How to Preserve Historic Districts in Harbin
A Study in Transplanting European Experiences

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN ENGINEERING AND POLICY ANALYSIS

By
Xiaoxiao Liu
4123506
July 2012, Delft

Graduation Committee:
Martin de Jong Chairman, POLG section, TUD
Wim Ravesteijn 1st supervisor, TDSD section, TUD
Jianing Mi 2nd supervisor, Public Policy, HIT

Engineering and Policy Analysis
Faculty of Technology, Policy and Management
Delft University of Technology
Acknowledgement

This graduation report is for the master study of Engineering and Policy Analysis at Delft University of Technology, the Netherlands. After six months’ working, this thesis is delivered in the beginning of August as the ending of my study.

Before presenting the research, I would like to express my appreciation to those who helped me and encouraged me to work hard.

Firstly, I would like to thank Martin de Jong, who acted as both my chairman and daily supervisor. He devoted a lot of time to my thesis to guide me both theoretically and practically. Every time we met, he gave me explicit comments which could solve my questions in the research and he offered a possible direction for further research. Our regular meeting was once a week and despite his business trips, he could still provide clear comments over email. His patience and professional guidance ensured the consistency and the quality of this research.

Next, I would like to thank Wim Ravesteijn who acted as my second supervisor. He is so nice and each time when I asked him for help, he could highly enthusiastically help me to deep my question and find the answer. Especially when I felt frustrated in my work, his humor and optimistic attitude could encourage me a lot and increase my efficiency in the output of the research.

Furthermore, I am thankful to Prof. Mi Jianing, my external supervisor from Harbin Institute of Technology. Instead of a technical view, he provided me a lot of possibilities to further and deep the meaning of my research. He helped me to broaden my outlook to find the merits and value of historic preservation in the modern city’s development from which I found confidence to complete this research.

And last but not least, I would like to express my deep love to my parents, my grandfather and my friends. It is because of your everlasting support and faith, I could accomplish my overseas study in this beautiful country. This is a wonderful experience in my life and I will cherish it forever.

I will always pursue my dream as fighting the battle on my knees. And I love you all.

Xiaoxiao Liu
July.2012
Delft, NL
Executive summary

Historic preservation is always a hot topic in contemporary city development. The heritage witnessed how human life evolved and how the city developed. The high historical value assembles the city’s spirit and it brings to the human a sense of belonging. However, with urbanization and modernization, the heritages are easily under the risks of being damaged. Since 1980s, China started to pay attention on heritage preservation. The historic buildings, sites and historic cities are continuously added into the preservation objectives.

Harbin city is a Chinese city with influences of western culture in its architecture due to its history. The government took actions to preserve these heritages since late 1980s. But facing countless historic remaining, the process of historic preservation planning has many problems which lead to a dissatisfaction of Harbin city. So far, there are 22 legally listed historic cultural districts. Based on their functions, they are divided into 5 types. The three districts having the most problems regarding preservation are covered in this research while the other two with better conditions are left for further study. The main difficulties in historic preservation are stated to provide sufficient knowledge on what is happening in Harbin, namely the decay of historic cultural value, the extensive influence of the government and commercial developers over other actors, and the lack of funding on preservation projects. In order to improve the historic preservation planning system for Harbin, the research deeps into the current situation of Harbin and analyzes two European cases in order to draw lessons.

Three main parts in the body of the analysis are inspiration phase, learning phase and the transplantation phase. The inspiration phase contains the current situation and the case introductions, the learning phase contains the case analysis and the transplantation phase is focusing on transferring the merits from cases to Harbin. Five aspects are found to be essential in historic preservation. These are guidance of operation, public participation, supervision in process, coordination with other organizations and money source. The activities of these aspects are discussed in the case studies. And in order to improve the historic preservation planning system in Harbin, together with the local situation and resources, this research recommends five mechanisms.

According to Richard Rose’s theories on the alternatives of treating lessons learning, they are adapted to increase the suitability and effectiveness:

The research suggests that the experts should come up with a clear and detailed operating guidance for the operators in real work. The public’s involvement and other organizations should be encouraged and stimulated to coordinate in the preserving process. The funding problem can be solved by getting support from central government and the society including rich groups and donations. The mass media should monitor the process in order to ensure the fairness of the process.
# Table of content

Acknowledgement ........................................................................................................... i  
Executive summary ......................................................................................................... ii  
Table of content .............................................................................................................. iii  
List of Tables .................................................................................................................. v  
List of Figures ................................................................................................................ vi  
Chapter 1 Introduction of research ................................................................................ 1  
  1.1 Background ............................................................................................................... 1  
    1.1.1 The value of historic preservation in city development ........................................ 1  
    1.1.2 The evolvement of historic preservation ............................................................ 1  
  1.2 Problem Delineation ................................................................................................. 4  
  1.3 Objective of Research ............................................................................................. 5  
  1.4 Research Questions ................................................................................................ 6  
  1.5 Research Method and Framework .......................................................................... 6  
    1.5.1 Research Method ............................................................................................... 6  
    1.5.2 Research Framework ....................................................................................... 7  
Chapter 2 Lesson-drawing in historic preservation planning ........................................... 9  
  2.1 Preservation in historic districts .............................................................................. 9  
    2.1.1 Basic concepts of historic preservation ............................................................ 9  
    2.1.2 Why preserve historic districts ....................................................................... 9  
  2.2 Lesson-drawing approach to preserve historic districts ......................................... 11  
    2.2.1 Basic concepts of lesson-drawing approach ...................................................... 11  
    2.2.2 Possibility of lesson learning in urban planning domain ................................... 11  
  2.3 Guidance of lesson-drawing process .................................................................... 12  
    2.3.1 Three phases of lesson drawing process ......................................................... 12  
    2.3.2 Ten steps of lesson-drawing process .............................................................. 14  
    2.3.3 Framework of model design .......................................................................... 15  
  2.4 Comparability and applicability criteria ............................................................... 17  
    2.4.1 Comparability criteria to select cases ............................................................... 17  
    2.4.2 Applicability variables to design exporting model .......................................... 20  
  2.5 Conclusion of chapter 2 ......................................................................................... 20  
Chapter 3 Status quo of historic districts preservation in Harbin .................................... 22  
  3.1 Culture background of Harbin .............................................................................. 22  
  3.2 Planning legislation of historic districts preservation ........................................... 22  
  3.3 Management difficulties of preservation projects ................................................ 24  
    3.3.1 Unbalance in stakeholder relationships ........................................................... 24  
    3.3.2 Weak public involvement in regular ways of working ................................... 26  
    3.3.3 Standing financial gaps in construction projects .............................................. 26  
  3.4 Categorization of historic districts of Harbin ....................................................... 27  
    3.4.1 Categories and environment analysis ............................................................. 27  
    3.4.2 Basic condition of each historic district type ............................................... 28  
  3.5 Some characters of the city compared with Europe ................................................. 35  
  3.6 Conclusion of chapter 3 ......................................................................................... 35
Chapter 4 European lesson analysis

4.1 Case 1 -- Street Preservation Campaign, England

4.1.1 Introduction of the case

4.1.2 Operational instruments

4.1.3 Generic lessons from Case 1

4.2 Case 2 -- Jordaan Residential Area, Amsterdam

4.2.1 Introduction of the case

4.2.2 Operational instruments

4.2.3 Generic lessons from case 2

4.3 Conclusion of chapter 4

Chapter 5 Implementation analysis of lessons and model design

5.1 Comparability analysis and model design 1

5.1.1 Comparability of case 1 and Harbin context

5.1.2 Generic model drawn from case 1

5.1.3 Organizational mechanisms generated from case 1

5.1.4 Implementation assessment

5.2 Comparability analysis and model design 2

5.2.1 Comparability of case 2 and Harbin context

5.2.2 Generic model drawn from case 2

5.2.3 Organizational mechanisms generated from case 2

5.2.4 Implementation assessment

5.3 Conclusion of chapter 5

Chapter 6 Recommendation and a practical test

6.1 Recommendation

6.1.1 Recommendation on operational instruments

6.1.2 Recommendation on policy instruments

6.2 A practical test on commercial background district in Harbin

6.2.1 Introduction of the area

6.2.2 Historic cultural characteristics

6.2.3 Current preservations and problems

6.2.4 Recognition of the inputs

6.2.5 Recommended policy transplantation

6.2.6 Difficulties and possible risks

6.3 Limitations of the research

Chapter 7 Conclusion and reflection

7.1 Conclusion of the research

7.2 Research contribution

7.3 Potential further research

Reference

Appendix

Appendix 1

Appendix 2
List of Tables

Table 1-1 The key words of historic preservation development ......................................... 2
Table 2-1 Lesson-drawing structure of the research 1 ............................................................. 13
Table 2-2 Lesson-drawing structure of the research 2 .......................................................... 15
Table 2-3 Research content of institutional transplantation ................................................... 16
Table 2-4 Case selection criteria summary ........................................................................... 19
Table 2-5 Model design framework generated from the cases .............................................. 20
Table 3-1 Categorization, problem analysis of historic districts in Harbin ............................... 27
Table 3-2 Environmental characters and cultural value measurement of historic districts in Harbin ........................................................................................................... 28
Table 3-3 The characters, environment sense and illustrations of Russian style residential districts .............................................................................................................. 33
Table 3-4 The characters, environment sense and illustrations of Commercial background districts ........................................................................................................... 30
Table 3-5 The characters, environment sense and illustrations of Exotic and Recreation districts .............................................................................................................. 31
Table 3-6 The characters, environment sense and illustrations of Religious and Memorial districts .............................................................................................................. 33
Table 3-7 The characters, environment sense and illustrations of Educational and Administrative districts ................................................................................................. 34
Table 4-1 Planning instruments of English Street Preservation ............................................ 40
Table 5-1 Comparability of case 1 and Harbin context .......................................................... 50
Table 5-2 Applicability analysis of research activities into Harbin context ................................ 53
Table 5-3 Implementation assessment of case 1 into Harbin context ...................................... 57
Table 5-4 Comparability of case 2 and Harbin context .......................................................... 60
Table 5-5 Applicability analysis of case 2 into Harbin context .............................................. 63
Table 5-6 Implementation assessment of case 2 into Harbin context ...................................... 66
Table 6-1 The actor analysis for Daowai district preservation project .................................... 62
Table 7-1 Current issues list in Harbin .................................................................................. 81
### List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>The framework of the thesis</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>The causal loop of historic preservation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Conceptual model for case study</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>The regions of Streets Protection</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>The site view of Jordaan district</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>The views of Jordaan district</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>The pictures of lost traditions</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>Conceptual model from case 1</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Conceptual model from case 2</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10</td>
<td>Land use plan of Daowai historic district</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11</td>
<td>Summary of thesis framework</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1 Introduction of research

1.1 Background

1.1.1 The value of historic preservation in city development

The city heritage originates from past times and endows the city with spirit and historical value worthy to be pursued. Some stories and histories come down through languages, written words, while others can be seen more powerfully in living patterns and physical building segments on the streets. Along with time, these historical areas turn old and many of them are demolished or regarded as non-valuable and therefore replaced by modern artificialness (Lee, 1996). However, old buildings and are not necessarily out of fashion or even out of function. In the contrary, claimed by English Heritage organizations, heritage or historic remaining can generate much attraction and stimulate potential economic and social regeneration for a city (English Heritage, 2005). Many countries have realized the importance of historic preservation in protecting city cultural values and enlarging their brilliance in city development. “Cities have to build on their past to prepare for the future” (Hall, 2002).

Re-using historical heritage is an environmental friendly behavior to our society. Discovered by National Trust for Historic Preservation (US) study, compared to reusing the old buildings, it can take new buildings 10 to 80 years to recover the energy consumed from and climate changing impact from construction process. When the whole society is making efforts to realize sustainable development, the energy saving generated from historic districts can dedicate a lot on construction projects. The architect, Carl Elefante, once argued that “The greenest building is one that is already built” and it raised a mass of discussion on this topic.

1.1.2 The evolvement of historic preservation

The movement of historical preservation can be seen from a world level. In early of 20th century, researchers and experts started appealing to protect historic buildings and streets with enacting a series of regulations and laws, including “Venice Charter”, “Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage”, “Nairobi Declaration”, “Charter of Machu Picchu”, “Florence Charter”, “Washington Charter”, all as the institutionalization, legislation and standardization of historical and environmental preservation. The focus of protection was switched from individual architecture to areas while the preservation attitude switched from “static” to “dynamic” perspective. In the 21st century, the historical preservation progressed from simply regulatory strategy to functional revival and enhancement. The heterogeneity of participants increased from only architects and historians to urban planners, governments, developers, environmental organizations and habitants. The dynamic

---

1 Preservation Green Lab’s new study shows from National Trust for Historic Preservation official website: http://www.preservationnation.org/forum/newsroom/usgbc-webinar-on-the-greenest.html
2 http://www.thegreenestbuilding.org/, Carl Elefante, the principal of Quinn Evans Architects: http://www.quinnevans.com/blog
theories can be listed as Holistic Conservation, Step by Step, Careful Renewal, Small and Smart Growth (Li M., 2009).

Europe has experienced in heritage preservation work, and it can be seen to set a good example for other continents. Europe has a long history and spectacular culture (Kristin & Suizzo, 2006), and European traditional cities are filled with historical values therefore they attempt to keep effective cultural continuity (Greffe, 2001). But Europe has not always been very clear with respect to heritage preservation and suffered from a series of mistakes and muddles in treating historical heritages. In the 18th century, the Industrial Revolution encouraged everybody to endeavor in manufacturing, producing, efficiency or capitalization. During this period, people were indifferent about historical value or environment quality. In the 19th century, facing ruined living environment, European citizens decided to make a change through destroying old areas and renovating or constructing new buildings. After World War II, another tide of rebuilding occurred. Until then, the world had been subject to a big city renewal and history continuity was destroyed.

Fortunately, European people realized the value of protecting the heritages specifically after Second World War. It was noticed that culture and history of the world were disappearing and the continuity of historical value was principal. Revival movements mainly initiated by architects from many countries were triggered. From that period, a preserving attitude on historical heritages was formed.

In general, the development of European movement of historical preservation can be extracted in key words as Table 1-1 (Doratli, Hoskara, & Fasli, 2004; Meur, 2008):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key words on early stage Before 80s</th>
<th>Key word on middle stage 80s-90s</th>
<th>Key word on current stage 90s-21st century</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Restoration 40s</td>
<td>Recycling</td>
<td>Sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preservation 60s</td>
<td>Adaptive-reuse</td>
<td>Regeneration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservation 70s</td>
<td>Revitalization</td>
<td>Transforming</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Table 1-1 The key words of historic preservation development |

Historic value preserving thoughts can be traced back to half a century ago when French people claimed using restoration to reverse decay and British people conserved on old buildings according to their original situation. But basic focus on formalization of single building cannot stimulate the real value of heritage. Gradually, recycling systems of buildings and building groups preservation became a hot topic in city development. Revitalization of neighborhood and building groups could return livable environment for city dwellers3 (Gale, 2002). Later, this concept was updated with urban conservation and avoided demolishment of existing areas and relocation of

---

3 Initially, revitalization was raised in 1950s, 20th century which was generally known as urban renewal. Under the influence of government it replaced a large amount of old areas especially central cities. It brought low income families into decaying areas in central cities trying to lower population dense in downtown. Due to the social disruption of forced household relocation, it halted this movement.
habitants. Meanwhile, the approach of adaptive-reuse worked well on how to treat historic buildings and districts until nowadays. After 2000, increasingly more experts started working on the relation and collaboration of sustainability and historic preservation. From the whole process, the focus of historic preservation developed from single building towards building groups, from buildings to the environment of neighborhoods.

In the new century, countries started to explore the possibilities and implementations of an integrated context both involving historic preservation and economic development. Leadership Conference on Conservancy and Development 1999 declared that historic preservation was a strategy consisting with the principles of 21st century economic development of the world which contained globalization, localization, diversity, sustainability and responsibility (Rypkema, 1999).

Except for the theory improvement, the practical achievement occurred in some pioneer countries like UK, the Netherlands, Italy, Spain, USA, and Singapore. Globally, conservation-related seminars are held every year. International Architecture Conservation Conference 2012 to be held in Dubai will discuss on the strategies on how to conserve on historic districts and buildings, protect and develop heritages in a sustainable manner (3rd International Architectural Conservation, 2012). English Heritage organization as Government’s advisor are making much efforts ranging from strategy to specific works working on how to preserve and take use of heritages for better living quality. They keep launching different social activities to protect heritage values covering a wider range. For example, from 2004, “Save Our Streets” contributed a lot on streets preservation and improvement in England and since 2011 “Heritage at risk” has switched attention on industrial heritages preservation. But according to European Union Regional Development Fund, in many countries, conflicts exist between economic development in modernization and traditional value conservation in heritage areas (Drubigny, 2012). Spanish architect, Alfonso Egara takes European cities as “Living Labs” where urban solutions have to be figured out and manipulated.

However, it is very difficult to link the high technical evolution in social systems with old traditional remaining. Enormous troubles are brought not only to the governors, but also researchers and developers (Tiesdell, 1995; Irit, 2005) when people face the advanced urbanization process in Europe.

Why is historic preservation trapped in a difficult situation? What is it not preferred by policy makers? Some common obstacles are faced by preservationists in different country. Take Chester County as an example, under the impact of development of a country, historic resources are at risks. Firstly because, the physical viability cannot reach the changing needs, types and functions of buildings. Secondly, it lacks economic viability. Preservation requires more money than buying or constructing a new building for house owner or developer. Furthermore, lack of funding or other incentives make it hard to preserve, reuse or rehabilitate heritages. Furthermore, reason of insufficient awareness or education reduces people’s perception on the value of historic areas. Another important reason is from competing local
planning, historic preservation is not ranked with high priority by policy makers yet. An investigation in Alabama in US, 2010 shows that many rehabilitation projects are short of money and incentives and suffering from a decaying (Jones, 2010). Therefore, pure preservation on historical values is too much realistic than practical which makes it as a dilemma in policy making process.

1.2 Problem Delineation

In the past decades, China entered a period of high economic growing. The Social Science of Academic of China (2012) reveal that the current urbanization rate of China is over 50%, and is predicted to reach 55% in 2020 (Social Sciences Academic Press, Shanghai Academy of Social Science, 2012). However, due to the rapid economic development and urbanization, the value of heritage areas is underestimated and countless historical buildings have been destroyed. Under the development of strong modernization and the fast urbanization, the most intractable public deterioration are generated from the destroy of the heritages views, splendid architectures and local cultures of cities and towns switching to less identical cities with self-characteristic declining (Qiu, 2006).

