SKYSCRAPER HEIGHT

Economic of Tall Building

Quantitative research on height determinants factors in China

P5 presentation Tzu-wen Chiang 4694074

Content



- 1. INTRODUCTION
- 2. PROBLEM STATEMENT
- 3. METHODOLOGY
- 4. FINDING
- 5. CONCLUSION & SUGGESTION

INTRODUCTION

Skyscraper & Height



Amount of Tall buildings built

Around the world, there are 143 new towers constructed that reach above 200 meters tall in 2018. That's more than have been built in any other single year (CTBUH, 2018)

Have large effect on urban development and city Image

Building tall is one of the characteristic of skyscraper, and Height could be used as a tool to allocate city population and improve city efficiency. Thus Skyscraper distribution and height pattern is important to be understand for city development

CURRENT SITUATION IN CHINA



PROBLEM STATEMENT

Distribution of 200m+ Skyscrapers in China



23 skyscraper in an area Shanghai



26 skyscraper in an area Shenzhen

Newly proposed skyscrapers in China

| # | Building Name | City | Height (m) | Height (ft) | Floors | Completion | Material | Use |
|----------------------------|---|--|--|--|-------------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|
| 1 | Bionic Tower | Hong Kong (CN) | 1228 | 4,029 | 300 | - | | residential |
| 1 | Bionic Tower | Shanghai (CN) | 1228 | 4,029 | 300 | - | | multiple |
| 3 | M Tower | Shanghai (CN) | 900 | 2,953 | | - | | |
| 3 | Nansha Tower | Guangzhou (CN) | 900 | 2,953 | - | ш. | | |
| 5 | Sky City | Changsha (CN) | 838 | 2,749 | 202 | - | steel | hotel / residential / education / hospital / office |
| 6 | Chow Tai Fook Centre | Wuhan (CN) | 808 | 2,651 | 124 | ÷ | | hotel / serviced apartments / office |
| 7 | 777 Tower | Qingdao (CN) | 777 | 2,549 | - | - | | residential / office |
| 8 | Suzhou Zhongnan Center | Suzhou (CN) | 729 | 2,392 | 137 | - | composite | hotel / residential / office |
| 9 | Hua's International Plaza | Wuhan (CN) | 707 | 2,320 | 161 | - | | |
| 10 | Shenzhen Bay Super City - | Shenzhen (CN) | 680 | 2,231 | - | - | | |
| | Xtemendous Tower 1 | | | | | | | |
| 10 | Shizimen CBD Tower | Zhuhai (CN) | 680 | 2,231 | - | - | | multiple |
| 12 | Tianfu Center | Chengdu (CN) | 677 | 2,221 | 157 | 2025 | | office |
| 13 | Baoneng Financial Center | Urumqi (CN) | 668 | 2,192 | - | - | | |
| 13 | Shimao Shenzhen-Hong Kong International Centre | Shenzhen (CN) | 668 | 2,192 | | 2024 | | hotel / office |
| 15 | Caiwuwei Financial Center | Shenzhen (CN) | 666 | 2,185 | - | - | | |
| 15 | Hanzheng Jie Project Tower 1 | Wuhan (CN) | 666 | 2,185 | - | - | | |
| 17 | | | | | | | | |
| | Wuhan CTF Finance Center | Wuhan (CN) | 648 | 2,126 | 121 | 2022 | composite | office |
| 18 | Wuhan CTF Finance Center Financial Street Concord City Tower | Wuhan (CN) Chongqing (CN) | 648 639 | 2,126 2,096 | 121 | 2022 | composite | office |
| 18 19 | Wuhan CTF Finance Center Financial Street Concord City Tower Wuhan Greenland Center | Wuhan (CN) Chongqing (CN) Wuhan (CN) | 648 639 636 | 2,126 2,096 2,087 | 121 - 126 | - | composite composite | office hotel / residential / office |
| 18 19 20 | Wuhan CTF Finance Center Financial Street Concord City Tower Wuhan Greenland Center Shanghai Tower | Wuhan (CN) Chongqing (CN) Wuhan (CN) Shanghai (CN) | 648 639 636 632 | 2,126 2,096 2,087 2,073 | 121 - 126 128 | 2022 - - 2015 | composite composite composite | office hotel / residential / office hotel / office |
| 18 19 20 21 | Wuhan CTF Finance Center Financial Street Concord City Tower Wuhan Greenland Center Shanghai Tower Changchun World Trade Center | Wuhan (CN) Chongqing (CN) Wuhan (CN) Shanghai (CN) Changchun (CN) | 648 639 636 632 631 | 2,126 2,096 2,087 2,073 2,070 | 121 - 126 128 126 | 2022 - 2015 - | composite composite composite | office hotel / residential / office hotel / office serviced apartments / hotel / office |
| 18 19 20 21 22 | Wuhan CTF Finance Center Financial Street Concord City Tower Wuhan Greenland Center Shanghai Tower Changchun World Trade Center Harmony 888 Tower 1 | Wuhan (CN) Chongqing (CN) Wuhan (CN) Shanghai (CN) Changchun (CN) Xiamen (CN) | 648 639 636 632 631 620 | 2,126 2,096 2,087 2,073 2,070 2,034 | 121 - 126 128 126 | 2022 - 2015 - | composite composite composite | office hotel / residential / office hotel / office serviced apartments / hotel / office |

