORIES	PRACTIC	CE SYN	NTHESIS

## Progress

- Only five of these tools were operational at the time of the interviews.
- Specific numbers of the progress since integrating the tools were not available.
- Progress was not monitored well.
- Also, monitoring was difficult due to immature character of the tools



# Analysis

		L			F				
Name smart tool	Smart turf monitoring system	Crowd control	Mobility portal	Technical maintenance	Cash registers	Cleaning	Staffing	Ticketing check-in	Energy consumption & battery
Priority goal (4 perspectives)	Strategic	Functional	Functional	Functional	Financial	Financial	Financial	Financial	Physical
Phase	Implementati on	Research and Product development	Implementati on	Product development	Implementati on	Product development	Product development	Implementati on	Implementati on
Goal of the tool	"Higher quality of the pitch & higher utilization of the pitch"	"To understand and possibility to control the behaviour of people within the stadium" "Safety"	"Better travel experience for visitors to the area" "Reduce motorized transport"	"To realize a cost reduction for energy consumption, maintenance, facility management" "Improve quality of living areas"	"Increase revenues, better service, cost reductions, more certainty and less risks."	"Reduce cleaning costs"	"Higher efficiency in communicati on and better idea of the time registration "	"A more efficient ticketing check-in"	"To reduce energy consumption"
Progress since implementing the tool	"The pitch only needs replacement ones a year instead of multiple times a year"	The tool is not implemented yet.	"750.000 travel advices given to people"	The tool is not implemented yet.	"Based on the current information it can be confirmed that the extension on the second ring are generating more revenues."	The tool is not implemented yet	The tool is not implemented yet	"Better insights in the attendance of visitors during events".	"Better insight in the energy consumption" "Sustainable energy production"
Specific points of improvement and ambitions to achieve the goal	storical data"	"Historical data"	"Better real- time response"	Not available	"Historical data" "Better real-time response" "Connect to ticketing check-in"	"Better real- time response"	"Connect to a digital check- in" "Historical data"	"Historical data" "Better real-time response"	"Connect to the building management system"
Points of attention	"Measuremen t method"	"Privacy" "Measuremen t method" "Technical layer"	"Measuremen t method" "Collaboratio n with partners" "Privacy"	"Technical layer"	"Collaboratio n with partners (suppliers)" "Privacy"	Not available	Not available	Not available	Not available

CONCEPTS THEORIES PRACTICE

SYNTHESIS

## Specific points of improvements



Use of historical data

Save the data in order to predict different types of events

"[..] van de historische evenementen die we hebben gehad dan kunnen we die gegevens opslaan en daar een soort van basisprofiel van gebouwd. Op basis van die historische gegevens kunnen we eigenlijk al zeggen dat is te verwachten" W. Hegen (personal communication, April 15, 2019).



#### Better real-time response

Only one of the tools is accessible for the user

"[..] maar als men onderweg is hebben we niet zoveel mogelijk om nog te benaderen Dat is iets waar we nog heel hard aan willen werken" **M. van Hövell (personal communication,** 

April 10, 2019).

E

#### Link with other systems

Link the tools to each other or to automated processes

"[..] ambitie om personeel te koppelen een het inchecksysteem [...]" W. Hegen (personal communication, April 15, 2019).





# Approach

#### What to be improved?

- 1) To improve the use of historical data
- 2) A better real-time response to visitors
- 3) Linking the tools

#### How?

Compare with other 'smart system' - Edge Olympic

New innovations that are available - 'Change the Game' Open Innovation Challenge



### EDGE OLYMPIC AMSTERDAM







# Smart system: EDGE Olympic



#### Historical data saved?

Collected data is saved which turns it into historical data. Used on the long-term for cleaning and different lay-out.

#### Real-time response?

Preferences as selected by the user through an mobile application are used for input in the data lake.



#### Linking of the tools?

Compared to performance goals, automate different processes.



# Smart system: EDGE Olympic



#### Historical data saved?

Collected data is saved which turns it into historical data. Used on the long-term for cleaning and different lay-out.

### Real-time response?

Preferences as selected by the user through an mobile application are used for input in the data lake.



#### Linking of the tools?

Compared to performance goals, automate different processes.



## **Innovation Challenge**

Change the Game' innovation challenge:

- ✓ Innovative start-ups, scale-ups and enterprises could submit their solutions
- ✓ 198 solutions were submitted from 32 countries
- ✓ January 2019 till April 2019



## Innovation Challenge



Mobile ordering platform



Pro-active and adaptive visual communication

Guide users throughout a venue by using innovative features (such as Gamification, Augmented Reality, and Virtual Reality



Smart map solutions



Facial recognition technology



Which smart tools can be identified in stadiums, and how can the use of these smart tools be optimized?

### Which smart tools can be identified in stadiums, and how can the use of these smart tools be optimized?

- Theories emphasizes the potential of smart tools
- 9 smart tools are identified and analysed based on different theoretical frameworks.
- At the moment of the research five smart tools were in use.
- Only one had open access for visitors (the mobility portal).
- Integrated current tools did cause some progress, concrete numbers were lacking.
- Focus of the tools is reducing costs and improve user activities.

### Which smart tools can be identified in stadiums, and how can the use of these smart tools be optimized?

- Basic technology infrastructure (technical layer) is very important.
- Make a profile for different type of events.
- Steer the visitor and other users more real-time (see 5 innovation challenges)
- Link the tools with each other.
  - Integrate performance levels
  - Proper technical layer
  - Automation
- Take into account importance of partners, privacy, technical layer and accuracy of measurement method

## Discussion

### On Theory

Added values

Smart tools - campus. Definition not clear in interviews

Smart stadium: limited scientific body of knowledge

### **On Practice**

Traditional organisations: need for innovation

Users mainly the stadium management

### Limitations of the research

The research focusses on only one case, external validity

Delimited period of the research: tools are currently integrated.

Neutrality of the research: only Johan Cruijff ArenA specialists

## **Recommendations for practice**

Smart tools have a lot of potential for stadiums:

- State clear objectives and goals that have to be achieved by the smart tools: what adds value to the stadium
- Assess clearly which data is needed in order to achieve these goals
- Monitor the progress of the smart tools
- Integrating smart tools require new capabilities in organisation
- Potential to connect to 'smart city concepts'
- Visitors are focussing on a live experience; smart tools can disrupt this experience

### Partner ecosystem



### Points of attention



Privacy

Some of the tools can be limited due to the ethical challenge of violating the privacy of visitors



#### Importance of technical layer

Importance that the technical layer, which is the process to obtain and process the data into information for the end-user, is properly constructed.

6FTE for data governance and management



Accuracy of measurement

#### methods

Some of the measurement methods of some of the tools cause for problems, which makes the data not totally reliable

## **Recommendations for further research**

- Conduct research with multiple case studies: improve the external validity
- And with other types of real estate
- Conduct the same research in a few years (when all the tools are integrated)
- Confirm theories by quantitative research: exact effects of the tools