Chinese people started to realize to preserve historical buildings and areas since 1980s which is decades later than Europe. Even though, Chinese style preservation cannot avoid from demolishment and regeneration. The perceptions behind it are still to stimulate economic development and profit driven (Qiu, 2006)

The target city of this research is Harbin, a Northern China city with typically different characters from the other cities in China due to her unique history relating with European countries. This history influences on the city not only the typical European building styles but also the living modes and culture. Many historic districts are left and frame the city in a western way (Clausen & Thogersen, 1995), including Russian style, Byzantine, Renaissance style.

Each year, many construction projects are ongoing and many of them have impacted on the original city views and living styles. The improper intervention can bring negative effects on both economic and social aspects. Economically, based on improper preservations, the pre-investment and resources will only be wasted without an effective result (Appleyard, 1979). Socially, it can be seen that many renovations of historical districts are undertaken in destroying old buildings and rebuilding fake antiques (Jiaqiu & Ding, 2009). These artificial old historical districts have raised much protest from the citizens because they cannot guarantee the continuity of history, but leads to a bizarre pattern on the streets. The methods the government used to preserve historical areas cannot achieve what people want, and even worse, little voice from the public is accepted. Take the “the regeneration movement of Chinese Baroque” as an example, two rounds of preservation movements are carried out. But the effect is that the listed preserved buildings are evicted leaving only the facades facing the street, the back building structures are destroyed. Certain heritage building is used as private club. The traditional street views are not there anymore. Even in the process of expropriation,
violent interventions happened to local habitants (Zeng Y., 2011).

The functional value and spiritual value have passed away and it raised much criticism voice from all ranges of society. The people who have much interest in historic preservation are mainly researchers not governors or developers. This causes the benefit conflicts and policy unjust. Researchers’ power to change the whole situation is weak compared to political parts. Further implements and workable supports are in need.

If the government and urban planners have realized the role of preservation and started taking actions, it has to be seen that these stagnant consequences are not only caused by people perceptions, but also from the lack of appropriate methodologies and sufficient executions (Qiu, 2006).

The methods Europe uses to protect their history and to contribute to economic development are highly appraised on a worldwide level. Additionally Harbin city development has related to Europe style. The government and many planning experts make a lot of effort to learn planning instruments and managerial methods into Harbin context. In 2006, Urban Planning and Construction Bureau assigned a group of experts and planners to Europe for field investigations, with the aim to learn from advanced and successful experiences from European historic cities. The government believes that it is worthy to draw lessons and transplant the achievements of European historical preservation into Harbin context. However, before transplantation, the current situation of Harbin should be explicated in order to let people know how it is. Furthermore, due to different history development from Harbin and European cities, not all of the merits are practical. Based on compatibilities of two parties, the essences of real European historic cities preservation will inspire Harbin.

The preservation of historical areas shows the respects for historic culture and wisdom of predecessors which also saves precious treasures for next generations. The well-known professor Yisan Ruan refers that people should follow the authenticity and integrality to protect the heritages (Ruan, 2011), aiming to guide the preservation methodologies. But how to adapt the benefits of historical areas to the contribution of a rapid urbanization? How can we shape a helpful relation between different stakeholders related to historical areas? This research can be used to contribute on the development orientation for the government of Harbin and Urban Planning Bureau. European experiences that will be analyzed in the research can be helpful to balance both sides. The lesson from European city experiences can be implemented into Chinese context and the research will provide constructive policies.

1.3 Objective of Research

From the view of urban planners and city development policy makers, the research will be conducted both theoretically and practically. The result will be delivered to the Urban Planning Bureau of Harbin as a guidance of historic preservation planning.

The following objectives will be reached in the research:

− To highlight the cultural value identity in these sites
– To clarify the current issues in historic districts that Harbin is facing
– To find the managerial difficulties in preservation planning process
– To acquire the knowledge of European approaches of historical preservation
– To generate the recommendations aiming at improving Harbin historical preservations in urban planning system
– To feedback on the implementation of approach of lesson-drawing

1.4 Research Questions

Main question:

**How can lessons be drawn from European historic preservation experiences and how can they be applied in historic districts of Harbin in order to improve managerial processes of historic preservation planning?**

To answer this main question, a set of theoretical sub-questions and empirical sub-questions are listed:

**Theoretical sub-question:**
What is the meaning to preserve historic districts and how to conduct a helpful research?

1. Why protect historic districts of a city?
2. How can lesson-drawing happen in historic preservation planning?
3. How to guide a lesson-drawing framework to start the research for Harbin?

**Empirical sub-question:**
How to use European experiences to solve relevant issues in Harbin?

4. What are the current issues of historic preservation of Harbin?
5. What successful instruments do European cities take?
6. How to adaptively measure the lessons to design an implementing model for Harbin?

1.5 Research Method and Framework

1.5.1 Research Method

**Lesson-drawing:** The essence of the research is to use lessons learnt from experiences of European cities as they have merit methods to treat difficulties in planning project. Therefore the lesson-drawing theory will set a framework of the whole research. Based on lessons drawn from cases, applicable instruments will be tried to be transplanted to Harbin.

**Literature review:** The other experts’ researches are helpful to frame a solid theory foundation in order to support this research in an academic way. The information is collected through library, articles from relevant fields, Google searching, and recommendations from professors and peers.

**Field investigation:** Through field investigation, the status quo of Jordaan district and most of listed historical districts in Harbin are given. It provides the first hand resources of case areas and they are more convincing.
As for streets in England, due to time limited the author did not go on site, but enough information is collected and introduced through books, official websites and emails from the staff working in this movement in English Heritage. The missing of being on site will not impact on the final effect.

**Case study and comparison:** The successful cases of historical preservation in England and Amsterdam will be analyzed into aspects of: cultural value measurements, urban planning instruments, public participation and financial recourse. These aspects will also be delineated in Harbin side and model design.

**Interview:** Prof. Hielkje Zijlstra from Faculty of Architecture in TU Delft was interviewed face-to-face to answer the related questions and provide much information about how the Netherlands is doing in historic preservation in the past and currently. Prof. Xu, from Faculty of Architecture of Harbin Institute of Technology, was interviewed through a series of emails and provided much introduction about the regulations of historic preservation in Harbin. The staff from English Heritage organization was interviewed through email as well.

### 1.5.2 Research Framework

The thesis will be structured following the steps of lesson-drawing approach, under the help of literature review and case studies. There are three main phases in planning transplantation: inspiration, learning and transplantation (Janssen-Jansen, Spaans, & Van der Veen, 2008) from which this research will include Harbin and European knowledge inspiration, case analysis and lessons drawing, and the implementation and transplantation. Specifically, 10 steps of drawing lessons from Richard Rose (2005) will help to guide a comprehensive process until the implementation is finalized (Rose, 2005). The reasoning of the steps will be explained in 2.4 section, while the framework sketch is shown as followed (see Figure 1):

*Figure 1 The framework of the thesis*
This chapter addressed the background of historic heritage and the development of preservation in the world. It also delineated the problems faced by the target city Harbin. Chapter 2 is theoretical supports. It framed the conceptualization and the causal relation of historic preservation and urban quality. It will explain the characters of lesson-drawing and breakdown its procedures which will be the main clue and structure of the following research. In chapter 3, the status quo in historical preservation of the target city, Harbin, will be elaborated. The similarities between Harbin and Europe give the reason of this lesson-drawing process. The differences between the two parts provide the space of learning and adaption. This part will give an insight in historic districts planning in Harbin, including the culture, the legislation development, the conditions of 22 listed historic districts and city management operations. In chapter 4, two European cases will be analyzed according to the above aspects in urban planning and urban management way. Based on case selection criteria, these cases will try to cover three types of historic districts in Harbin both in function, environment and culture. After each case study, the lessons learnt from them will be abstracted.

In chapter 5, we will move to a practical perspective. In this section, it focuses on the comparability to see the relationship of a certain historic district in Harbin with the case. The European merits will be analyzed and implement to the context in Harbin context in order to check how the feasibility of implementing it in Harbin.

With the help of the above research, the potentially adaptive recommendation will be drawn in chapter 6 to improve Harbin historic districts maintenance. Also, the reflection of the whole research will be given.
Chapter 2 Lesson-drawing in historic preservation planning

2.1 Preservation in historic districts

2.1.1 Basic concepts of historic preservation

Historic districts are the areas or sections in a city and contain old buildings with valuable historical or aesthetic significance (Doratli, Hoskara, & Fasli, 2004) over a certain eras of styles of architectural typical of history. Historic districts compose historic residential areas, historic city centers and urban heritages (Steinberg, 1996).

Historic preservation, with the rehabilitation and restoration on historic property (Sweeney, 1991), is an endeavor to preserve or protect buildings, objects, landscapes environment and other artifacts of historical culture and character.

Facing all the heritage districts, the meaning of preservation not only focuses on the physical buildings or sites applied as honorific label or the memory of the past (Michael, 2012), but to continue the historical culture and the life traditions from a mental way. From this aspect, historic districts can be regarded as uninterruptable segmentation in human’s life which ensures the current clinging to the history and regional evolvement.

Historic preservation as a branch of urban planning system contains more than professional planning skills. Often, it requires the experts to give a planning design for the permission from the government whiles multiple organizations to implement it. Therefore, it is also a city management programme. The involvement of multi-actors likely leads to many issues and conflicts. Many people are easy to have a stereotype that differently from new constructions, historical preservation can be a money pit if the maintenance or enhancement work should be done (Treanor Architects, 2012). Actually, it needs more labor and less material which cannot provide the balance for developers but to the community. Thus not many contractors or real estate developers are interested in this type of projects (Weaver, 2012). Therefore, historic preservation is easily facing management difficulties.

2.1.2 Why preserve historic districts

Before defining how to preserve the historic districts, it is significant to elaborate what qualifies the historic districts and what are the benefits behind it. From the diagram below (Figure 2), the causal loop shows how to achieve the ultimate goal of the quality of city environment. It shows the benefits behind the historic districts preservation.

A-B loop: A preconditioned goal of our topic background is city environment quality. Historic districts as a subclass of city, it composes a very important of city context. Obviously, the quality of historic districts influence on the quality of city environment.
C: With time and city development, the history is recorded and forms all kinds of characteristics of a certain region.

D-E loop: When the time passes and the characteristics are enhanced by replication, the identification is framed from which the characteristics can be visible and recognizable for citizens. In order to frame the specific image of a city, it is important to maintain the cultural identity of city.

The preservation of historic districts not only contributes to the state of environment, but also to the cultural values defining the characteristic of a place (Okana & Samson, 2010). The culture reframing can re-generate the vitality in historic districts (Sasaki, 2010) in return. Therefore, preservation of historic district and recall of cultural identity is to attract people and enhance the living quality.

F-G loop: People living in this region, record a basic recognition of the existing culture into their memory, which is called sympathy and sense of belonging. When they encounter the similar in future, they will be reminded (English Heritage, 2005). Cultural value of the place is the spiritual essence of the location and the human life, because historic area is regarded very essential to people’s sense of belonging. Also this feeling increases the significance of cultural value of historic districts (Tweed & Sutherland, 2007).

H: If the emotion is guided into an optimistic direction and people’s mental needs are satisfied under this situation, they are willing to dedicate as a return of accepting (English Heritage, 2009) contributing to the environment.

I: The contribution improves the quality of environment as a feedback of citizens. This is the casual loop of historic culture and people’s sensation.

To conclusion, the meaning of preserving historic districts on one hand can ensure and protect the historic continuity, on the other hand it help people to form a sense of belonging to a set of cultural values in order to contribute to the quality of living environment. In this way, the city environment can be stimulated.
2.2 Lesson-drawing approach to preserve historic districts

From the previous section, it is clarified that there are many difficulties in preserving historic districts and the meaning of historic preservation. But how to deal with these difficulties and if there are any similar situations the other cities are facing? If yes, how do they solve them? These questions relate to a theoretical approach of learning—lesson-drawing. Here, the research will implement lesson-drawing approach to generate successful experiences from other cities in order to solve the similar difficulties for Harbin. Section 2.2 will introduce the process of lesson-drawing and discuss the possibilities of this approach in historic districts planning.

2.2.1 Basic concepts of lesson-drawing approach

Lesson-drawing is seen as a helpful way to improve the current unsatisfied situation faced by policy makers. Policy makers learn lessons from other settings which related to solve the problems they are facing and transfer into their context (Rose, 1991). Based on diffusion studies, there are other terms sharing similar concept: policy transfer (Dolowitz & Marsh, Learning from Abroad: The Role of Policy Transfer, 2000), institutional transfer (Jacoby, 2000).

Although within a given policy area, each country and region has problems which are up to point unique to its own time and location, there are still many settings in common beyond regional boundaries. Rose (1991) pointed in his research “What is lesson-drawing” that:

“Confronted with a common problem, policymakers in cities and regional governments and nations can learn from how their counterparts elsewhere respond. It raises the possibility that policymakers can draw lessons that will help them deal better with their own problems. Lesson-drawing is about whether a programme can transfer from one place to another.”

“If the lesson is positive, a policy that works is transferred, with suitable adaptations. If it is negative, observers learn what not to do from watching the mistakes of others” (Rose, 1991).

This approach became popular since 20 years ago. Dolowitz and Marsh list some main reasons for this booming. Firstly, globalization breaks the boundary of each nation and makes it impossible to isolate from others. Moreover, the flexible communication among organizations goes easier than before. These factors bring policy makers turn more attention to other political systems where they wait to learn new ideas, conceptions and advanced experiences (Dolowitz & Marsh, 2000).

2.2.2 Possibility of lesson learning in urban planning domain

Facing the difficulties in historic preservation process, it is necessary to insight if any other successful experiences can help solve them. A country’s urban instrumental policies can be inspired by other countries (Spaans, 2004). Nasr and Volait put forward 3 types of such notion: the ideas from the capital of a western country to the rest of the country, from a western country to another western country, from a western country to
a non-western country (Nasr & Volait, 2003). What will happen in this research is the third type: from European cities to a Chinese city.

When we talk about the urban planning field, the political institution is not exactly the same as the macro managerial term in the previous description. Although the legislations and cultures might differ among countries, the researchers on lesson-drawing and policy transplantation still found common points in urban planning process (Kaufman & Escuin, 2000). In urban planning, especially in historic preservation programmes, some lesson-learning cases really happened in highly distinguishable historical and spatial frameworks (Nasr & Volait, 2003). It occurs in the process of urbanism legislation, urban planning instruments, urban projects organizing and managerial process. Furthermore, it considers the social culture context and customs, such as stakeholders’ cooperative relationship and financial problems.

Chinese cities are under the charge of the central legislative system which differs far from European. Moreover, the legislation problem is from upper level of governing system therefore is hard to be touched. As a result, the legislative level will be out of the research scope. However, unrelated to empirical evidence of adopter, lesson-drawing is applicable beyond the constraints of institutional differences, normative preferences and inertia of to-be-established settings (Rose, 2001) which means the legislative will not impact on the learning process.

The purpose of lesson-drawing from European cities is not to pirate the original institution to the new context of Harbin. The logical or reasoning process of how it happened in donor side is not significant to the adopter (Rose, 1991). From this viewpoint, the historical evolution in European society will not impact on the lessons transferring for Harbin.

Nevertheless, it is still quite uncertain and difficult to assess the adaptability of lesson-drawing. The question of why borrow other’s experiences should be answered before borrowing behavior is designed (de Jong, Lalenis, & Mamadouh, 2002). Therefore, using this strategy as a guideline, practitioners need to analyze both situation and generate the matching point.

We should take into concern that how they solve the common conflicts in the historic preservation and planning process, and whether these instruments can solve the intractable issues for Harbin. If so, will be the instruments workable if they are directly applied in Harbin, or we need to improve them adaptively? Therefore, lesson-drawing will be helpful to enhance and improve urban planning system (Spaan & Louw, 2009).

2.3 Guidance of lesson-drawing process

2.3.1 Three phases of lesson drawing process

Many researchers have diversified the methods for intensities of lesson-drawing. Three levels of intensities of planning instruments and practices while comparing practices internationally are broken down into: inspiration, learning and transplantation (Janssen-Jansen, Spaans, & Van der Veen, 2008).
• In the **inspiration phase**, the information of experiences and practices will be gathered and evaluated. The question of why to learn or not to learn and adopt from other countries should be answered (Spaan & Louw, 2009).

From the context of Harbin, the question of “why to learn” will be concluded through the current issues delineation. Policy makers in Harbin always try to find better methods to improve the historic districts and maintain cultural values of these districts which are not sufficiently carried forward. The conditions in many European cities are optimistic and can be examples for Harbin. From the large amount of academic research and field investigations, the experts from Harbin Urban Planning Bureau and government have curiosities in how European cities preserve historic areas, thus they are sufficiently inspired.

In the following two chapters, Chapter 3-Harbin status quo and Chapter 4-European case studies, the situations and characteristics of each part will be stated. It will reveal how it is and what happened there aiming to acknowledge and inspire the policy makers to learn from Europe to solve Harbin issues.

- **Learning phase** determines the matching degrees like retrieving ideas, holdbacks and alternatives. This part will mainly be on the analysis and comparison of donors and adopters, and how to implement it into another environment with fewer obstacles. Leaning process is strived from not only what should be learnt but also what not to do (Rose, 2005). Rose implied that essential of learning is about the core of “programme” as a result of which the knowledge can be adapted somewhere else (Rose, 2005).

The basic setting of two societies has commons defined as variables which provide the matching points to compare and analyze before transplantation happens. As a pre-condition of comparing, comparative variables of the two generic backgrounds will be generated in next section 2.4. The programme content where the attentions are will be framed in chapter 3 after the current issues are clarifies. It will guide the learning phase in Chapter 5-comparison and application of lesson-drawing.

- In the last **phase of transplantation**, the specific conditions of importer context should be penetrated under which proper policies will be designated. What is generated from cases will redesign an adaptation model, synthesized with the original local context, applicable model will be given as a reference of recommendations in chapter 6.