Planning to Construct over 1km

Large cities continuously construct more skyscrapers



Source: CTBUH, 2019

"What are the height determinants of Chinese skyscrapers and to what extent do these height determinant factors affect Chinese skyscraper heights Pattern?"



Sub-questions

- How does the height pattern of skyscrapers above 200m vary across China?
- What is the factor that causes the specific height pattern across the country?

• To what extent do each height determinant factors affect the height pattern of skyscrapers in China?

Research Scope



Study focuses on:

- China, Excluding Hong Kong and Macau
 - Due to different Legal structure

Skyscrapers over 200m

- Skyscraper over 200m could have more effect on the location in terms of city image, population accommodate Capacity
- Higher buildings require more governmental interventions and negotiations, which may includes more aspects that affected the decision
- The study focuses on height

Motivation

Provide empirical evidence that explains the mechanism of skyscraper development in China, where these results could be used as a base to make decisions on future development, and if possible provide a base for urban development policies

METHODOLOGY

Research process

Phase 1: Introduction



Regression analysis

Regression analysis is a method that is used to understand the relationship between

a **dependent variable** (Outcome variable) and

multiple independent variable (Predictor Variable)

Outcome = Model + error

Linear regression model uses databases from the previous event to predict future events

Type of Heights: Dependent variables



Architectural Height:

- → Overall height of skyscraper Including Vanity Height
- → Express total height of skyscraper

Occupied Height:

- → Height that could accommodate function and people
- → Show that height that is design for occupied

Vanity Height:

- → Height that could not accommodate function
- → Could use to spot possible competitions between building

Height Determinant factors



City Level Determinant



Building Level Determinant

Height Determinant factors

- → Factors that are stated in previous research that have effect on skyscraper height
 - → Determinant factors that have poven to have effect on skyscraper development
 - → Factors that in theory have connection to skyscraper height and or development
- → Factors that are added, due to predictions, according to observation and theories

City Level Determinant

→ These are specific factors of each city

- → These are factors that affect the urbans space as a whole, including :
 - Demographic changes
 - City Economic condition
 - City development directions

Urban Development aspects



(Yaping & Min, 2009; Lin et al., 2016)

City Population

City Urbanization rate

City Urban Population

City Urbanization rate Growth

Economical Aspect

→ Research shows that Skyscraper development follows the economic cycles

(Barr, 2018)

→ Height of **record breaking skyscrapers** follows economical cycle

(Rovelli, 2018)

→ Increase in percentage of **tertiary industry** increase **city urbanization rate**

(Zeng, Xu & Chen, 2018)

→ Tertiary industry, which includes service and technological sector triggers skyscraper development

(Zeng, Xu, 2018)

City GDP, City GDP Growth

City percentage of Tertiary industry & Growth

Building level determinant



→ These are specific factors that affect each building

- → These factors are based on decisions made for each building, including :
 - Choice of material and function
 - Personal perspective of the designer
 - Building design

Building Function & Material



→ Function of a building affects the average floor height, where office building requires more height per floor compares to residential

Building function (Zeng, Xu & Chen, 2018) Categorical Variable

| <u>Function</u> | Average height per floor |
|---------------------|--------------------------|
| Residential | 3.72 m/ floor |
| Office | 4.71 m/floor |
| Hotel | 4.38 m/floor |
| Office/ Hotel | 4.62 m/floor |
| Residential/ office | 4.55 m/ floor |
| Residential/ hotel | 4.22 m/floor |
| Mixed use | 4.56 m/floor |