From this categorization, the research can be structured as Table 2-1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inspiration phase</th>
<th>Chapter 3</th>
<th>The status quo and current issues of historical districts in Harbin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 4</td>
<td>The successful performances of cases in Europe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2-1 Lesson-drawing structure of the research 1
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Learning phase</strong></th>
<th>Chapter 5</th>
<th>The comparability and applicability analysis corresponding to the main aspects in historic preservation process; theoretical applications of the adaption model and synthesized model design</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transplantation phase</strong></td>
<td>Chapter 6</td>
<td>Transplanted as strategic recommendations; constrains of approach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first two phases are the foundation of transplantation which the planning implementation and approaches of the latter often go beyond former (Hendriks, 2007). When we see the background of Europe and China, the legislations, cultures and economic structures all diverge from each other, even with European countries, those items differentiate. It increases the difficulties of take-over. But the different histories and culture backgrounds will not interrupt the lessons learning process (Rose, 2005), as long as the problems they face are correlated and the solvents are desired by Harbin side. Additionally the final policy will be decided by policy makers and the policy should have specific practical meaning aiming different types of historic districts. The recommendation of this research rather provides possible references instead of giving final solution. Due to these constrains, the inspiration and learning phases will be weighed out of transplantation phase.

### 2.3.2 Ten steps of lesson-drawing process

Richard Rose (2005) has designated 10 steps to guide a lesson-drawing process. They help to establish a reasonable and logical process of learning (Rose, Learning from comparative public policy-A practical guide, 2005):

1. Understanding programmes and lessons
2. Creating awareness of problems
3. Where to look for lessons

The first three steps are objective acknowledge of donor and import sides which present the recourses and problem formulation of Harbin, and raise the interests of the policy makers when they see the success from the European cases. Therefore it corresponds to inspiration phase and the policy makers are willing to see the solutions from cases.

4. Finding out how a programme really works there
5. Turning anecdotes into a model

4th step is analytical process of learning where what can be learn from cases, why and how it happened in source site. Additionally, 5th step shows that the elements from the cases should be framed into a causal model as to be portable. Therefore they belong to learning phase where more deduction and comparison are studied.

6. Drawing a lesson-applying a model
7. Should a lesson be adopted?
8. Can a lesson be applied?
9. Increasing chances of success
10. Looking ahead

In the end, the final policy scenarios will be given in order to apply the model.
Thus they belong to transplantation phase. The last group of steps is seen as final decision, reflection or assessment of the lesson-drawing approach from policy maker.

However, due to the limitation of this research, the policy makers of Harbin cannot give the reflection. Also within the scope of this research, the last 5 steps are out of the boundary. Therefore, we only focus on policy scenarios and constraints of research. The next feedbacks will be expected in future work. Guided by both the Rose’s steps and Janssen-Jansen and et al’s phases, the structure is aligned as Table 2-2:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3 Phases</th>
<th>10 Steps</th>
<th>Cha.</th>
<th>Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inspiration</td>
<td>(1) Understanding programmes and lessons</td>
<td>Cha3</td>
<td>The status quo and current issues of historical districts in Harbin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>phase</td>
<td>(2) Creating awareness of problems</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(3) Where to look for lessons</td>
<td>Cha4</td>
<td>Based on case selection criteria matching point and the case contents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(4) Finding out how a programme really works</td>
<td>Cha4</td>
<td>Analyze the successful performance of cases based on model framework of the research in 2.4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>there</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning</td>
<td>(5) Turning anecdotes into a model</td>
<td>Cha5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>phase</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(6) Drawing a lesson - applying a model</td>
<td>Cha5</td>
<td>The adaption model and synthesized model design, theoretical applications transplanted as strategic recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transplanta-</td>
<td>Reflection and recommendations</td>
<td>Cha6</td>
<td>Some reflection on constrains and difficulties of the research, give recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tion phase</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2-2 Lesson-drawing structure of the research 2

#### 2.3.3 Framework of model design

The managerial instruments are tools to apply preservation. Managerial instruments can be generated from the process under the institutions. Institutional context is about the social, economic, political aspects between borrowing and donor parties. It can be divided into two sections: formal institution and informal institution, according to de Jong and Mamadouh (2002):

“…the former refers to the legal rules of the game telling who is allowed (or not) or obliged (or not) to undertake what actions and under what conditions…”

While the informal includes:

“…social practices and rituals based on underlying cultural values and norms…”
The differences between these two locate in the competencies and obligations of all participants and the modes of behavior under circumstances. It crosses with category with tangible and intangible elements of historic preservation as we mentioned in 2.1.4. Generally speaking, the regulations and legislations of a system, along with operation patterns belong to formal institutional domain, while the culture recognition and living style locate in informal institution.

The actions in the context of institution are divided into three levels (Ostrom, 1982) categorize of the content, according to Toonen (1990):

- Regulatory framework: *whole set of legal and socio-cultural conditions, rules, norms and values that provide the context in which decision making processes and relations take place*. This level contains the legal domains from upper stream of the city management like regulations and legislation of urban planning.

- Policy instrument: *the system of legal, financial, political and organizational relations between various government units within a state structure*. Historic district preservation process needs many policies intending to stimulate the related actors involve in an effective mechanism.

- Operational implement: *the whole set of exploratory activities, procedures, techniques and administrative forms used by individuals within the constitutional and institutional framework* (Toonen, 1990).

By and large, when the two types of categorization are combined, we will generate $2 \times 3 = 6$ aspects of programme to guide both adopter and donor part statement. Because it is hardly to transfer the whole protocol (de Jong, Lalenis, & Mamadouh, 2002), the core of the whole context to be discussed in the following chapters remains on the urban planning instruments and project managements. Collaborated with 2.2.2 – “the possibility of lesson drawing in planning domain”, the table is filled as followed:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of Action</th>
<th>Formal Institution</th>
<th>Informal Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regulatory framework</td>
<td>Urban planning Legislation and regulation</td>
<td>Traditional culture background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy instrument</td>
<td>Supervision of process</td>
<td>Multi-organizational coordination; Financial source</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operational instrument</td>
<td>Guidance of operation</td>
<td>Regular ways of working</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In this view, the policy instruments are within the process of project management, including supervisory mechanism, financial investment system and collaboration system. While operational instrument focuses on detail and implementing level on how to conduct the labor work which including guidance of operation and regular ways of working. In the model design for Harbin, the scenarios will focus on policy level and
operational level due to the un-accessibility and toughness of up-stream regulatory systems and lack of involvement of governors.

Based on this, the conceptual mode is designed as Figure 3:

**Figure 3** Conceptual model for case study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Input</th>
<th>Research activities</th>
<th>Output</th>
<th>Possible recipient</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harbin context</td>
<td>Case 1</td>
<td>Case 2</td>
<td>Operational guideline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning operational instruments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Public participation mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who are involved in the planning process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Supervisory mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The fairness of process of projects</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Multi-organization coordination mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordination with other organizations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Financial mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordination with other organizations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operational guideline</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regular ways of working</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervision during process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordination with other organizations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Money source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The five items from research content above are input as criteria on the left column for our research in order to draw lessons from outer experiences. The main body is research activities during which Harbin city current situation and the cases will be analyzed. The outputs are expected to be new mechanisms which can solve the difficulties and issues happening in Harbin context. The right column is possible or recommended recipients in charge of each mechanism.

2.4 Comparability and applicability criteria

2.4.1 Comparability criteria to select cases

To learn experiences from Europe, proper cases should be chosen. The judgment of case selection is determined both practically and theoretically. From practical perspective, “what Harbin needs?” should be clarified because it is the ultimate goal of this research. From theoretical perspective, “how to match Harbin context better?” should be considered in order to ensure the quality of policy transplantation.

Firstly and most principally, to answer “what Harbin needs” is to solve the issues happened in historic preservation planning process. In the case situation, if the same issue is faced, the solution from the case side might be referable. Rose stated that lesson-drawing process is “possible only if policymakers in different government face a common problem (Rose, 2005)”. Therefore, it is crucial to generate what are the current
issues in Harbin and why the policy makers feel difficult to preserve the historic districts which will be spread in Chapter 3. The main issues in Harbin are no more than the dimensions which has been already listed in section 2.3.2-framework of model design and will be listed in the end of Chapter 3. If the difficulties in Harbin can be solved in the European cases we choose, the case is successfully selected.

Posterior to the practical view of common issue’s solvency, consentient objective is another criterion. For each movement or planning, the objective is to solve one or more issues in that area. Just like both the cases have problems to deal with and after the movement most of these problems are solved. Therefore, if the objectives of the cases also work for Harbin, they have the consentient objective and they are be compared. Meanwhile, as mentioned, policy transferring is a personal perception subject than technical or other views, the agreement from the policy makers on the goals of the experiences and willingness to learn from them, can judge the final consequence of this research. Therefore the objective of movements in cases will be considered if also adaptive to Harbin.

Thirdly, compatibility comparison is another criterion. Cross-national comparisons provide the understandings of major differences and similarities of urban planning systems (Spaan & Louw, 2009). In the policy transferring context, comparability is a goodness of fit used to compare the characteristics from donor and acceptor side to measure their suitability and transferability (de Jong, Lalenis, & Mamadouh, 2002). Likely, according to ten steps designed by Richard Rose (2005), Step 3- “Deciding where to look for a lesson” gave five items of relevance to consider as principles when selecting where to learn, during which ideological compatibility is a similar index (Rose, 2005) and it helps us how to judge comparability. Ideological compatibility contains the characters they share or diverge, based on which the more they share the more helpful and transferable the instruments from the case will be for Harbin. Noticeably, this index main focuses on a political view while here is more practical. But here, the interpretation can be adjusted befittingly into our purpose. If both sides share similar characters, they can be categorized into the same type of society that may have compatibilities to share the institutions. A high compatibility is a cut-in point for the transplantation where the reaction to the intervention from local society will be as low as possible or solvable.

Expect for these, Similarities in resources is another key. The resources consist of the foundation of adoption which is easily to be omitted, such as fund or financial support, personnel and organizational capacity. Within, organizational capacity for example refers that when they want to spread the influence or need involvement of other parties, if they are able to invite them. In historic preservation planning process, some difficulties locate at financial provision, policy provision. If the cases show the solvent in using these resources, only when Harbin has similar potential resources then successful transplantation can happen.

Additionally, three other indexes will be considered theoretically as pre-condition, psychological not geographical proximity, availability of evidence and
interdependence. Band together Harbin context, each of them will be delineated as:

**Psychological not geographical proximity**: as already said policy makers need to be willing to learn from a different system. Personal perception will determine the success. That is why empirically the lesson-drawing seldom happens among countries from nearby even if they share similar legacies. The policy makers in Harbin believe that they will benefit from European experiences from the truth that they sent a group of experts to Europe for field investigation of urban planning in 2006 and big quantitative academic documents are recorded in the topic of learning from European countries.

**Availability of evidence**: such as language problem might be obstacle of understanding what happened there. From this aspect, this research will contribute to Harbin because the author will do interpretation and provide the analysis.

**Interdependence**: due to the increasingly interdependency between national programmes, mainly in banking, military defense and tourism industries. Programmes link the countries and create dependences. However, this point does not fit Harbin because there is no evidence that any cooperation is established with Europe.

But these three principles are just additional considerations relating which are not inevitable, thus missing interdependency among the cases and Harbin will not fail the learning process. Therefore, integrated with the above principles, the selection criteria framework is designed mainly from the first three items:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Criteria indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The common issues</td>
<td>- The bad conditions on the historic districts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Difficulty in operational workings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The difficulties in managerial workings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consentient objectives</td>
<td>- The objectives of the cases and Harbin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Willingness to learn</td>
<td>- Default but very positive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The function of districts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- local attractive characters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Traffic conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Local cultural customs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideological compatibility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Main users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Participators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Potential investors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Policy makers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Local regulations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2-4 Case selection criteria summary**

To explain the willingness to learn, that it can be seen the policy makers of Harbin are willing to learn from European advanced experiences from their past actions of sending experts to Europe for a visit. But due to the lack of policy makers’ involvement during the research, the final measurement is default. Based on the case selection criteria, comparability analysis of case and Harbin will be defined elaborately in section 5.1.1 and 5.2.1.
2.4.2 Applicability variables to design exporting model

Based on 2.3.3 section, framework of model design, we draft the procedures and components of model design to export from cases. As mentioned in 2.3.3, the constitution level is out of scope of this research, we only spread policy level and operation level.

Operational level focuses on a specific guidance of operation for workers and how to identify the cultural value elements on sites. On top of it, public participation as an existed policy in China will be strengthened again here. Policy level includes financial mechanism, supervision mechanism and multi-organizational coordination mechanism. In financial aspect, the lack of money issue will be solved by referential recommendation generated from the cases. Other solvencies will be raised in decision making process where transparency and fairness is required. Multi-organizational coordination mechanism helps to provide more potential contributions for the society.

In the case analysis in chapter 5, applicability analysis displays many indicators as the characteristics of the cases according to the above categories. As an overview of the research, it is summarized as below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model design framework</th>
<th>Applicability variables in cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Guidance of operation</strong></td>
<td>Building maintenance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Removal redundant elements and protect historical values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality of environment of public space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detailed jobs for operators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Large scale of working</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long time persistence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Existing facilities renewal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public participation</strong></td>
<td>Public participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More attention on public users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Constitution of local users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Supervisory mechanism</strong></td>
<td>Accessibility to government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fairness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mass media supervision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Less attention for developers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial mechanism</strong></td>
<td>Financial investment from NGOs, rich groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Financial investment from social donations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multi-organizational coordination mechanism</strong></td>
<td>Residential community responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Collaboration with other organizations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.5 Conclusion of chapter 2

In the chapter, we elucidated the related concepts and theories we will use in the research. In short, the main meaning to preserve the historical districts is to protect cultural value that will raise people’s sense of belongings in order to contribute to the society and improve the living quality. Therefore, culture identification is significant in
urban planning process. Due to the lack of effective preservation process, we will learn from European experiences through case studies. The theory of lesson-drawing will provide a guideline for the research. Three phases from Janssen-Jansen et al structured the general process in inspiration, learning and transplantation phase. Together with steps from Richard Rose we got the final instructive framework.

With the theoretic preparation, the case study and policy recommendation can be done. The cases selection criteria are determined in ideological compatibility, similarities in resources, psychological not geographical proximity, availability of evidence, interdependence. These criteria items will be spread in the case study according to case characters. The methods to analyze the case and design a model will follow applicability analysis and implementation analysis. The content of the research will focus on policy level which contains supervisory mechanism, financial mechanism and multi-organizational coordination mechanism, and operational level including guidance of operation, and public participation according to the action of policy transplantation.
Chapter 3 Status quo of historic districts preservation in Harbin

3.1 Culture background of Harbin

Harbin has a long history which can be traced back 10 thousands of years ago. It is the cradle land of the Jin Dynasty and the Qing Dynasty of China. From a small fishing area, this city underwent many international-related historical events which formed it in a unique style with a diversity of cultures: from 19th century to 20th century, after the Tsar Middle East Train system was completed, the city attracted people trading business here. Businessmen and embassies promoted the constructions and living styles in a western way. Since then, embassies from 16 countries have been established here and 160,000 foreign people from 33 countries assembled and spent their whole life. From then, Harbin city started deriving multiple trends of thoughts, arts and new products. This is how the multiple cultures converged.

Compared to most of Chinese cities, Harbin has more geographical convenience with Russia which makes it not only accessible to trade business and communications on cultures, but also to exchange living style and customs beyond country boundaries. Furthermore, during the war period decades ago, Harbin city was ruled by other countries like Russia and Japan. The governors and city planners of these countries left many constructions and city planning projects at that moment. Therefore, Harbin became one of the limited cities in the world which developed under deliberate city planning and human guidance since the initial city construction. Russian style of town planning deeply influenced on the development of Harbin from end of 19th century to early of 20th century. The city plan merged Howard’s Garden City thoughts which could be seen the first advanced planning thought at that moment with Baroque architecture tendency. As a conclusion, the invading context history witnessed European culture collection in the city development of Harbin.

3.2 Planning legislation of historic districts preservation

Since 1980s, under the background of nationwide contestation to protect heritage buildings, a historic preservation movement came to the stage of urban planning. The governments of big cities have received the central governmental policy and took actions to protect old buildings since 1984. Afterwards, old buildings and streets with significant historical value have been listed gradually to attract special attention. In 1996, the researchers and governors of Harbin started selecting a set of building and street units as key subjects to preserve. The first legislation of “Administrative Rules on Preserved Buildings, Living Blocks and Regions of Harbin” was enacted. In the next five years, the province established “Preserved Buildings and Districts Regulations of Harbin” as the first localized regulation on historic districts in China. This regulation clearly set a boundary for preserved areas and suitable construction areas. Also, it confined the proper scale of streets and the color of the buildings in surrounding areas. A dedicated preservation bureau was established to take charge of the relevant operations. Until currently, in 2010, the regulation was updated into “the Regulation of
Historical Cultural City of Harbin” which adds much more details.

Characters of regulations on historic preservation:

(1) Quantitative increase of content

In 2006, there were 20 sites defined as historical cultural districts. In the regulation of 2010 version, on one hand some of the sites were combined as an integrated area, on the other hand some new districts were added. In the new regulation, a total of 22 historic districts were counted with actually 5 new areas more.

After the latest “Regulation of Historical Cultural City of Harbin” was released in 2010, and the specific Historic City Planning of Harbin was broken down into 7 levels: the integrated pattern – historic zones – historic districts – historic green environment regions - heritage unit and architecture – intangible culture heritage – specific theme areas. The old city was divided into 3 regions including 13 historical cultural streets and 9 historical cultural view areas. These 22 historic districts will be seen as a whole system in Harbin.

The latest regulation includes some entertainment areas, memorial areas and parks. The number of listed preserved buildings and historic districts keeps increasing every round of new regulation.

(2) Enlarged preservation up to a regional level

First change is the building definition. The old appellation “preserved building” is invalidated. Instead, they are defined as “historic buildings” which enlarges the scale of architectures with significant historical value.

Another movement is about the system configuration. The latest regulation delimits three preserving circles as: 1, historic architectures, buildings and districts; 2, heritage yards and the environments of historic building; 3, urban administrative regions. Therefore, three layers plot out a preserving system covering the whole region in Harbin. It aligns the international changeover, the attention of historic heritages experienced from a single preserved building to a group of buildings, from physical architecture to spaces and environments.

In this way, historic preservation not only works within the district but also on the urban level to maintain the city fabric and characters. Additionally, the allocations of historic districts constitute a historic site system to form a historical cultural city which is seen as a development strategy.

(3) Content specification

The content of regulation is detailed in order to configure the heritage as much as possible. From the city level, the axis of city, the road nets, the view of streets and landscapes, green system and the height of old building groups are all taken into consideration. From a certain single historic district, the style, scale, height, color and structure of the buildings are controlled and guided according to urban design guidance.

Especially, some sites are emphases to be preserved, Central Pedestrian Street, Garden Street Districts, St. Sofia Church, Mr. Stone Temple and their surroundings. The natural water, plants and landscape of these areas will be framed to promote city’s integrated image.
3.3 Management difficulties of preservation projects

The previous section reveals that much effort has been done from a legal level. And the tendency of legislation is going into a wider range direction with both physical and mental carefulness. Under this supportive background, the practical work should be accessible. However why are there still many effects not satisfying in managerial process? From the city planning and management perspective, organizational coordination mechanism, public participating mechanism and financial mechanism are three main aspects which are still facing many difficulties.

3.3.1 Unbalance in stakeholder relationships

In China, four most effective actors are interrelating in urban construction and development projects: governors, developers (e.g. real estate contractors and investors), experts (e.g. urban planners) and local residents which is the same case in Harbin. Compared to normal constructions, historic preservation projects are special because it relates to social value and historical value instead of profit return on investments. So the conflicts between the actors are obviously severer.

- Government

In China, governance system of urban management operates totally from the top to down (Berque, 1990). Governments do not only play the role as civil engineers, additionally they have the right to trade land in return of large tax revenue as a result of the Chinese land law. Therefore, many Chinese governments are regarded as land traders who are willing to see the financial benefits. The same case happens in Harbin. During the urban planning process in Harbin, the government started to take the profit into consideration when carrying on urban constructions. In the actor analysis of Harbin urban planning system, the government makes final decisions covering two concerns, urban development and revenue income.

This argument can be generated from a tendency of the taxation revenue in the past decade in China. Due to Chinese taxation system, the government benefits not only a small amount from land selling. In 2011, the total taxation revenue of Harbin outweighed 50billion RMB which is 22.3% upper than 2010. The author could not find out what the percentage of it is from land selling, but according to the National case including 130 big cities in China, the land selling revenue in 2010 was 2700billion RMB which 65.9% is from land selling (SSA, 2012). Except from 2008 and 2011 with national constraining policy on land use hit the market, this number kept increasing year on year since 2001.

- Commercial developers

When talked about government, Japanese researchers, Hiroshi Okana and Danny Samson attribute the role of government as a “cooperative rule” when the government’s manipulations of system or control is unfeasible (Okana & Samson, 2010). It means that other various existing stakeholders compose and influence on the governance process. In Harbin, these possible actors are such as commercial developing companies,
material suppliers, and construction companies. Therefore, the complex interests conflict the influence on decision makings of urban planning and manipulation of the projects for Harbin decision makers.

Additionally, developers in Harbin (sometimes investors are separated from developers) have financial resource that they invest on the projects which can contribute on the completion of projects. But as commercial developers, they expect a big return in the end (Ryan, 2004). Therefore this goal constrains the developers acting profit driven with less regarding historic culture or pure social welfare in construction process which leads to big losses of cultural value in Harbin. In conclusion, on one hand they hold financial resource, on the other they behave against the objectives of historic preservation.

Officially developers are distinguished from state owned and private owned. In this research we will focus the latter as they are the dominant in Harbin.

- **Urban Planners**

  Urban planners as experts provide professional suggestions on city’s strategic development and regional functionalization serving for government or developers. As experts, they should start from a neutral point to provide objective strategies. Facing the decaying cultural value in historic preservation, urban planners obligate to give guidance on how to treat historic districts and report to government.

  In the past years, urban planners in Harbin have made many designs and planning of the important historic buildings and districts with many success endings. At the meanwhile, the regeneration or renewal endings are criticized by citizens and other experts as fake antique (Zeng, 2011). This is the breach of duty and it will leave irrecoverable loss. However, if we track the reasons of these fake antiques, firstly it is resulted by unqualified specialization, secondly probably derived from the preference of government.

- **Local citizens**

  One of the special characteristics of historic districts planning is its relationship with local citizens. They live in these areas generation after generation while in some residential districts they spend most of their life. And these districts provide them a meaningful experience either about daily life, about working or about entertainment life. To preserve these areas, is to increase the living standard and degree of happiness which directly benefits local citizens. And the local citizens as the direct users of the heritage facilities have the first hand judgments and assessment of the environment. The significance of the involvement of citizens therefore is more than the conflicts between them and developers.

  Nevertheless, the involvement of citizens in Harbin historic preservation is limited. On one hand as mentioned in previous actor analysis, it is a top-down process, public is endowed with little power in decision making, on the other hand that the citizens have fewer channels to participate in projects. The weak public participation will be
discussed in the following section.

3.3.2 Weak public involvement in regular ways of working

As said that currently the urban planning process is from top to down in Harbin which is just following the large-scale context of the whole country. When Harbin government decides how to improve the historic districts conditions, they wants to control the whole planning process and make final decision according to their preference. As a result, the participation from the public seems very little. Although public participation concept has been introduced into Chinese decision making process since less than 20 years ago, it turns out to be mainly implemented aftermath like in the exhibition of the final plan. Public participation especially in historic preservation as a social activity can not attract sufficient attention from decision makers.

Furthermore, in Harbin, not only the public has little influence on decision making process, sometimes the rights of the public, mainly citizens, are deprived or they are treated illegally and brutally as many construction projects in historic Residential Districts and Commercial Background Districts took violent eviction to force the residents to move out of their houses. Citizen’s interests and safety are hurt and their voice is very weak when they are given too limited power to express.

An example from Commercial Districts with the biggest Chinese Baroque style environment of China in Daowai will show this statement. Two rounds of preservation movements of this region decided by Harbin government and urban planning bureau were launched in the past 10 years. Public participation only appears in final informing step of decision of expropriation. Obviously the local citizens presented strong protest. However in the expropriation process, the executors of developers just pushed down the residential buildings without considering the response of local citizens, or detruded the houses including legally listed preserved buildings leaving only facades of the buildings. The folk heritage preservation organization protests to the government many times but still could not change the consequences. Frequently, it can be seen that in front of government building, group of citizens sit and wait to appeal to the officers about their unfairness but less feedback from the government can be revealed.

Too little involvement of public is considered in the decision making process in Harbin. If we insight into European historic preservation development in the past decades, this will be a big hindrance for Harbin to turn over.

3.3.3 Standing financial gaps in construction projects

There is a big gap from the fund of historic preservation and real money put in projects every year in Harbin. Some statistics shows that the fund of historic district preservation was 1 million RMB (about 125 thousand Euros) in 2008 and was increased 2million in 2009 (about 250thousands Euros) in 2009. However, the real money put in the project was only 200 thousands RMB in the following year. This indicates a big gap between the planned fund and aftermath real input.

This type of job needs large investment because the maintenance fee is high and requires professional skills. In most the cases, the investment is as planned from central government and local finance revenue. But in the using process, this money cannot be
provided on time due to official procedures and other issues. It delays many projects.

Additionally, during the process of selecting which area should firstly receive preservation, governors are likely to choose the advanced, golden area like commercial center expecting high return on investment. Therefore, it leaves many disadvantaged historic districts behind (Lv, Zhang, & Ji, 1994).

3.4 Categorization of historic districts of Harbin

From the existed regulations, historical cultural districts in Harbin were statutorily protected and the elaborate investigations were done by urban planners. These 22 listed historical areas spread out over 8 administrative districts of Harbin. Each of them has a particular function and character. They will be within the main discussion as the research target. The basic attributions of each historic district are listed in Appendix 1.

3.4.1 Categories and environment analysis

Based on social function, the 22 historic districts are divided into 5 categories (see Table 3-1), which are Russian style residential districts, commercial background districts, exotic or recreation districts, religious or memorial districts and educational or official districts. Because the same categories share common functions, usage conditions and cultures, we will pay more attention on the shared information. In this way, the following research discussion will be aiming to each category instead of one by one. The categorization is clarified:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category of historic districts</th>
<th>Name of historic districts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Russian style residential districts** | • Residential area of Linen Factory  
• Residential area of Dong’an  
• Residential area of Harbin Airplane  
• Garden Street, Traditional |
| **Commercial background districts** | • Commercial streets in Daowai  
• Red Army Street to Central Museum area |
| **Exotic and recreation districts** | • Central pedestrian street  
• Sofia Church area, Stalin Park  
• Sun Island |
| **Religious and memorial districts** | • Confucian Temple,  
• Jile Temple  
• Memorial Temple, Judaic Cemetery,  
• Ma Zhongjun Graveyard  
• The Remains of the War Crimes by Unit 731 of Japanese Invading Army  
• Mr. Stone Memorial Temple  
• Binjiang Daoshu Historical and Cultural Park  
• Former Residence of Xiao Hong |
| **Educational and official districts** | • Railway Station Bureau  
• Harbin Engineering University  
• Harbin Medical University |
Multiple types of historic areas make Harbin city a cultural cluster. During the development of the city, the culture gathers and enlarges to a complex and dynamics one. These sites represent heterogeneous characters also with homogeneities in respective environments. Based on five categories, the environment characters of each are concluded in Table 3-2.

Table 3-2 Environmental characters and cultural value measurement of historic districts in Harbin

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category of historic districts</th>
<th>The environmental characters of districts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Russian style residential districts</td>
<td>Surrounding form or row-form buildings, Russian factorial background living mode, open public yard with flourish vegetation, traditional living pattern of remaining citizens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial background districts</td>
<td>Dominated by commercial environment with large flowing of people, noisy and complex atmosphere, linear streets with open public space, European style architectures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exotic and recreation districts</td>
<td>Recreation areas with diversity of architectures tendencies, from European to Ancient China style, service for visitors and travelers, dynamic flows of population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious and memorial districts</td>
<td>Either traditional Chinese style buildings, or religious areas to memorize history or person, quiet and peaceful, reminding people of the history, nice visiting places</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational and official districts</td>
<td>State owned administrative or educational locations, large buildings scales in groups and traditional Chinese styles, simplex users from administrators, retirees and students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.4.2 Basic condition of each historic district type

As each category distinguishes with the others from a basic level, they will be discussed separately. This section will introduce the background and cultural value indicators with illustrative pictures for each category.

3.4.2.1 Russian style residential districts

As one of the most important heavy industrial cities in Northeast of China, Harbin witnessed many significant developments of Russian factories in the city in middle 19th century. Benefited from these factories, Harbin contributed much to China’s economic growth. In the middle of 1990s, a few manufactories owned by Russia started being opened in Harbin which brought quite a lot of Russian people working as engineers and experts. During this period, Russian cultures were imported. These immigrants left residential areas as what we listed as residential historic districts with Russian style, which includes Residential area of Linen Factory, Residential area of Dong’an and Residential area of Harbin Airplane. As special residential areas for foreign employees of Russian factories, these districts represented the implementation of habiting theory into practices.
Table 3-3 The characters, environment sense and illustrations of Russian style residential districts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of districts</th>
<th>Cultural value indicators</th>
<th>Illustration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Residential area of Linen Factory</td>
<td>Russian Eclecticism architectures with three partials and red wall, slim and tall, arc and bay windows, old trees and quiet environment.</td>
<td><img src="image1.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential area of Dong’an</td>
<td>Originally used as air force airplane repair factory, arrayal layout architecture, continued by factory group living pattern, peaceful yard.</td>
<td><img src="image2.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential area of Harbin Airplane</td>
<td>Enclosed building groups and private constructed buildings, continued factory group living pattern, peaceful environment.</td>
<td><img src="image3.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garden Street</td>
<td>Yellow Russian buildings with yards and old trees, peaceful romantic environment.</td>
<td><img src="image4.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fortunately as Russian planned residential areas, they are constructed with basic standard living facilities. Due to community office’s efforts, the first three factory-rooted areas are under maintained especially preservations on building as seen in illustrative pictures in Table 3-3. But along with time, these facilities are out of use. And the living environment is neglected. The citizens spend most of their life in this district and the areas turn to be older and out of revitalization. This leads the attentions of commercial developers. The functionalities of the factories want to demolish this area and launch new real estate projects.

Garden Street district is covered by small scale yellow houses with classical Russian symbols. Decades ago they were used to be revolutionary leaders’ houses. Located in an important area in Harbin, they represent the city’s view and history. However, the living conditions are quite low and residents belong to low-income group. The sanitation system damages the district, the wasted water is everywhere. All the utilities wires are exposed to the open air, and people have to share public toilets. Because this area belongs to Railway Bureau which holds the coequal power as city
government, nobody can influence on this area.

3.4.2.2 Commercial background districts

Tsar people burst into Harbin for trading business in late 20th century. As a result of this event, large quantity of external people came here to earn living which also led to culture exchange in daily life. Due to convenient transportation facilities and abundant material provision, folk business started being constructed and formed a traditional trading mode in Daowai District. The businessmen imitated the Western style buildings and combine local traditions to create a new mixed style, such as Chinese decorations and parapets. A Japanese researcher Xize Tai-yin concluded this area as Chinese Baroque Building Group4.

Another district of this category is from Hongjun Street to Central Museum area which starts from the railway station to commercial center of Nangang District. It is a city welcome road with high social status. In order to memorize the victory from Soviet Russia in 1945, the name of Chorvat Road was changed into Red Army Street. The big status of Stalin was created in the square of Central Museum area.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of districts</th>
<th>Cultural value indicator</th>
<th>Illustration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional commercial streets in Daowai</td>
<td>Street culture, Chinese Baroque building style, linear visiting route, cozy and free environment.</td>
<td><img src="image1.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red Army Street - Central Museum area</td>
<td>Revolution culture, Western style buildings, modern commercial business, large flow of population</td>
<td><img src="image2.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Daowai district preservation is a controversial topic in the current years. It has too much valuable historic signs and the historic and aesthetic value is very high. Meanwhile, the living condition is quite low. Daowai district is a low-graded district corresponding to other administrative districts in Harbin. The people still keep a traditional shopping behavior such as open markets in Traditional commercial streets. The open market brings too much chaos and deterioration on the streets which people get used to. And the traditional residential yards and Hutong pattern at the periphery are in an extremely crappy condition, narrow and poor houses, damaged wooden door, lack of central heating or water system, illegal self-built auxiliary house, exposure to fire hidden troubles. The Chinese Baroque Protection movements initialized by Harbin

4 《the characteristics of contemporary architecture in Harbin》the characters of contemporary architecture in Harbin, Xize Tai-yin
government have started since 2001 but brought too many problems. Although the experts authorize to enhance the regeneration projects, violent expropriations from property developers still hurt the right of local citizens. The instruments they take on the street bring many evictions damaged too many listed historic buildings (Heilongjinag, 2011).

Red Army Street to Central Museum area is a highly intensive traffic area. It keeps too many historic buildings along the road and memory of revolution in war period. But the traffic problems and environment deteriorations are very hard to solve. Too many flow people are running private business on the streets, people discards litters on the streets, and pollution from the cars. Alongside the road, the tablets of commercial stores are out of order and out of fashion.

3.4.2.3 Exotic and Recreation districts

As the first pedestrian street of China, Central Pedestrian Street designed by Russian engineers used to be the longest walking street in Asia. More meaningfully, it covers multiple architecture types including the four most influential tendencies in architecture history: Renaissance pattern in 15th and 16th century, Baroque and Eclecticism style in 17th century, Art Nouveau from 19th to 20th century. Dynamics building styles décor the streets with deep historical and artistic value and create a great culture collection. Close to St. Sofia Church and Stalin Park, the whole area is seen as the one of the city centers of Harbin, attracting large number of visitors. Across the Songhua River, the Sun Island as another summer resort enlarges the influence of Harbin entertainment culture to a modern and natural style. The common character of these districts is that they provide the city and citizens a public romantic open space and promote the public participation in summer days.

Table 3-5 The characters, environment sense and illustrations of Exotic and Recreation districts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of districts</th>
<th>Cultural value indicator</th>
<th>Illustration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Central pedestrian street</td>
<td>Western culture, multiple architecture styles, combination of tradition and modern,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>linear visiting route, recreation and cozy atmosphere, large population.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sofia Church area</td>
<td>Religious culture and great church construction and decoration, romantic and classical</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>environment, open public space.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Stalin Park

Soviet recreation area, linear riverside green space, visiting area with romantic atmosphere.

Sun Island

Contemporary riverside recreation park, linear open space, quiet and easy.

These districts are all well-known sites, under specific planning and good maintenance, with a high usage among citizens and travelers. But they face common problems as high maintain cost, heavy traffic and high population flow, chaotic signs and advertisements. It is also common to see disrepairs on the street, the damaged paving bricks and curbs, leaflets on telegraph pole, and other street furniture. It is easy to see the street cleaners here, but also the litter-louts. Visitors sometimes will forget to protect the environment together with cleaners. As a public area in China, the massy environment is very easily to be a public problem.

The significant but not urgent problem is how to increase the local characters and get rid of unplanned advertisement signs, change the cluttered environment into pleasant to enlarge the attraction.

3.4.2.4 Religious and Memorial districts

This category includes 8 sites: Confucian Temple, Jile Temple, Binjiang Daoshu Historical and Cultural Park, Former Residence of Xiao Hong, The Remains of the War Crimes by Unit 731 of Japanese Invading Army, Judaic Cemetery, Mr. Stone Memorial Temple, and Ma Zhongjun Graveyard.

Confucian Temple was Qing Dynasty style sacred temple built in 1912. Due to its advanced technology and materials at that moment, it reflected quite much of scientific and art value. Jile Temple is Buddhism temple built in 1917 owned high social reputation and developed as one of the big 4 temples in Northeast China.

Binjiang Daoshu Historical and Cultural Park is a feudalism social system Yamum functionalized from administration to Scenic Spot. It represents a high historical value of Chinese ancient administrative system.

Former Residence of Xiaohong locates in Hulan District far from city center of Harbin. As a former residence, it is protected as a sight-seeing.