Building Function & Material



- \rightarrow Function of a building affects the average floor height, where office building requires more height per floor compares to residential
 - Building function (Zeng, Xu & Chen, 2018) Categorical Variable







Wikipedia, 2019



- Material for construction connected \rightarrow to the load it could withstand, therefore it could have effect on skyscraper height
 - **Building Material Categorical Variable**

(Moon, 2018)

Competition & Social status



Source: Hayett Hotel, 2019

Source: Lin, 2018

Source: CTBUH, 2019

 Many researchers have spotted competition between skyscraper to be the tallest
Vanity Height

Design aspects



→ As observed, each building shape has different occupy possibility, which could affect the efficiency and height of the building



Nationality of Construction Coalition







CTBUH, 2019

→ Famous Architect design special buildings, this variable mainly aims to test if they have effect on skyscraper height

Other factors



→ Regulation

- Specific city regulation on height & development
- → land quality
 - Some areas are suitable for construction of taller buildings than others
- → Building technology
 - The improve in technology each year
- → Construction From Previous year
 - City Fixed effect and year fixed effect

→ Material cost

• Data available only for the whole country, so its the same for all cases across China





FINDING

How does the height pattern of skyscrapers above

200m vary across China?



• Look into location of skyscraper and height distribution of skyscrapers in China

 Provide analysis on function, material, construction years and height ranges





Amount of skyscrapers constructed each Year



Height distribution Each Year



Completed

Record Breaking sksycrapers



Regarding Vanity Height


Regarding Vanity Height



Regarding Vanity Height



Vanity height of record breaking building



Vanity height is the difference between architectural height and occupied height. According to the graph, the gap between the two lines shows the amount of vanity height

Distribution of building Material and Function Each Year







Finding for first question

- There are **more skyscraper developments around the coast** compared to cities in the middle part and western part of China
- There is an **un-even distribution of skyscraper** and height in China
- Cities like Shanghai and Shenzhen contain a wide range of skyscraper height
- Amount of skyscraper constructed increases each year, and the range of skyscraper height increase each year
- Vanity height decreases after year 2010, also vanity height in general decrease as year increase

What is the factor that causes the specific height pattern

across the country?



 Perform regression analysis and spot variables that have significant effect on each Dependent variables

 Compare the Regression models and analyse the different between them

The model consiste of

/.....

Architectural Height

 $\textbf{ArchH}_{i} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \, \textbf{VH}_{i} + \beta_2 \, \textbf{GDP}_{i} + \beta_3 \, \textbf{F}_{i} + \beta_4 \, \textbf{M}_{i} + \beta_4 \, \textbf{Tot}_{i} + \textbf{\lambda}_L + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$

Occupied Height

 $\textbf{OccH}_{i} = \beta_{0} + \beta_{1} \textbf{ GDP}_{i} + \beta_{2} \textbf{ F}_{i} + \beta_{3} \textbf{ M}_{i} + \beta_{4} \textbf{ TOt}_{i} + \textbf{\lambda}_{L} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_{i}$

Vanity Height

 $VanH_{i} = \beta_{0} + \beta_{1} F_{i} + \beta_{1} M_{i} + \beta_{5} Tot_{i} + \epsilon_{i}$

Architectural Height

 $\textbf{ArchHi} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \textbf{VHi} + \beta_2 \textbf{GDPi} + \beta_3 \textbf{Fi} + \beta_4 \textbf{Mi} + \beta_4 \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\lambda}_L + \textbf{\epsilon}_i$

Occupied Height

 $\textbf{OccHi} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \, \textbf{GDPi} + \beta_2 \, \textbf{Fi} + \beta_3 \, \textbf{Mi} + \beta_4 \, \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\lambda}_L + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$

Vanity Height

 $\textbf{VanHi} = \textbf{\beta}_0 + \textbf{\beta}_1 \textbf{Fi} + \textbf{\beta}_1 \textbf{Mi} + \textbf{\beta}_5 \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\epsilon}_i$



Both model contains city GDP, this can show that skyscraper development is highly correlated to City Economic situation

Architectural Height

 $\textbf{ArchHi} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \textbf{VHi} + \beta_2 \textbf{GDPi} + \beta_3 \textbf{Fi} + \beta_4 \textbf{Mi} + \beta_4 \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\lambda}_L + \textbf{\epsilon}_i$





Function and Material

Occupied Height

 $\textbf{OccH}_{i} = \beta_{0} + \beta_{1} \textbf{GDP}_{i} + \beta_{2} \textbf{F}_{i} + \beta_{3} \textbf{M}_{i} + \beta_{4} \textbf{TOt}_{i} + \textbf{\lambda}_{L} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_{i}$

Vanity Height

 $\textbf{VanHi} = \textbf{\beta}_0 + \textbf{\beta}_1 \textbf{Fi} + \textbf{\beta}_1 \textbf{Mi} + \textbf{\beta}_5 \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\epsilon}_i$

Architectural Height

ArchHi =
$$\beta_0 + \beta_1$$
VHi + β_2 GDPi + β_3 Fi + β_4 Mi + β_4 Tot + λ_L + ϵ_i

$$\textbf{OccHi} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \, \textbf{GDPi} + \beta_2 \, \textbf{Fi} + \beta_3 \, \textbf{Mi} + \beta_4 \, \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\lambda}_L + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$$

Vanity Height

 $\textbf{VanHi} = \textbf{\beta}_0 + \textbf{\beta}_1 \, \textbf{Fi} + \textbf{\beta}_1 \, \textbf{Mi} + \textbf{\beta}_5 \, \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\epsilon}_i$





Function and Material



Type of building Top Finishing

According to the definition of height, Architectural Height equals to occupied height plus vanity Height

Architectural Height

, City GDP of the Year

ArchHi = $\beta_0 + \beta_1 VH_i + \beta_2 GDP_i + \beta_3 F_i + \beta_4 M_i + \beta_4 Tot_i + \lambda_L + \varepsilon_i$

Function and Material



Type of building Top Finishing

$$\mathbf{OccHi} = \mathbf{\beta}_0 + \mathbf{\beta}_1 \, \mathbf{GDPi} + \mathbf{\beta}_2 \, \mathbf{Fi} + \mathbf{\beta}_3 \, \mathbf{Mi} + \mathbf{\beta}_4 \, \mathbf{Toti} + \mathbf{\lambda}_L + \mathbf{\epsilon}_i$$

Vanity Height

 $\textbf{VanHi} = \textbf{\beta}_0 + \textbf{\beta}_1 \textbf{Fi} + \textbf{\beta}_1 \textbf{Mi} + \textbf{\beta}_5 \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\epsilon}_i$

Architectural Height

ArchHi = $\beta_0 + \beta_1 VH_i + \beta_2 GDP_i + \beta_3 F_i + \beta_4 M_i + \beta_4 Tot + \lambda_L + \varepsilon_i$

Occupied Height

 $\textbf{OccHi} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \, \textbf{GDPi} + \beta_2 \, \textbf{Fi} + \beta_3 \, \textbf{Mi} + \beta_4 \, \textbf{Toti} + \textbf{\lambda}_L + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$

Vanity Height

$$\textbf{VanHi} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \textbf{Fi} + \beta_1 \textbf{Mi} + \beta_5 \textbf{Tot} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_i$$



Function and Material



Type of building Top Finishing

Finding for Second question

- Most City Level factors dont have significant relationship with Architectural height and occupied height, which means that they don't have much influence on skyscraper height
- More Building level factors are significant on height compare to city level, including Function, Material and design of the skyscraper
- Vanity Height has significant relationship with architectural height, which means that it does provide increase in height
- Location & Time fixed effect doesn't have large effect on skyscraper height





To what extent do these factors affect height pattern?



- Look into the Coefficient of each model and compare them between models
- Understand each coefficient and provide defenitions to it
- They will be explained in categories of height related variables

Height related variables

 $\textbf{ArchH}_{i} = \beta_{0} + \beta_{1} \textbf{VH}_{i} + \beta_{2} \textbf{GDP}_{i} + \beta_{3} \textbf{F}_{i} + \beta_{4} \textbf{M}_{i} + \beta_{4} \textbf{Tot}_{i} + \textbf{\lambda}_{L} + \textbf{\epsilon}_{i}$

 $\textbf{OccH}_{i} = \beta_{0} + \beta_{1} \textbf{GDP}_{i} + \beta_{2} \textbf{F}_{i} + \beta_{3} \textbf{M}_{i} + \beta_{4} \textbf{TOt}_{i} + \textbf{\lambda}_{L} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_{i}$



City GDP of the Year

Building Level Determinant





Function and Material

Type of building Top Finishing

City Economical aspects - Height



City GDP to Height

City GDP Coefficient B=0.001 GDP Unit: 100 Million

- Every increase in 100 Billion RMB in GDP, height of buildings will in general increase 1m
- The effect of City GDP on Architectural height and Occupied height have similar slope
- As GDP increase Height also increase