Historically, Harbin developed as the biggest business trading area in far Middle East of Jewish people. According to Jewish religious principles, Jewish people should be buried in their own graveyard after death. Therefore, Judaic Graveyard became a spiritually memorial area. Similar with Mr. Stone Memorial Temple built in 1913, which was built from bricks and concrete with Chinese empaistic decoration. Together with Ma Zhongjun Graveyard, they are preserved as three important people subject cemeteries in Harbin.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of districts</th>
<th>Cultural value indicator</th>
<th>Illustration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Confucian Temple</td>
<td>Traditional Confucius culture monumental, Chinese religious building groups, mystery and formidable environment.</td>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jile Temple</td>
<td>Buddhism culture, Chinese traditional religious buildings, visiting area, mystery and formidable environment.</td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Binjiang Daoshu Historical and Cultural Park</td>
<td>Past Yamum office building, simplicity and formal visiting area.</td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Former Residence of Xiao Hong</td>
<td>Residential yard of people subject, reminding of history and the writer Xiaohong, quiet and remote.</td>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Remains of the War Crimes by Unit 731 of Japanese Invading Army</td>
<td>Remaining of war, revolution culture, vigilant and guilty atmosphere, reminding of the war.</td>
<td><img src="image5.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Stone Memorial Temple</td>
<td>Sobriety and deep feeling of grief.</td>
<td><img src="image6.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judaic Graveyard</td>
<td>Sobriety and deep feeling of grief, exotic culture.</td>
<td><img src="image7.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma Zhongjun Graveyard</td>
<td>Sobriety and deep feeling of grief, quiet and remote.</td>
<td><img src="image8.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fortunately as travelling sites, this type of historic districts are under better maintenance and management. However, they are not highly used by local habitants but mainly for travelers. This leads to an inefficient usage, hindrance for culture expansion. The main problem is how to increase the influence of these historic sites to let more people remember what happened in the past through war-reaching, ceremony and religious culture. Without high usage, not only the investment and management on them will become a waste in future, but also the history will flow away with time.

3.4.2.5 Educational and official districts

This type contains Railway Station Bureau, Harbin Engineering University, Harbin Medical University, and Provincial Cadre Healthcare Resort. Mainly as education areas, they are composed by many traditional buildings representative for Chinese culture decades ago. And the current condition is still good enough to be used. The environment of them is quiet and well-securitized used by certain groups of people. Unlike the above cases, they are well maintained and experience less noise and depletion.

Table 3-7 The characters, environment sense and illustrations of Educational and Administrative districts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of districts</th>
<th>Cultural value indicator</th>
<th>Illustration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Railway Station Bureau</td>
<td>Official bureau, grandeur and hush</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harbin Engineering University</td>
<td>Official bureau and university buildings, Chinese traditional building style, grandeur and hush, active and lively atmosphere.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harbin Medical University</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Cadre Healthcare Resort</td>
<td>Recreation and healthcare resort, quiet and solemn yard, not public service.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These are all state-controlled bureaus concentrating on a limited group of users, therefore, the condition and environment is better than other historic districts. The buildings are under good maintenance and security. But compared to other historic districts, they provide low social value to the public. The Railway Station Bureau district covers multiple sites where some of them are used as public culture museum or cinemas. This is a good catalyzer to interact with society.

3.5 Some characters of the city compared with Europe

- Building styles and environment. Many architecture styles can be found on the streets in Harbin, Baroque, Russian, New Art, Syncretism Architecture, and Japanese Contemporary. Except for building styles, even the environment is created in a western way. In some historic areas, the streets and decorations are far escaped from Chinese traditions. In some others, they are mixed constructed with Chinese traditions. Based on these styles, the city view and structures of buildings can be comparative to European cities.

- Historic cultures spread the whole city. The western evidence of city can be noticed in public buildings like commercial streets and educational and official areas, also in residential areas, and some other functional regions. The buildings spread the whole city, both concentrative areas with these remaining, and also many single buildings left in each corner of the city.

- Religious culture. Another important similarity with European cities can be derived from religious areas, especially churches, Orthodox churches, Catholic churches, Christian churches and Judaism churches. Although China is not a religious country and the influence of religion is much weaker than Europe, the similar culture still brought comparable urban components like churches and customs in Harbin.

3.6 Conclusion of chapter 3

In this chapter, the culture background of target city, Harbin is stated. Furthermore from the development of legislation and management characteristics, we know how administrators and planners preserve historic heritages in Harbin. More specifically, a clear description of historic cultural districts of Harbin is provided. 22 statutorily listed historic districts are categorized into five types according to their functions and contributions in society:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Russian style residential districts</th>
<th>Commercial background districts</th>
<th>Exotic and recreation districts</th>
<th>Religious and memorial districts</th>
<th>Educational and official districts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

These five categories are under different levels of current usage and preservation. The first three face the most complex problems that the traditional characters are decaying although some preservation actions are ongoing. They have more social values and influences on the public than the latter two. The residential districts are under a peaceful and quiet situation but the pattern of areas are out of date. The
environment is losing attraction and the areas are tuning old. Commercial and recreation districts face more social problems like traffic and environment deterioration. They both have significant historic and aesthetic value where the valuable symbols are disappearing with economic desire. Although government and planners want to keep the revitalization and charming environment for these areas, practical and effective instruments are required. The last two categories are under better conditions due to many efforts. But they have few interactions with the public. They have special functions comparing to the formal three, therefore it is very hard to find a balance to expand their culture value.

A clear depiction of Harbin is finished, we are acquired with what does Harbin look like and what problems are faced. We are expected to be inspired to deter the historical culture declining and recover or expand the historic significance through a reasonable managerial process. Coherent with the specific explanation from this chapter, a list of issues faced by Harbin are generated waiting to be solved from European experiences:

(a) Decaying of traditional cultural value, disrepairs on decorations of historic districts, disappearance of historic symbols and historic street views, instead coming up with low-grade commercial street furniture and more environment deterioration.
(b) Cluttered environment in some historic districts, old facilities need improvement or removal.
(c) Illegal self-built houses attached to historic buildings or yards which impact on traditional street view.
(d) Illegal violent eviction and expropriation intervenes in the legislation and hurts the right of citizens.
(e) Hard to constitute detailed but practical planning instruments to guide the citizens and relevant participants to improve the current condition.
(f) Traffic problems and passenger flows increase the safety risks and determinate environment quality especially facing increasing private cars in the city.
(g) Some historic public places attract few people visiting, leading to a waste of resources.
(h) Due to large cost of preservation movement, a big lack of financial support facing by government which leads to interruption of preservation projects. Money mainly provided by government which is already limited, no external investments from social organizations involved.
(i) Too strong influence from top-down process, lack of participation from the public.
(j) More influence from the government and private developers than the public and other NGOs, lack of supervision from mass media, less transparence and fairness in projects
(k) The communities in the residential districts are aging and lack fresh blood.
Chapter 4 European lesson analysis

In Europe, most cities used to face or are facing historic preservation difficulties and achievements. And many of them have found a balance in city preservation and modernization. A mass of cities can set some good examples for lesson drawing. Our attention locates at those which contain many historical elements on the public areas instead of private or single buildings, used to face conflicts of modernized and conserved development, and involve social controversial decisions. Furthermore, the historical significance should bear universal values but not extraordinary, like Gaudi’s Barcelona. Obviously, many proper examples in Europe are worth to be studied, such as France, Germany, Italian cities and UK and so on. But due to time and material barriers, this research will focus on two cases since they are very pertinent for Harbin, England streets protection and Jordaan district in Amsterdam. Both of them can meet out general requirements and they can represent many other cities with related experiences. They aim at providing some inspirations on how European cities enhance to preserve historical values in commercial, recreation and residential districts.

The England case started in 2004, and spreads from historic streets to all streets with valuable elements to preserve. It shows a tendency that the ultimate goal of historic preservation is to enhance the quality of city environment, therefore the strategy of conservation will start from a specific historic site spreading out to the surrounding areas and the whole region, as England case does. The Amsterdam case seems a bit old which happened 40 years ago but the final effect is positive and it attracts much praise from experts and citizens until today. In both cases, it can be seen with many effective operational instruments on how to implement the renewal movement. Furthermore, both cases present possible planning mechanisms which can help Harbin solve operational, financial and coordination problems.

The following case studies will integrate with inspiration phase where “Where to look for lessons” and “Finding out how a programme really works there” steps will be done. Firstly, a brief introduction of what happened and why the historic preservation is needed there will be given. Next, the summary of operational instruments is generated by the author. Last but not least, the generic lessons based on the pros and cons of operational instruments will be analyzed.

To be supplemental, no further cases are provided for memorial districts and educational, official districts in this research. The first reason is that these two types of districts in Harbin are still under well condition. State owned organizations are taking care of them and the environment has been well maintained. Therefore, it is not particularly or urgently under the objective of this research. Another reason is the time limitation that the scope of this research keeps these two types out of periphery.

4.1 Case 1 -- Street Preservation Campaign, England

4.1.1 Introduction of the case

In England, conservation is always a popular topic in the city development. The
country also achieved a lot in this field. Up to 2009, approximately 10,000 conservation areas including streets and buildings have been listed in England (MacCullagh, 2009). Preservation does not mean to freeze the old remaining forever. Since 30 decades ago, both conservationists and urban planners realized that it was quite futile if only save on physical aspects of heritage architectures without economics and social consideration (Appleyard, 1979). An adaptive preservation is to accommodate to the temporary technology and economic development of cities and enhance the usage quality for people.

Here is a practical case started since 2004 in England. By then, the population in England has been 50.09 million, and it gradually increased to 50.43m in 2005, 50.76m in 2006, 51.1m in 2007 and 51.46m in 2008. English people started realizing that their streets were losing local distinctiveness and historical characters. It was found that the streets were turning cluttered with unsightly traffics signs, utility facilities, specifically suffering from the blighted paving conditions, redundant signposts or breakage curbs. The quality of streets is declining among all the regions in England. If no actions to turn over this trend, not alone historical characters will disappear, other fine elements will vanish one day. Immediately, English Heritage organization with other social groups started taking actions to hold back this tendency.

It is one part of transport system protections initiated by English Heritage. Because they believe that the transport system may influence on historic environment by either positive or negative ways. Therefore, they engage in this domain at an early stage to do the impact assessment on new proposals and enhance historic environment. Besides, they cooperate with government policy makers in deciding transport policies and strategies to preserve the historic environment.

The objectives of this national wide street protection campaign root from cleaning up clutters on the streets and open spaces, recovering historic street furniture, reinforcing the cultural values of streets in England, to make the English streets and open spaces different from others and reflects local historical characters, furthermore spread to all over the country to provide a tidy, enjoyable public realm to thrive communities.

The holistic England regional street management was based on 9 administrative regions (see Figure 4): London, East of England, East Midlands, West Midlands, Northeast, Northwest, Southeast, Southwest, and Yorkshire with the Humber region. Based on localities and contexts, the implements and objectives differ from each other. However, the basic guideline of

---

The discoveries are proposed on: http://www.english-heritage.org.uk/caring/save-our-streets/
street management is integrated structured from five aspects: Ground surface, Street Furniture, Equipments, Traffic, and Environment conditions. Each guideline can be found on official website of English Heritage. But the common characters and unique conditions of streets and open spaces in these regions are summarized as followed (English Heritage, 2006):

- **London region:** The appearance of London’s public spaces is successful to be a world city. However, the management standard is at low level. If the street management cannot reach a higher requirement, the status of London will be impacted and a large economic cost may occur in future.
- **The East Midlands region:** The quality and characters of this region is diversified from each other. Streets are quiet and the identification of streets is clarified by local regional development agency in order to enhance the prosperity and quality.
- **West Midlands, East of England, South East, and North East regions:** There are many historic towns and villages in these regions. The local identification will be fostered from the protection of the local distinctiveness. Also, organizers believe that the economic success will be generated by well-management streets.
- **The South West region:** The brilliant landscapes and architectures in coastal zones and historic villages will be taken into consideration. Cooperating with Regional Assembly and the South West Regional Development Agency, the valuable historic streets and public spaces, rural byways are expected to be improved.
- **North West region:** Some world well-known cities are in this region. In these cities, the focus is to stimulate the regeneration initiatives and vitalizations through recover of streets.
- **Yorkshire and the Humber region:** The streets and open spaces differ largely. In some significant cities, the quality of streets is positive and even can stimulate the local economic. But in some villages, the conflicts arise between local citizens and tourists.

**4.1.2 Operational instruments**

Two steps are designed to carry on the streets preservation movement. One is to get participation and feedbacks from the citizens. The next one is to take operations on each street.

The first step is an awareness-campaign to conduct a street audit in order to deliver to councilors about what people find unsatisfactory on the streets. It is believed that when the councilors receive sufficient audit applications, the awareness will be raised. The second step is to compose “Streets for All” manuals which provide practical instructions on how to improve the visual quality on the streets detailed. These approaches get cooperation from local people and organizations to join in the protection and are leading into a positive effect. Specifically, the content of the campaign is delineated as Table 4-1:

---

6 Nine manuals can be found on webpage of English Heritage.
### Table 4-1 Planning instruments of English Street Preservation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step 1</th>
<th>Participations</th>
<th>Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Street audit campaign (App. 3)</td>
<td>Scouts and youth groups, Normal citizens, School students &amp; teachers, Local councils, English Heritage, Press, Others:  - Campaign to Protect Rural England (CPRE)  - Living Streets  - Civic Voice</td>
<td>• Based on what you find about the streets, fill in the audit form to reflect the unsatisfied conditions to local councilors (the more reflection, the more pressures on administrative organization)  • Fill in the audit form to reflect what is it on street  • Send it to councilor  • Wait and see</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Step 2 | Operational guidance | See above. | • Ground surface  • Street Furniture  • Equipments  • Traffic  • Environment |

| Eg. | Signposts Protect Above, Dep. Of Transportation Highways Engineer | • Remove the redundant parts,  • Repairing and retain existing signposts,  • Reintroduce & spread to appropriate roads |

| Value of campaign | —— | • Attraction for tourists;  • Icons as local identity;  • Local character of community;  • Sense of place and local identity, which increase community well-being. |

| Funding | Part of maintenance bid in local Transport Plan; Local Heritage Institute; Heritage Lottery Fund and Nationwide Building Society. | —— |

In step 2- operational guidance, the meaning and particular guidance are designed:

**Ground surface**: the quality of streets is mainly determined by the paving design and constructions. It represents the essential character of an area where the buildings and street scene is seen.

Operational actions:
- Input the ground surface to a regional context;
- Keep simple and assort the color with the street style;
- Maintain and restore the historical details according to tradition.

**Street Furniture**: less is more. Keep the amount of street furniture as less as possible to enhance the sense of vision.

Operational actions:
Preserve the historical items with local characters, while removing the redundant street furniture;
Reduce the size of signage, place signs on existing constructions like lamp-posts or buildings;
Unify all signs in a dark color;
Minimize and redesign the rails traditionally;
Replace un-distinctive lightings and design appropriate to the historic areas;
Reduce the bollards or redesign them according to a local style.
**Traffic:** although originated from regional traffic planning, fit it into the street scene.
Operational actions:
Road materials should be traditional and from local;
Take surrounding roads into consideration.
**Environment management:** intensify the local characteristics and maintain the cultural values. Still minimal approaches are successful in enhancing a sense of place for citizens.
Operational actions:
Work on townscape planning to recognize the visual, spatial and historical significance of an area;
Stick formal design to formal spaces like square in front of administrative bureau informal spaces follow functional tradition like commercial streets along with stores;
Ensure regular management and maintenance checking.

These are very instructive and elaborate procedures on how to take actions. The operation work is designed by experts and administrators under a lot of efforts. With this instruction, the street management makes a big progress.

### 4.1.3 Generic lessons from Case 1

We prepare to analyze the benefits and drawbacks of preservation operation process of case 1 to see if the summary of it can contribute to improve the operation process of Harbin.

#### 4.1.3.1 Pros of Case 1

1. **Realization on the significance of local characters and communal value.** The decaying of local characters and the loss of attractions easily happens in a historic area. But the more important is able to realize that it is happening and try to halt it. English Heritage realized it and started taking actions to reverse the historic loss. This motivation and consciousness is initially to preserve historic values.
2. **A clear guidance to help operators identify all possible historic values.** Presevators work on detailed possibilities on the street components and give a guidance to recognize them, with general principles for the whole region including, ground surface, equipment, traffic and environmental improvements. Additionally, other street furniture as advertisement signs, store tablets, dustbins, and coaches also draw attention. They realize that if they want to invite the citizens who are not experts on preservation
or planning, clear examples are easier to illustrate to what content you should keep your eyes on. This detailed hard work is important to make the street preservation movement recognizable and practical. The instructive manuals are designed on a comprehensive level for each region.

(3) Interactivity with public is another merit of this movement. The street qualities and capability to provide pleasure is a benefit for local citizens. Therefore, the reflection and judgment from the users as first hand material can directly increase the assessment of street utility. This movement shows sufficient respect and trust in citizens and inspires them to collaborate in finding where needs an improvement to stimulate the project and ensure the working efficiency.

(4) Multiple-organization collaboration ensures the transparency and fairness of process. Under the effort of English Heritage, many organizations are involved in this movement, Scouts and youth groups, Normal citizens, School students and teachers, Local councils, English Heritage, Press, and Campaign to Protect Rural England (CPRE), Living Streets, and Civic Voice. School students are encouraged to participate in terms of group. Because they and young people are willing to join in social activities, invitation for them is an easier starting. The local media is essential to supervise the process and announce the audit ending.

(5) Coordination with transportation department. Since it is a movement aiming to streets in England, traffic problem is inevitable. The personnel work with Department of Transportation (DOT) and Highways Engineer in order to receive their cooperation to solve the possible traffic problems or to reduce the traffic load in certain streets. The security problem on streets is another one needing to be taken care by DOT. To preserve the characters of a historic street and to improve the environment is not only the work on physical components, but also the function of each element.

(6) Financial support from external organizations. English Heritage is a non-government and non-profit organization. And the protection covering such large scale will definitely cost much which English Heritage cannot afford. Since it involves many other organizations, the idea is to attract investments from them, including Part of maintenance bid from local Transport Plan, Local Heritage Institutional and Heritage Lottery Fund and Nationwide Building Society.