City Economical aspects - Height



City GDP Growth

City Economical aspects - Height



City GDP Growth

Function and Material



Mixed Use > Office > Residential > Hotel

Composite > Concrete > Steel

Building Finshing design





Architectural height Type 1< 2< 6<4< 5<3

Occupied height Type 2 < 1< 4<5<6 < 3

Vanity Height Type 1< 6 < 3 < 4 < 5 < 2

Type 3 have the most architectural height in general
Type 1 have the least vanity Height in general

Type 2 have the most vanity height but it has the least architectural and occupied height

Building Finshing design



Architectural height Type 1< 2< 6<4< 5<3

Occupied height Type 2 < 1< 4<5<6 < 3

Vanity Height Type 1< 6 < 3 < 4 < 5 < 2

- There are more type 1 and type 5 building constructed after year 2010
- The amount of type 2 building constructed remains stable

Other Finding



City GDP and Building Height

- There are some cities with low GDP growth rate, but also contain buildings over 400m
- But these building does not exceed 500m

Other Finding



Shenyang

Tallest building 311m Complete in 2014 Total 11 building 200+

Dalian Tallest building 383 m Complete in 2016 Total 9 building 200+

Yantai Tallest building 323 m Complete in 2017 Total 2 building 200+

Changsha Tallest building 452 m Complete in 2018 Total 6 building 200+

Wenzhou Tallest building 322 m Complete in 2011 Total 2 building 200+

Nanning Tallest building 381 m Complete in 2018

Complete in 2018 Total 2 building 200+

City GDP and Building Height

- There are some cities with low GDP growth rate, but also contain buildings over 400m
- But these building does not exceed 500m
- These cities does not located in the clusters

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

Conclusion

- Regarding height determinant factor
 - The factors that affected skyscraper height are more the building level factors including building function, material and design
 - But in general Skyscraper development have correlation with economic situation of the city regarding to skyscraper height

Conclusion

- The result suggested that **building in China is constructed according to** economic reasons rather than competition due to following reasons
 - Building architectural height have significant relationship with city GDP
 - Type one building design in general contains more occupied height and less vanity height, it is also the typology most constructed after year 2013
 - There are more skyscraper located around 200m, and only small amount of building is over 400m

Conclusion

- Regarding to Height distribution
 - There are uneven skyscraper distribution, and each city contains wide range of building height. In city with limited land for example Hong kong currently develop building over 400m, but not the ones around 200m
 - There is also an increase in city size in the major cities including Beijing, Shanghai and shenzhen, and it took more than 1 hr to move from the out-skirt of the city to city center, which is considered a long time. This shows that lands are not used efficiently
 - Suggested to look into the efficient building height and set lower height limit accordingly

Possible Further research

- Due the difference in culture and other aspect, development pattern may vary, Thus, the study on skyscraper height could also be done in other countries to see if they yield similar results
- The variable used in the research does not explain vanity height well, so more research could be done on determinants of vanity height
- The correlation tables shows relationship between the variables and number of skyscraper in a city, so a study could be done on the connection between amount of skyscraper constructed and height

Question?





Distribution of 200m plus skyscraper in Shanghai



Distribution of All skyscraper in Shanghai



Distribution of skyscraper Below 100m in Shanghai




| | - | | | | | | | | |
|-----|---|---|----------------|--------------------|-----|----|------|----------|-------------|
| 226 | | Longguang Royal Lake Sunshine 16 | Nanning (CN) | 68.3 | 224 | 21 | 2018 | | residential |
| 226 | | Longguang Royal Lake Sunshine 17 | Nanning (CN) | 68.3 | 224 | 21 | 2018 | | residential |
| 226 | | Longguang Royal Lake Sunshine 19 | Nanning (CN) | 68.3 | 224 | 21 | 2018 | | residential |
| 226 | | Longguang Royal Lake Sunshine 20 | Nanning (CN) | 68.3 | 224 | 21 | 2018 | | residential |
| 230 | | Shenzhen Fourth People's Hospital IMC Ward | Shenzhen (CN) | 64.8 | 213 | 15 | 2017 | | hospital |
| 231 | | Rong and Banyan Mountain #5B | Nanning (CN) | 61.3 | 201 | 19 | 2017 | concrete | residential |
| 232 | | Nanxun #19 | Liuzhou (CN) | 60 | 197 | 18 | 2019 | concrete | residential |
| 233 | | Hangzhou Gateway | Hangzhou (CN) | 59. <mark>9</mark> | 197 | 16 | 2017 | concrete | office |
| 234 | | Huashang International #13 | Yulin (CN) | 58.7 | 193 | 19 | 2018 | | residential |
| 234 | | Huashang International #16 | Yulin (CN) | 58.7 | 193 | 19 | 2018 | | residential |
| 236 | | Rong and Banyan Mountain #1A | Nanning (CN) | 58.4 | 192 | 18 | 2017 | concrete | residential |
| 236 | | Rong and Banyan Mountain #2A | Nanning (CN) | 58.4 | 192 | 18 | 2017 | concrete | residential |
| 236 | | Rong and Banyan Mountain #3A | Nanning (CN) | 58.4 | 192 | 18 | 2017 | concrete | residential |
| 239 | | Beihai First City 1# | Beihai (CN) | 57.3 | 188 | 18 | 2017 | | residential |
| 240 | | Huashang International #11 | Yulin (CN) | 57.1 | 187 | 18 | 2018 | | residential |
| 240 | | Huashang International #12 | Yulin (CN) | 57.1 | 187 | 18 | 2018 | | residential |
| 240 | | Huashang International #17 | Yulin (CN) | 57.1 | 187 | 18 | 2018 | | residential |
| 243 | | Nanxun #1 | Liuzhou (CN) | 56 | 184 | 18 | 2018 | concrete | residential |
| 243 | | Nanxun #18 | Liuzhou (CN) | 56 | 184 | 18 | 2019 | concrete | residential |
| 243 | | Nanxun #2 | Liuzhou (CN) | 56 | 184 | 18 | 2018 | concrete | residential |
| 246 | | Huangshan Mountain Village 8 | Huangshan (CN) | 51 | 167 | 12 | 2017 | concrete | residential |
| 247 | | Hong Kong Housing Authority Headquarters | Hong Kong (CN) | 50.9 | 167 | 11 | - | | office |
| 248 | | Longguang Royal Lake Sunshine 15 | Nanning (CN) | 47.6 | 156 | 14 | 2018 | | residential |
| 248 | | Longguang Royal Lake Sunshine 18 | Nanning (CN) | 47.6 | 156 | 14 | 2018 | | residential |
| 250 | | Huangshan Mountain Village 4 | Huangshan (CN) | 45 | 148 | 12 | 2017 | concrete | residential |

Regression Analysis for Year Fixed Effect

| 8 | Architectural height | | Occupied | d height | Vanity Height | |
|----------------------|----------------------|------|----------|----------|-----------------------|------|
| 0 | В | Sig. | В | Sig. | В | Sig. |
| (Constant) | 240.017 | .000 | 210.226 | .000 | 29.791 | .000 |
| C om plete d 2011 | 8.742 | .578 | 20.365 | .150 | -11. <mark>618</mark> | .037 |
| C om plete d 2012 | .893 | .956 | 7.118 | .623 | -6.225 | .277 |
| C om plete d 2013 | 2.545 | .855 | 16.487 | .189 | -13.941 | .005 |
| C om plete d 2014 | -7.131 | .572 | 8.469 | .455 | -15.847 | .000 |
| C om plete d 2015 | 8.865 | .482 | 21.144 | .062 | -12.279 | .006 |
| C om plete d 2016 | -2.318 | .849 | 15.615 | .153 | -16.851 | .000 |
| C om plete d 2017 | 5.825 | .626 | 22.321 | .038 | -16.497 | .000 |
| C om plete d 2018 | 15.691 | .202 | 33.980 | .002 | -18.414 | .000 |

Regression Analysis for Location Fixed Effect

| | | | Coefficients | ^a | 1 | |
|-------|-----------------------------|------------------|--------------|--------------------------------|---------|-------|
| | | Unstandardized C | oefficients | Stan dardized C oefficients | t | Sig. |
| Model | | В | Std. Error | Beta | | |
| 1 | (Constant) | 2.361 | .010 | 2 | 238.500 | 0.000 |
| | City cluster pearl delta | .038 | .012 | .199 | 3.22.4 | .001 |
| | City cluster yangze | .020 | .012 | .103 | 1.653 | .099 |
| | City cluster beijing | .027 | .015 | .093 | 1.854 | .064 |
| | other | .007 | .011 | .044 | .647 | .518 |

a. Dependent Variable: logarchheight