(7) From historic value spreading to larger scale. Now it is developed as a national wide movement covering all the public streets, originally it was initialized from historic streets aiming to retain the tendency of historic characters loss. This is a strategic development in social affairs. To protect current merits expect for historic values, is to remain cultural value in a long time for the next generations. Therefore, another benefit of English Street Preservation is to keep all valuables for future.

4.1.3.2 Cons of Case 1

This movement started in 2004 and gradually finished in 2011. For the past 8 years, it has achieved much progress. However, no policy or project can perfectly achieve people’s commends. Some faults are induced from this process to caution the policy makers in Harbin.
(1) **Hard accessibility facing large scale.** Although it aimed at historic streets at first, a heavy workload was increased. Then the project spread to all the streets across the country. It is hard to imagine how much workload will be facing such big scale which means it will cost too much labor and attention.

(2) **Long time mechanism.** Reparation and saving needs the reflection from citizens’ street audit, then take actions according to guiding manuals. It is definitely a long time process after which the effects can be seen. In order to ensure the utility, supervision from both citizens and mass media is necessary. For the fairness from supervision and respect for participants, the disadvantage of mechanism cannot be improved easily.

(3) **Complexity from details.** As a campaign from public participants, the staffs have to face and answer the public every day. This face-to-face work increases the complexity. Moreover, the work is broken down into a particular level following operation manual including all type of street components. Too much detailed work causes a complexity for both office staff and operators on site.

(4) **Possible ineffective reflections from public.** Many misunderstandings of street facts will lead the public to propose default complaints. For example, a common perception is that “Standardized road signs are essential”. Actually, the standardized signs are likely to control drivers on motorways. But for streets in a historic city center, a traditional sign with local characters enhances the drivers’ attention while a very good symbol to identify a sense of place.

4.2 Case 2 -- Jordaan Residential Area, Amsterdam

4.2.1 **Introduction of the case**

The inner city of Amsterdam is one of the largest historic city centers within Europe. The image of this region is about the well-known half-circle-shaped canal covering over 7 thousands of listed monuments with significant historical value. But in postwar period, “demolition and new development” conflicted with “preservation and restoration” (Deben, Salet, & van Thoor, 2004). Many traditional heritage sites were facing demolition because of their bad conditions, such as the bank building on Vijzelstraat, the Nieuwmarktbuurt, de Pinto house and Jordaan. Within a period, most of the development was new, and all the historic areas were under the risk of disappearing. Fortunately, a large number of citizens in Amsterdam bombarded the city council with indignant petitions which was signed by thousands. This campaign compelled the government to reconsider about the city development.

---

The information largely comes from Appleyard (Appleyard, 1979) and Leon Deben et al (Deben, Salet, & van Thoor, 2004).
Jordaan case is one of these retrievals. Jordaan area locates on the northwest side of city center along the canal (see Figure 5). Although the canal region was well planned, the Jordaan district was developed without any artificial intervention. It was developed by human farmland and long time walking and ditching system. In the past, rich people like businessmen owned this land and rented it out to elderly women as charity. Also the servants of businessmen and immigrants lived here. Later inhabitants in the past decades were mainly among low to middle income group, such like elderly people, widows, singles, artists, students.

This region used to contain quite intensive density of houses and extraordinarily large population. According to some statistics, in the middle of 19th century, the population was 54,000 and fast increased to over 83,000 in late of 19th century. This tendency had changed afterwards since city extension. People found living space on the periphery of city center. In late of 1975, although only around 20,000 people left, they were provided with small part of floor space as living place which was a quite intensive with 126 living houses per ha.

A characteristic of this area was that it contained large number of count-yards as public space for family. After the city expansion in late of 19th century, small scale of business commenced. With the growth of small industries, businessmen did not care about the habitants’ living condition. The count-yards were filled with sheds and wasted materials. In order to solve the insufficiency of living, people built many private buildings in the yards. Due to the lack of maintenance and carelessness, the land, housings and living facilities decayed.

Originally, the civil servants indulged the deterioration deliberately and intended to re-plan this district through demolishing all the old, crappy houses to build new ones. However in 1961, the monument law was established so that many buildings in Jordaan district were jurally pointed to protect. Under the protection of law, Jordaan district improved as a historic area which was not what the city development bureau wanted. In order to rebuild this district, an old planning in 1969 was introduced by city council to replace traditional environment with modern style containing traffic corridors, parking systems, public spaces and low cost properties. Resistance from monument conservators and local inhabitants came up so that the housing department’s initial plan to do demolishment aiming to certain areas was rejected by different parties. It was refused as it damaged historical values of surroundings and deteriorated the architectural harmony. Also the rent of land would raise a lot after modernization.

Before the zoning plan was analyzed, a list of status quo antes of Jordaan district is summed up:

(1) Environment condition: It is a postwar remaining district with bad conditions. Figure 5 The site view of Jordaan district
environment condition and high resident density among low-income group of citizens. The buildings and facilities are in decaying condition.

(2) Historical value: It is a very special city fabric, half-circle shape canal in city center of Amsterdam including 7000 listed monuments. The preserved buildings in Jordaan cover half of all buildings in this region. The street view is very typical, as the street is narrow and the houses are

(3) Detail ornament: Abundance of historical meaningful decorations is left due to long history, such as T-shape sash windows, hoist beams, race curtains.

(4) Traditional open yard: large volume of open yards in different shapes, cozy atmosphere was not any more leaving large amount of illegally built backhouses and sheds with wasted materials.

(5) Traffic condition: The whole region is a small city scale with narrow but long streets. The traffic condition is highly limited. The lack of accessibility makes it impossible for modern mobility and the increased traffic demand. The main traffic method is motorbike (see Figure 6).

These elements turn Jordaan district as a conflicted area that many problems still exist which may influence on people’s life. The old plan of renovation and renewal was rejected by public parties. However after 30 years, this region developed as a well-known traditional residential historic district and attracts many visitors each year. Currently, it is served for artists, students, elderly people, young professionals and entrepreneurs and the population stays at 20 thousand since 1970s till now.

4.2.2 Operational instruments

After the new round of national election, the new councilor Han Lammers withdrew the old plan and conducted a new land use plan for 1972. This was a legal zoning plan for conservation and convalescence of this district. Nevertheless, most of the constructions and preservations were still city renewal type as the preservation launched theoretically. With the fund from the state, many were demolished and replaced with new housing. Still, the new buildings aliened with the traditional type.

The Jordaan district is 900 ha big which was hard to manage. A zoning plan was introduced divide the area into three sections. North Jordaan covering 5/8 of the area functionalized as inhabitation. This part also contained more historic heritage than the
others. South Jordaan is 1/8 of the total and was used as business area thus negatively
influenced on the small scale of the region. Geographically near to city center, it was
dictated as business, offices with dwellings. The 3rd section was Marnixstraat. This
section contained no historical value and was in a bad using condition.

The new plan would preserve the traditional street and canal patterns, and the
newly built houses would consist to the old style. The original habitants would be kept
and taken care of. Facing the largest concentration of housing, improvements of the
living facilities and urban services were important. Additionally, no traffic or parking
system improvement was allowed just to keep the street scale in a smaller size. At that
moment, this plan made a lot of efforts respecting to preserving the historic values as a
residential area. The specific instruments are as followed:

1. To be functionalized as residential area, renew or change facilities to attract
people who moving out of the area.
2. To provide primary accommodations, ensure 2.2 rooms per household (under
the average room number of household at that moment was 3.3).
3. To recognize and preserve historic value, like to keep street pattern and views,
to keep canals system. The front lines of building are fixed. Even when the
inner house has to be changed, the facades will still be preserved to align the
street view.
4. Clean the house yards and maintain the open space, recover green space.
5. Due to the shortage of living spaces, to switch one layer of commercial spaces
of the buildings into inhabitancy.
6. Remain the street pattern and view as old structure and material, merge some
small blocks.
7. No improvement for traffic system and parking system to keep the small street
scale. All the improvements of traffic condition is to make it convenient for
local motorbike users.

The above operational instruments show how to keep the historic characters in this
region, how to recover the living conditions in this area and make strategy to preserve
the area. It is mainly from planning view to guide the operators.

4.2.3 Generic lessons from case 2

Similarly, the pros and cons of operation process of case 2 will be delineated to
help us avoid the possible threats.

4.2.3.1 Pros of case 2

1. Remaining of local characters against the accessibility of commercials. The new
plan identifies what the local characters and valuable symbols or decorations will be
damaged by commercial entries. The main point is to protect these symbols even
enlarging their existence. This realization reserves the decaying heritage value of this
region and keeps the sense of place and memory of habitants.
2. Living standard improvement. Along with time, many facilities run out of use. To
ensure the quality of living and satisfy the habitants, they are removed and sufficient
facilities are provided.
(3) **Strong power from public.** If the local citizens did not protest the initial plan from government, this area would be replaced by a large commercial area and no historic cultures were left anymore. Dutch people’s strong consciousness and reorganization on historic value and sense of belonging facing history led a bottom-up pattern of protection on heritage. The public involving citizens, workmen and house owners participated negotiated and cooperated with central authorities and city officials. This type of public participation works well under a background of thoughts from the citizens on fairness, freedom and democracy.

(4) **Rejection of transportation improvement.** Respect for the fabric of this district, the narrow streets and intensively arranged buildings, the traffic accessibility are quite low. However, the transportation condition is never very good because if it is improved, more open area must be required which will impact the traditional street view and of living. Therefore, traffic will decrease the quality of living environment.

(5) **Financial support from central administration.** Urban renewal projects cost a lot of money. The preservation of monuments was more than 3% than building a new house. It was calculated that the cost of all preservation are 3-4times of new construction. If at the meanwhile, the final houses were still servicing for low-income group of people, the subsidization from central government helped to release the burden. The solution of this finance problem was that 68% of building cost was provided by Cultural Affairs and Ministry of Housing and Planning. Although not adequate, it still solved a big part of problem.

4.2.3.2 Cons of case 2

(1) **Wrong perception of policy makers almost brought disaster beyond redemption.** The city council initialed to regenerate this area into a commercial area and large modern buildings removing the residential functions. In this way, all the traditional living patterns and views would disappear. Therefore, an incorrect perception of policy maker is easy to leave impacts beyond retrieve.

(2) **Some historical culture values disappear forever.** There is barely perfect planning without bringing sacrifice. During the process, some typical characters are abandoned, such as (see Figure 7):

- Lamp-shade store with local traditional sign closed;
- An annual festivals popular starting in 1950s disappeared since 1997;
- The wooden door linking to café in late 1970s and early 1980s (Li N. , 2007).

Figure 7 The pictures of lost traditions
(3) **Hard to solve traffic problem.** Decided not to improve the transportation system in this area means to sacrifice the accessibility for people living nearby. Especially with the importance of vehicle, the lack of parking system and road availability will reduce the attraction of new potential tenants.

### 4.3 Conclusion of chapter 4

This chapter illustrated two cases in England region and Amsterdam. Firstly, the introduction of the preservation project was introduced. In both cases, it was found that the living quality is decaying and the traditional characters are losing. This raised people to start rescuing movement. With that, the planning instruments are interpreted clearly. Furthermore, the generic lessons were indicated after case explication. There are some similarities in these cases. Firstly, public participation takes an important role in the whole process. Jordaan preservation was directly influenced by public, and England streets preservation was coordinated with public group. Secondly, in both cases, money gap was a problem and they both received investments from other parties. Thirdly, there are multiple organizations involving in the project which provided diversity aids and recourses. These three items will be talked more in the following chapters.

Although the cases are mainly aiming to provide inspirations specifically on residential, commercial and recreation functions, their experiences can still spread to a wider range in city’s historic districts in Harbin. The transplantation analysis will be guided in Chapter 5.
Chapter 5 Implementation analysis of lessons and model design

Chapter 5 is following step 5 of Rose (2005) – “Turning anecdotes into a model”, the lessons from the cases are analyzed and will be contextualize into Harbin. However before all the analysis, an assessment of if the case is compatible should be done in order to check if the case is selected properly. For a comprehensive lesson-drawing, both differences and similarities are recommended to be strongly considered to determine the successful elements of donor side transferred into importer side (Spaan & Louw, 2009). The comparability analysis is used to check how much shared information the case and Harbin share, and if the contexts are similar.

After that, the applicable variables following the framework of model design given in 2.3.3 section generated from the case will be used as input of conceptual model. In conceptual model, the input variables include operational level - guidance of operation, regular ways of working, and policy level - supervision in process, funding and multi-organizational coordination. We need to put all these elements into “research activity box” in terms of applicability analysis to see how they worked in England. Later on, the mechanisms from conceptual model will be generated.

Then we enter into step-6 of Rose (2005) – “Drawing a lesson”. If they need to be imported to Harbin, the suggestions should combine the local context. According to Rose (2005), there are seven alternative ways of drawing a lesson: photocopying, copying, adaptation, hybrid, synthesis, disciplined inspiration, and selective imitation.

- **Photocopying** is to the most extent copy the original institutions.
- **Copying** duplicates most of the original programme for adopter.
- **Adaptation** as a simplest formation lists specific details with corresponding towards Harbin which will be applied into design model;
- **Hybrid** applies compatible elements generated from the exporting country to the regulation and facts of importing country with the same objective;
- **Synthesis** identifies familiar elements from exporters and adjusts them to find a proper combination with the same objective. If something should be changed, no new elements will be introduced but the existing ones will be fixed;
- **Disciplined inspiration** based on the inspiration from the foreign experience analysis finds desirable or compelling solutions to consistent with example.
- **Selective imitation** accepts the most interesting but not essential part while abandoning clumsy but essential parts. (Rose, 2005).

From the content of these alternatives, it can be judged that the difficulty and complexity of implementing gradually accelerates from the first to later. Photocopying, copying and adaptation which can be seen in one category are relatively easier because the external policies can just be taken in with less changing. Hybrid and synthesis from the second category analyze the foreign experiences and try to abstract their essence collaborating with local familiar recourses. Inspiration and imitation are inspired by the experiences that policy makers can take a new way or only interesting segments to reach the same objective, which is more integrated.
One of these alternatives will be selected as reference to contextualize each of the programmes into Harbin. The measurement to selective alternative for each suggestion mainly depends on that the suggestion is technical related or policy related. For a technical but not policy task, the first three alternatives can be used that they just need the effort from the experts to make guidance. Adaptation is decided by the complexity of operational workings. For a policy related task, the reasoning of judging a specific alternative is to see if there are original recourses in Harbin which can be taken advantages of to enhance the suggestions. If so, hybrid or imitation is used. Synthesis or inspiration is because it is very hard to transfer the instruments, but the local recourses can be used to reach the same objective.

5.1 Comparability analysis and model design

5.1.1 Comparability of case 1 and Harbin context

Due to the same functionality, case 1 of English streets preservation refers to Commercial Background Districts and Exotic and Recreation Districts. Based on the case selection criteria from 2.4.1 section, the indicators of ideological compatibility and similarities in resources are specifically defined (see Table 5-1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case in England</th>
<th>Districts in Harbin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Selection criteria</strong></td>
<td><strong>The Streets</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Common issues</strong></td>
<td>Dumping ground for superfluous signposts, Unnecessary bollards, poles, guardrails, Cluttered utility facilities, Poor child security on streets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Current problems</strong></td>
<td>Pleasant places to be, Good street design and enjoyable public spaces, Reinforcing local character</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Consentient objectives</strong></td>
<td>Linear street, Public space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ideological compatibility</strong></td>
<td>Discouragement for cyclists and pedestrians</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Common issues: the case 1 was facing the similar issues on the public streets as that in Harbin. This determines that the case study targets to solve these issues.

**Current problems:** these three cases face a set of common issues including the decaying conditions in the streets or open spaces which influencing on the safety aspect, the landscape view. Secondly, a lack of money deters to preserve and improve the districts. Additionally, in the districts preservation in Harbin, there is less involvement from the public in the regular working process. Therefore, unfairness in implementation such as violent eviction is can be seen not occasionally.

- Consentient objectives

**Objectives of movement:** The objective of English street is to improve the quality and return a pleasant condition for users which is applicable to Harbin. This is a core approval for case selection.

- “Ideological Compatibility” principle sets indicators as:

  **Space fabric:** They are all public space while hereinto the streets are all linear.

  **Traffic environment:** For most public streets, traffic problem is always the main issue. As at that moment, English people were discouraged by using streets due to the cluttered condition and driving environment was also declined. The same happens to in Harbin. Due to the report of Northeast News of China in 2010\(^8\), the number of auto mobile was increased 400 per day which would go over millions within 3 years. Along with such growth of cars in the city, amount of traffic congestions has increased severely. Some of districts from Exotic and Recreation Districts is walking street. But the traffic pressure on the minor streets is higher. Additionally, the population flow on these districts becomes bigger and brings much conflict to traffic problem. With the lack of traffic control facilities, the congestion is very common in these two Districts.

---

\( ^8 \) [http://heilongjiang.dbw.cn/system/2010/09/22/052738903.shtml]
**Used-to-be attractions**: Heritage buildings attract people and provide a good sense of place in all three situations while in England, museums and parks are more often to see, but in Harbin it is either commercial environment or place with entertainments. The basic feeling is different, while the first one has educational value and more quiet.

- “Similarities in Resources” principle sets indicators as:

**Target users**: All of the three sites are served for local citizens as public space. For streets in England and districts in commercial areas in Harbin, drivers will use the roads. In recreation areas in Harbin, as a visiting place, more travelers than no drivers on the site but traffic can be seen outside the sites.

**Interactive mode**: In England, democracy society brought a bottom-up mode is dominant thus the distances between governors and local people are short. However in China the whole society is top-down mode, where the same happens to Harbin.

**Who is in charge of the site**: The local government takes care of the condition and usage of the public streets and areas where in Harbin commercial bureau is another administrator.

**If lack of money for maintenance**: All three cases are in need of investments to maintain the street conditions. Only expecting the government, the lack of money will be hard to fill in.

**Land use legislation**: These areas are all stated owned.

This comparison aims at firstly finding suitability of case study, then to judge the degree of success of this translation. From the compatibility comparison, the basic background of case 1 and relevant districts in Harbin is in common. The differences derived from the function and locality will not influence on compatibility. From resources comparison, except for the interactive mode, the other indicators share a lot. This strengthens the successful elements of learning process. But interactive mode of society due to the legislation root of China will be a detrimental aspect to impel the process. In conclusion, the case is selected according to the characters of Harbin which provides reasonable and convincing evidence.

### 5.1.2 Generic model drawn from case 1

After comparison of elements between case 1 and Harbin, we conclude that they have many common characteristics and it is capable to share or exchange information to influence the other.

In the research activities of conceptual model, the specific instrument indicators from each input variable generated from case 1 will be put together to see if they can solve proper issues for Harbin. They will be analyzed through applicability analysis expected to come up with a set of useful mechanisms.
In the research box, the applicability can help to analyze how each input variable deducted from the case solves Harbin issues in the following table. Each variable will be detailed into several indicators as examples to elaborate how they solve the issues for Harbin (in Table 5-2). Solvency level is judged by ✓ or ✗. The number of tick depends on how many issues from 3.6 section can be solved to how much degree by each indicator. If it effects negatively on the situation, then a cross sign is installed. The serial numbers of resolvable issues is given in the third column while how to take use of this indicator instrument will be summarized in the last column.

**Table 5-2 Applicability analysis of research activities into Harbin context**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applicable variable (deducted from case)</th>
<th>Applicability (✓/✗)</th>
<th>Resolvable issues</th>
<th>Why it resolves the issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guidance of operation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detailed instructive guide</td>
<td>✓ ✓ ✓</td>
<td>a, b, c, e</td>
<td>Comprehensive expertise instruction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removal for redundant elements on streets</td>
<td>✓ ✓ ✓</td>
<td>a, b, c</td>
<td>Delete old and non-valuable street furniture to recover better street view.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Big labor amount</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>a, b, c</td>
<td>Ensure the workload.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detailed jobs for operators</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large scale of working</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>a, b, c</td>
<td>Increase the quality and effect of working</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long time persistence</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>a, g</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Regular ways of working**

| Public participation | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | d, i, j | Increase the participation of public to reduce the influence of government and make the process desirable and fair. |
| More attention on public users | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | d, i, j | Increase the participation of public, so more people know the historic districts. |

**Policy instruments**

| Accessibility to government | ✓ | d, i | Include the voice from public and break government monopoly. |
| Fairness and transparency | ✓ | ✓ | d, j | Prevent violent evictions or other damages happened in power leaning. |
| Mass media supervision | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | d, g, j | Supervise the decision making and construction process and expose the unfairness to gain pressure. |

**Funding**

| Financial investment from other Organizations | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | h, j | Gain money from multiple channels and involve the investors in the process. |

**Multi-organizational coordination**

| Work with traffic planning | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | f | Solve the traffic problem via a professional and legal way. |
| Collaboration with other Organizations | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | d, g, i, j | Increase the capability and contribution on preservation process, increase stakeholder to break monopolistic power. |

**Guidance of operation:** issue a, b and c can be mainly solved by these indicators because English agencies take a specific and hard work which will increase a lot of burden but will ensure the quality of action.

An elaborate instruction is helpful to guide the operators to deal with historic districts. Due to lack of knowledge, incorrect protects methods or procedures not only waste energy and money, but also easily lead to improper consequences. However, a detailed instruction needs careful and hard work based on expertise and specific investigation from in historic districts.

Meanwhile, the clear guidance tells citizens how to protect the traditional cultural
elements in their private yards and illegal self-built houses can be constrained. When the redundant street furniture is confirmed by operators, they will be removed and new ones will be introduced if necessary. These redundant elements distinctly include the illegal self-built houses referring issue c.

However, some further problems can be brought from detailed guidance. It will bring much burden to operators but ensures the job quality. And operators need to be educated before taking actions then ensure the job quality. It covers a large area to ensure the job quality and effect. Long time working is easier to cover the whole range and increase the reputation of districts in order to ensure the job quality-issue a, and to acknowledge people about historic districts.

**Regular ways of working**: issue d and j will be solved by most of this variable.

This is a popular working mechanism in Europe and it is even legally regulated to use in social construction projects. But in Chinese society, top-down process halts the democracy and hides much public voices. To get first hand information what the citizens need and reach their requirements is to increase the public’s satisfaction degree and social welfare. To ask for advices and feedback via public audit, hearing conference, from the public can collect the first hand information what the society want. If governors allow adding it as a step of historic preservation projects, the public can make more contributions which solves issue i.

**Supervisory in process**: When the public wants to reflect to the administrators, their voice not only represents their own interest, but a group’s so it needs to be taken seriously. It also stimulates the public to participate in the decision making process thus issue d and i will be solved. Much unfairness occurs during the preservation project process such as violent expropriation and eviction. The fairness and transparency is really required. They help to prevent violent evictions and damages happened in power leaning, and gain the trust from the public referring issue d and j. Mass media supervises the decision making and construction process. So they will expose the unfairness to create pressure referring issue d and j. It also acquires more people about the unknown historic districts as issue g.

**Funding**: Gain money from multiple channels such as commercial companies, rich individuals or citizen donors increase the possibilities of money collection-issue h, and involve the investors in the process-issue j.

**Collaboration with other Organizations**: In the past time, not too much cooperation is set up between governments or commercial agencies and the organizations in the society like volunteer group, enterprises, educational institution or others. But historic preservation is a social event of social welfare. It is reasonable that more organizations coordinate. In this way, increase the capability and contribution on preservation process, increase number of stakeholders to break monopolistic power-issue and to ensure the fairness of decision making process. The collaboration will help to solve issue d, g and j.

From this analysis, case 1 is capable to solve most of the issues Harbin is facing.
where some of the instruments are strong in solving a common set of problems which have three tick signs. The closer the exporting model to importing context, the more extent the lesson is based (Rose, 2001). Due to the correspondence with the model of foreign practice, it is convinced that it should be transferred into Harbin.

5.1.3 Organizational mechanisms generated from case 1

This case is not a specific one working on a certain historic street. But it aims at enhancing preservation projects in order to improve the quality of all public realms in terms of streets and open spaces. The movement process is workable and valuable. More importantly, some management mechanisms occurring in the process will be quite instructive and inspiring for Harbin. Therefore, the output organizational mechanisms of this case study research are given.

(1) Considerable operational guidance: Street management should identify and protect the existing historical details through urban design and conservation planning. With the benefit of these specific manuals, each aspect related to street quality is under instructions and people have clue to follow. The further education and urban design awareness for traffic personnel so that they can guarantee the best of daily practices according to the instructions. This no doubt increases the success of practical preservation.

(2) Public participation mechanism: Public participation represents the public interests and is more likely to implement the street system in an optimistic circle. Based on English democracy, the hierarchy system is not strong. It is accessible for public to talk to administrative bureau. A closer relationship between the citizens and the councilors is set up in this campaign. This activity spreads among the public citizens cooperating with state owned organization. This social activity requires a long time process in more open social system. In this way, the citizens have more freedom and are encouraged to participate.

(3) Financial mechanism: Investment in public industry like street quality enlarges the value of money. But financial investment sometimes is hard to generate from government, but more likely and feasible to get through other civic organizations. Collaborating with organizations with financial power, coherent the cultural value of streets to their interests, is a strategic method to bind the possible sponsors. Facing limited resources, minimal approach while ensuring high standard is a practical and efficient way. All investments give priority to maintenance working. Investment in public realm is another key to ensure the audit event and increase the people’s sense of obligation thus they are likely to contribute more to the environmental quality. With the financial devotion, on one hand money problems are reduced, on the other the motivation and attention of the investors will be stimulated.

(4) Supervisory mechanism: Due to public concern, the supervisory system will be established through a quality competition of streets which will improve the effect of movement. Except for media, other more than 10 parties like Campaign to Protect Rural England, Living Streets and Civic Voice establish a censorship.

(5) Multiple organizational coordination mechanism: A managerial approach
involving more actors is necessary. In the process, and single agency or organization to command the presentation or management is allowed in order to avoid self-interest intervening. Multiple-party’s corporation is a good mechanism for unfairness or low efficiency in working. They can track and constrain each other while pursuing the communal aim. If one of them behaves strategically against the others, he will be supervised and judged by the group. Therefore, in the process, a monitoring network system is established which ensures the fairness and effects.

The traffic problems in street space include congestions, safety problem, and pollution. The impact of transportation in historic environment can be minimized if transportation and planning departments collaborate. In historic cities of England, there is already rural transport planning strategy considering maintain historic cultural characters.

5.1.4 Implementation assessment

Within 5 input variables including 14 specific applicable indicators according to applicability analysis in 5.1.3 section, each of them will be inspected to judge the difficulty of implementing it to Harbin in terms of the number of solid boxes. The less number indicates that it is less difficult to implement. Then for each variable, an appropriate designing technique of lesson-drawing alternatives will be pointed. The process is summarized in Table 5-3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementation Assessment</th>
<th>Applicable variable (deducted from case)</th>
<th>Difficulty degree (**)</th>
<th>Lesson designing approach</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guidance of operation</td>
<td>Detai</td>
<td>ed instructive guide</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Need to designate all the street elements with cultural value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Removal for redundant elements on streets</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Need to work on street, incremental take actions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Big labor amount</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Guarantee the employment rate, but lack of money for labor cost</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Detailed jobs for operators</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>Need to educate the operators, need hardworking employees</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Large scale of working</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Too much workload, need to concentrate on some key districts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long time persistence</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Depends on the initiators, a formal project establishment can help to regulate the process and expiration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public participation</td>
<td>Public participation</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Hard in a top-down environment, incremental take actions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mechanism</td>
<td>More attention on public users</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>Immediately Need to acquire the public’s needs via investigation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5-3 Implementation assessment of case 1 into Harbin context
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy instruments</th>
<th>Synthesis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Supervisory mechanism</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility to government</td>
<td>Stubborn political system, hard to change, too much complaints from society everyday</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairness and transparency</td>
<td>Top-down mechanism and profit driven policymaking constraints the process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass media supervision</td>
<td>Take advantage the existing media reporting and reinforce the intervention of media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial mechanism</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial investment from other organizations</td>
<td>Not too many precedents, can try to do</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multi-organizational coordination mechanism</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work with traffic planning</td>
<td>Traffic problems are too stubborn to be solved, not a short-term topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration with other organizations</td>
<td>Mechanical problem, need to accept opposites, form an inclusive attitude</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Guidance of operation:** A comprehensive instruction is quite useful for operators and all the participants in their practical work. An adapt instruction should be designed and contain that how to deal with historic elements in which way. It needs expertise to recognize which elements should be protected and what is redundant or should be removed. But it requires careful and boring detailed work which increases the implementing difficulty. The workload increases the difficulty but not hindrance. These elements deter the good quality of historic view and need to remove.

Due to the detailed operation and heavy workload, a big labor amount is needed but it creates a financial burden. As long as the sufficient education and training is given to the operators and awareness of responsibility can be raised among them. The detailed work can ensure the quality of preservation. Although it can ensure the working quality and cover large range, it costs too much effort which is not practical. But gradual progress can be made through starting from key segments of the historic districts. And it is also better to synthesize with the local existing activities and operators to make the starting accessible. Another possible way is to cooperate with social groups like Women Association, Aged People Community or other labor association. Aside, it increases the social employment rate and provides jobs for low income people. Only if money is available, otherwise this cost will hardly be solved.

The lifecycle of project depends on the administrators’ perception. Obviously the longer project lasts, the better effects it will bring. It is practical only if the administrators are willing to establish a regulatory procedure.

**Public participation mechanism:** This mechanism needs to hybrid with the Harbin context. Firstly, it is necessary to acquire what the public are thinking and what they expect from these historic districts. The possible implementation is likely to do
questionnaires or social investigation directly facing the public to collect first hand information. Next, the public participation is strongly encouraged although it is quite a hard process in Chinese legislative system of top-down process. “Planning Publicity” and “Hearing Meeting” are two main existing public approaches in China which are seen as a formalization rather than practice. The government wants to open to the citizens but too much voice from the society makes the government overloaded. Then the work effect goes negatively. However, obviously, when much involvement from the public citizens is considered, people can be satisfied and less protest will happen. This result can stimulate the government to enhance this work. It is expected to start gradually but a legal requirement will be helpful.

**Supervision system:** Many unfair performances and corruptions are hidden all along the project management process. It is overestimated to delete all the black boxes by legislative system. The solution is to make incremental progress gradually through other instruments like mass media supervision. The press power is very strong in society. Invite mass media to publicize and monitor for each step during policy making.

Accessibility to government should be encouraged. It is a difficult instrument due to the existing legislative system. However, synthesizing with existing activities, such as “Government Visiting Day” should be encouraged and stimulated. Nevertheless in actual, it does not work regularly. People can still see many citizens petitioning in front of the city hall. “Government Visiting Day” sounds like a workable way but it is just a formation and should be improved feasibly. The government need to feedback the answer or solutions to the public.

**Financial mechanism:** Financial investment from other organizations hybrids with the existing funding. In most cases, the investment is sponsored by central government or provincial government. But the real money which is put in the projects is always delayed and gap from what is promised. Investment from social companies is a reasonable solution to fill the financial gap. However, the problem is that the social commonweal projects can hardly bring profits therefore the projects are un-attractive for commercial investors. A possible trade-off is that in the historic districts, it can be allowed to hold proper commercial activities to publicize these companies.

**Multi-organizational coordination mechanism:** Firstly, the work with traffic planning is needed. The traffic problem in these districts is severe and inflexible. The planning cannot be introduced as they are almost heavy used and serve the biggest traffic flow in the city. But proper traffic regulations can be set to constrain the private cars and encourage public transport, and the restriction on number plates is possible.

Additionally, collaboration with other organizations needs a hybrid approach. In England case, many organizations collaborate which makes the working easier and accessible. But in Harbin, organization collaboration in social service project does not frequently happen in the past. It is hard to initiate if previously not too many collaboration with society ongoing. Integrating with the customs in Harbin, what needs to be done is to list all potential partners covering diversified fields and find collaboration possibilities. A possibility is to negotiate and hybridizing with NGOs
who already care about this topic, including green peace party, high education institution like universities, volunteer group, folk environmentalist and preservationists, can increase the success of collaboration effect.

Based on the analysis and localization, five variables are signed with an alternative. But here they are seen as examples to inspire the readers with a possibility to show how this mechanism can be stimulated.

5.2 Comparability analysis and model design

5.2.1 Comparability of case 2 and Harbin context

The second case-Jordaan district will be discussed with residential district in Harbin because of their function of residence. Likely, the comparability indicators of ideological compatibility and similarities in resources will be designed in Table 5-4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selection criteria</th>
<th>Jordaan district</th>
<th>Russian style residential district</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Common issues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems of the day</td>
<td>Decayed land &amp; housing, Poor living environment, High population density, Higher emigration</td>
<td>Losing attraction, Community aging, Old facilities, Commercial developers’ intention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consentient objectives</td>
<td>Revitalization of the area, Improvement of living standard, Keep attraction</td>
<td>Applicable to Harbin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives of movement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideological compatibility</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Space fabric</td>
<td>Narrow crossed streets, private yards, illegal self-buildings</td>
<td>Arrayal layout enclosed building groups, peaceful yard, inheriting factory group living pattern, illegal self-buildings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope of district</td>
<td>Large , 95ha</td>
<td>10-25ha, small and simple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic environment</td>
<td>Too Narrow for transportation</td>
<td>Potential parking need</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used-to-be characters</td>
<td>Cheap rent, Cozy private yards &amp; public space, Traditional decorations, Good location</td>
<td>Russian style buildings, Good utilityfacilities, Factory atmosphere, Cozy public yards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Similarities in resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target users</td>
<td>Traditional habitants, Low-income people like: Students, Artists</td>
<td>Traditional habitants, Employees of factories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interactive mode</td>
<td>Bottom-up</td>
<td>Top-down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who is in charge of the site</td>
<td>Government, Citizens and house owners</td>
<td>Factory administration, Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If lack of money for maintenance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5-4 Comparability of case 2 and Harbin context
Land use legislation

| Private owned land, Partially expropriated by government | Houses belong to factories, State owned land |

- Common issues: in both situations, the decaying conditions of living environments are a common phenomenon which leads to a lack of attraction.
- Objectives of movement: The preserved regeneration in Jordaan aims to improve the living condition and revitalization in order to attract and satisfy the habitants. This is applicable for Russian style residential districts in Harbin.
- “Ideological compatibility” is detailed as:

**Space fabric:** Jordaan district is an area with building-blocks and narrow public streets. The habitants have their own small yards and more people illegally build their own houses attached to existing ones. Unlikely, the district in Harbin are all developed with integrated planning which arranged buildings in arrayal layout. Except for Garden Street district, the public yard is big and serves for the whole habitants. In Garden Street district, some private buildings can be seen.

**Scope of district:** Jordan district is a large area covering 95ha with much complex living conditions while the districts in Harbin are small sized district, 10-25ha, with the simple layout of building.

**Traffic environment:** In both sides, the traffic condition is not high due to specific characters. Jordaan has too narrow streets for vehicles and the sites in Harbin only have public yards for parking availability.

**Used-to-be characters:** The Jordaan is used to be a cheap area with low-income people living. Although the living quality is not high, the labor people still left many traditional folk living elements. Harbin districts are all planned by Russian while three of them are served for employees of factories the other one for Russian technicians. Therefore there are sufficient and efficient living facilities and public yards provided.

**Problems of the day:** Jordaan area before preserved regeneration was a high population density area lack of facilities, and residents started moving out. Similarly, the community in Harbin is decaying and it turns into aging situation. The facilities run out of use and people start unsatisfied. The attraction in both the cases is losing.

- “Similarities in resources” is detailed as:

**Target users:** The main habitants in Jordaan district are still low-income people, like students, artists and old people living here for long. While the habitants in Russian style residential districts almost spend most of their life in these areas. They are also below average social income. From this aspect, the habitant type in both sides is allied.

**Interactive mode:** Similarly with England, Dutch people also keep democracy thoughts in their life. It is a bottom-up social interaction process where public voice has strong influence on decision making process for policy makers. Citizens in Harbin belong to social vulnerable group and hardly involve in decision making process.
Who is in charge of the site: The Amsterdam government is eligible to macro-influence on Jordaan area, but the house owners have right to make changes on the houses. The districts in Harbin are in control of relevant factories, only Garden Street is in charge of government.

If lack of money for maintenance: All of these areas are in lack of money to make change and maintain the facilities.

Land use legislation: In Jordaan district, many lands belong to house owners and under the pressure of decaying, some the government expropriated some units from them. But the usage right of residential districts belongs to factories while the land still state owned.

From this discussion, most of the criteria match between the two sides which means the case study will be useful and helpful for Harbin residential historic districts. The biggest obstacle locates at interactive mode which triggers the preservation in Jordaan case. The treatment of this aspect will be given in the following analysis.

5.2.2 Generic model drawn from case 2

Likely, a conceptual model generated from case 2 is designed below. The same five inputs are sent into the research box while the case 2 context is combined.

Figure 9 Conceptual model from case 2

Legend:
Yellow dashed : operational instrument
Blue dashed : policy instrument
Black dashed : research activity box
Similar to 5.1.2 section, the applicability level is measured as the number of tick sign where the more signs indicate it is able to solve the Harbin issues better and more while the cross sign means it is not a good method to use directly in Harbin context.

Five perspectives from two levels of applicability will be discussed one by one:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applicable variable (deduced from case)</th>
<th>Applicability $(\checkmark/\times)$</th>
<th>Resolvable issues</th>
<th>Why it resolves the issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Operational instruments</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building maintenance</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>a, b</td>
<td>Maintain the buildings in good view.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decoration maintenance</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>a, b</td>
<td>Maintain the decorations of buildings to create a beautiful view.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courtyard environment improvement</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>a, b</td>
<td>Improve the environment through improving sanitation, planting, landscape design.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living facilities renewal</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>a, b</td>
<td>Repair the disabled facilities, remove old ones and provide new ones.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detailed content of operation</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>Ensure the job quality and gain the sense of responsibility of operators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of transportation system</td>
<td>$\times$</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>Regulate reasonable parking system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long time maintenance</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>a, g</td>
<td>Cover the whole range and increase the reputation of districts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regular ways of working</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More attention on habitants</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>d, i, j</td>
<td>Increase the participation of public to satisfy the citizens, and secure people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public participation</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>d, i, j</td>
<td>Increase the participation of government and reduce the influence of government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversify the habitants</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>k</td>
<td>Attract people outside the district to bring new and young residents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy instruments</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility to administration</td>
<td>$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$</td>
<td>d, i</td>
<td>Include the voice from public and break government monopoly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less influence from commercial developers</td>
<td>$\checkmark$</td>
<td>d, j</td>
<td>Balance the interests multiple stakeholders and increase public welfare.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mass media supervision | ✓ ✓ ✓ d, g, j | Supervise the decision making process and construction process and expose the unfairness to gain pressure.

Funding

| Financial investment from administration | ✓ ✓ ✓ h | Gain money from multiple channels and involve the investors in the process. |
| Financial investment from rich people | ✓ ✓ ✓ h | Reallocate the social resource and increase the social reputation of rich group. |

Multi-organizational coordination

| Residential community responsibility | ✓ ✓ ✓ i, j | Involvement of residents can stimulate their sense of responsibility and belongings. |
| Collaboration with other organizations | ✓ ✓ ✓ i, j | Increase the capability and contribution on preservation process, increase stakeholder to break monopolistic power. |

These five variables are expected to solve the issues in Harbin. The reasons are as followed:

Guidance of operation: The buildings of residential districts turn old as mentioned in Chapter 3. The first four instruments are all direct methods effectual on the decaying performance to recover the historical building and reduce the cluttered condition as mentioned in issue a and b. A specific method working on historical decorations of historic environment includes reducing the cluttered elements in the courtyards, cleaning the yards, providing useful decorations for people, and removing the out-of-use facilities and replacing them with new ones, or repairing the broken ones.

In residential districts, living atmosphere is strong and it constitutes a private environment for the habitants. Any kind of traffic will easily intervene on the peacefulness and safety in the area. Therefore traffic plan should be constrained. But in these districts, basic parking system is important for habitants especially when the number of private cars in Harbin is increasing gradually.

Regular ways of working: Firstly, more attention on habitants should be put on habitants. The habitants are either employees of factories, or low income level citizens. Many of them spend most of their life living in the same area. Increase the participation of public to meet the citizens’ desires, and secure the interests of citizens. Furthermore, to increase the participation of public and reduce the influence of government will balance the power in decision making process, which can help reduce the possibility of unfairness on citizens. Lastly, the communities are aging. Therefore, it is necessary to attract people outside the district to migrate. This aspect mainly aims at issue d, i and j.

Supervision in process: There should be less influence from commercial developers in order to balance the interest of developers and other stakeholders to avoid paying much attention on the tax revenue from developers. That is because that the commercial developers always involve in violent eviction affairs which hurt local
citizens’ interest and safety. Less influence from them can reduce the interference on the habitants. Furthermore, accessibility to administration should be encouraged including the voice from public to break the government monopoly. In this way, public can reflect any illegal evictions or other affairs to the government which can solve issue g. The power in the decision making process will also be balanced as issue i. Mass media can supervise and expose the unfairness in the decision making process and protect the interests of disadvantage group. Additionally, they can help popularize the historic culture and districts to attract more visitors to solve issue j.

**Funding:** The government is obligatory to support this project both politically and financially. Additionally, the investment from individuals or companies can be seen as a supplement funding to solve issue h. And it gains reputation for rich people or group to join social activities.

**Multi-organizational coordination:** The preservation of residence and communal culture also needs the cooperation of habitants. Proper popularization will increase the awareness of habitants in participating in community activities to create a comfortable environment which is out of Harbin current issues but a better suggestion. Besides, more participants can contribute from multiple possibilities to increase the capability on preservation process. It also breaks monopolistic power from government and certain interest group to make it fair as issue i and j.

From this analysis, Harbin issues of a, b, d, f, g, h, i, j are able to be solved. As a conclusion, the instruments of case 2 are helpful and expected to import to Harbin planning system. Nevertheless solvency is different from practicability. Further judgment of implementation should be decided to check if they are practical.

### 5.2.3 Organizational mechanisms generated from case 2

(1) *Detailed operational plan of land use:* In Europe, the land possession is in hands of individuals. The government only has right to do general management and make decision of functions, but no implementing right. Therefore, the zoning plan made it possible to take care of each zone separately. Limited by short of sufficient money, the local land owners in Jordaan felt hard to maintain their lands. This zoning plan provided a possible way to cut the region into small pieces in order to talk to the land owners to switch their owning right to government. Detailed working on small pieces ensured the participation of more stakeholders and the maximum usage efficiency (Davidson, 1975).

(2) *Public participation mechanism:* The Netherlands is another democratic country where the public power could determine or even hold back a city project. The government respects the voice from the public and takes it into consideration. The citizens as direct users of a certain area have the sense of belongings because they know the significance of traditional elements. Without public feedback, the possible consequence of cluttering on the streets may lead to a big loss of historic values. To give them the right to express and receive their voice is to get the first hand information on the effects. Also, under the influence of democracy the power of public is strong
enough to influence on decision making.

(3) Private initiatives to raise coordination: Because the district is complex and relates different actors, the preservation plan is broken down that the interested people can participate in, such as labor workers, house owners, businessmen or habitants. The city authorities divided the neighborhood into several blocks and set up project groups to take charge of each block. Each project group is led by city officials and coordinated with local organizations or individuals aiming at specific urban renewal project.

(4) Financial mechanism: As described in 4.2.4, approximately 70% of cost is covered by Cultural Affairs and Ministry of Housing and Planning. It resolves most of the financial burden for local council and project. If the lack of money influences on a social project, government financial support is always expected.

(5) Multiple organizational coordination mechanism: Jordaan project involved organizations from City Hall, Urban Development departments, environmentalists, conservers, citizens, businessmen and house owners. The stakeholders’ interests will be reached as wide and balanced as possible so that each organization could provide difference sources and conveniences. Any city development projects in Europe need to undergo many rounds of legal discussions and evaluations.

What needs to be aware is that balancing multiple actors leads the projects into a long lifecycle. In order to balance the interests, any intervention from the parties will easily stagnate in the project (Spaan & Louw, 2009). This explained why the project takes more time here than other countries. The initial plan was discussed in 1969 and was rejected mainly by citizens and conservers after a year. Therefore the power of them can be very strong. Until 1978, the new plan launched and was accepted by most actors and was implemented after 19809.

5.2.4 Implementation assessment

In the second case, 17 analytical indicators from 5 input variables are designed into a lesson model.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applicable variable (deducted from case)</th>
<th>Difficulty degree (★)</th>
<th>Lesson designing approach</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operational instruments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidance of operation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building maintenance</td>
<td>■</td>
<td>Need to check all the buildings and repair deterioration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decoration maintenance</td>
<td>■</td>
<td>Check decorations and repair the destroyed ones</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courtyard environment improvement</td>
<td>■</td>
<td>Clear up the central yards, provide more plants and couches</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living facilities renewal</td>
<td>▼ ▼</td>
<td>Big investments, complex procurement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5-6 Implementation assessment of case 2 into Harbin context

9http://www.jordaaninfo.nl/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=27%3Ade-wederopbouw-van-de-jordaan&catid=1%3Ageschiedenis&Itemid=21&lang=en
Detailed content of operation

- Not too much workload, four districts can be started on parallel

Refusal of transportation system

- Need to provide parking system for convenience of habitants

Long time maintenance

- Under the caring by factories or government (Garden Street Districts)

**Public participation mechanism**  **Adaptation**

- More attention on habitants
  - Need to acquire the habitants’ needs via investigation and questionnaires

- Public participation
  - Hard in a top-down environment, power distance between habitants and factory administrators

- Diversify habitants
  - The existing habitants are traditional old ones especially employees from factories

**Policy instruments**

**Supervisory mechanism**  **Hybrid**

- Accessibility to administration
  - too much complaints from society everyday

- Less influence from commercial developers
  - Interests of developers relates to the deed of government (tax) meanwhile sometimes hurt those of public, hard to balance

- Mass media supervision
  - Take advantage the existing media reporting and reinforce the intervention of media

**Financial mechanism**  **Synthesis**

- Financial investment from administration
  - Only practical for Garden Street District as a public place

- Financial investment from rich people
  - Lack of perception of charity behavior

**Multi-organizational coordination mechanism**  **Hybrid**

- Residential community responsibility
  - Need to establish a good relationship for community and habitants

- Collaboration with other organizations
  - Ownership is clearly for factories, no collaboration with other organizations

**Guidance of operation:** in this category, the first four instruments are basic for the quality of physical components in historic districts which can be done immediately requiring a group of operators and costing an amount of money. They are not technical jobs therefore are not difficult and belong to adaptation. Therefore, this approach is adaption with case 2. Some specific jobs should be considered, building maintenance, decoration maintenance, courtyard environment improvement, living facilities renewal, detailed content of operation and refusal of transportation system in a long time.
working lifecycle.

But respecting the traffic system, it is impossible to expand traffic spaces but the parking system should be introduced. Because an increasing number of private car owners bring traffic parking problem both in residential area also in public space. Here we suggest synthesize the existing transportation system in residential yard, to expand properly parking space for future.

**Public participation:** Unlike case 1, for these manufactories, the power distance between the employee habitants and factory administrators is shorter. Public participation can be adaption to implement in residential historic districts. The approach to make community of residents as a bridge to reflect the habitants’ desire to administrators to improve the living conditions will increase the accessibility. Attention on habitants not only shows the respect to them, but it will collect the accurate and deep reflection of the understandings on the sites. Un-intractably, social investigations and questionnaires can collect the responds, also community activities help to reunion the habitants.

Moreover, facing the aging problem of these districts, diversity of potential habitants form the society can be attracted. They can be selected from low income group like students, young single people and given privileges to get a cheaper rent.

**Supervisory mechanism:** A hybrid approach with local media supervision can reveal all the results of any important decision making process.

An awareness of the commercial developers is raised here. They are hard to be omitted because they are always curious about proper developing possibilities. They run business in profit driven which may intervene the historic elements in residential districts. Many black box behaviors and corruption, violent eviction relates to them, the neglect of commercial developers is realistic expectation. Thus their negative influence should be removed. But they can solve investment demand, construction and renovation process and they pay tax to government.

**Financial mechanism:** Synthesized with local possibility, money can be attracted from the factories themselves, or from other rich organizations. But if the factory is willing to donate on preservation and regeneration of these sites, they would have done it. An assumption is that it is hard to stimulate administration to improve the districts without external push.

Additionally, if cherish investment form rich people or groups can be found, the money problem will be solved. As a return, the investors can publicize in these sites, or they can be given right to open business like stores, restaurants.

**Multi-organizational coordination mechanism:** The ownership of three of districts of this type is from the factories. It is hard to collaborate with other organizations in their own residence. Therefore, a good relationship for the habitants with residential community needs to be established via community activates or regular publicizing. Only for Garden Street whose ownership is to government, any social organization can involve in.

It is suggested to hybrid with local community group or offices to collaborate. The
beginning maintenance work is conducted by urban planning bureau while the latter work can be left to local community offices.

5 variables are designed with proper possible lesson drawing alternatives which make them easier to implement. This design indicates more about the possibility to import the case model into Harbin while the localized resolvents are references. As a conclusion, most of the variables can find a proper way to localize into Harbin context. The formal recommendations will be talked about in the last chapter.

5.3 Conclusion of chapter 5

This chapter illustrated how to guide a case study and how to derive lessons from the cases transiting to Harbin. For both case studies, the initialization step is to compare the case with Harbin context to judge the meaningless of case studying using selection criteria from 2.4.1 section. From common issues, ideological compatibility analysis and similarities in resources, the cases match Harbin context in an optimistic way. Therefore, the comparing would be helpful to learn from case.

Then five variables of 2.3.3 section are put in the research box of the conceptual model with all possible indicators deducted from the case. Based on the analysis of each indicator in tables, they can solve issues in Harbin. How to solve the Harbin issues is explained after conceptual model from five aspects. Case 1 can solve 8 out of 11 issues while case 2 can solve 6 out of them. Both cases cover all the issues within some of them are more workable than other others. Additionally, the mechanisms as the outputs of the model are stated in order to acquire us with a systematic understanding what can be drawn from the cases. The final step is implementation assessment for adapting and redesigning the variables in order to tailor into Harbin context. Three of seven alternatives of designing methods are used, which are adaptation: guidance of operation, hybrid: public participation, supervisory mechanism, and multi-organizational coordination mechanism, synthesis- financial mechanism. Then a framework is figured out to improve Harbin historic preservation process.
Chapter 6 Recommendation and a practical test

6.1 Recommendation

From Chapter 5, we have redesigned all possible instruments generated from cases consisting with Harbin context from a specific level. The cases share much common information that will be helpful to resolve same problems in Harbin. Therefore, it is necessary to integrate a set of policies from a strategic level aiming at improve the whole historic preservation planning system in the city.

The policies will be conducted consistent with model design framework in 2.3.3 section composing operational level and policy level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Operational instruments</th>
<th>Policy instruments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guidance of operation</td>
<td>Public participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisory mechanism</td>
<td>Financial mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-organizational coordination mechanism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.1.1 Recommendation on operational instruments

(1) To specify the guidance of operation to improve the working effect and guide the operators.

Facing these historic heritages, a large amount of work on detail level should be done if policy makers really want to achieve a high quality of work. Therefore, a clear guidance of preservation covering all ranges of possibilities is necessary. Firstly, a clear detailed operation instruction will be worked out to help the operators, workers and the local users. Coordinated with the training, the operators will be well informed with that which objective contains cultural value and how to maintain it in a professional and effective way. Another work should be done is that what elements make the historical environment cluttered, for instance the old post standings, damaged roads. If it is necessary, remove these elements to recover a historical view. At the meanwhile, utility facilities should be updated or supplemented.

A further suggestion for policy makers is to keep the historic preservation long time and breakdown the goals for each time segment. For short term, the environment cleaning up is initiative, then to repair the cultural elements. For midterm, the environment for each historic district should be recovered and the basic desires of users need to be reached. For long term, the cultural district should be able to attract more people to visit and impact on a larger range area to stimulate the regional living quality.

(2) To stimulate the public participation mechanism to involve the users in decision making process.

In the regular ways of working system in China, a top-down process still plays a central pattern in as the result of the governing system (Long, Shi, & Dong, 2008). In this way, the governors and the experts determine the planning process. Based on an obvious strong top-down management process, public participation seems too idealistic so far. However the lack of involvement of the public organizations arose many protests because the implementations of a project damaged their interests or the
objective of a project cannot meet their needs. This kind of interference pushes the society going against the government and leaves many difficulties in historic preservation projects. Therefore, the problem can bring long time impacts to be solved.

The society needs to be open and democratic. As a balance, an Interactive Public Participation mechanism is recommended. It still admits the dominant position of government. Meanwhile, it requires the government to provide a platform for all the participators to express their voice. As we can see from much European experiences, if from an early stage, the effort is put to satisfy the public, later on the public will return the efforts to improve and maintain the historic preservation environment.

In the preparation phase, envisioning phase and realization phase of a construction, public organizations should be involved in. As in preparation phase, an investigation from the public that what are the fundamental desires is needed. In envisioning phase, the public should join the discussions about the project planning. In realization phase, it is need to synthesize and strengthen the local conventions like “Hearing Meeting” and “Planning Publicity”. For these steps, the election mechanism can be implemented which means that for each round of decision making, a certain percentage of vote should be from the public side.

6.1.2 Recommendation on policy instruments

(1) To create a supervisory mechanism to transparentize the process.

It is a necessity to monitor the project process because many black boxes are discovered in Chinese legislative system. With the supervision during the process, the unfairness can be exposed in order to raise the attention from society to protect the interests of disadvantaged group and reduce the corruptions happened in the project. First possibility is to strengthen the existing means like “Government Visiting Day” and “Complaint Mailbox” which are already set to accept the feedbacks from the society. But they are discouraged and with a low despondence rate. The chargers of these departments behave more on behalf of the strong stakeholders. Therefore, a third party who stands neutrally should be invited to take over these matters. Secondly, mass media should be obligatorily privileged to track the whole process. The media should expose the affairs against the fairness and people’s interests.

(2) To build reasonable financial mechanism to fill in the money gap.

Financial gap is a sensitive and a stubborn problem in historic preservation. Several steps can be tried to reduce the pressure from it.

Firstly, identify the possible financial resources. They can be central government, governmental organizations, and non-governmental agencies including educational institutions, social commercial companies, rich group or individuals.

Next, the government is capable to additionally provide supportive policies to attract and encourage other agencies to invest, or provide the attached policies to constrain certain organizations to invest. For example, if an agency invests in a historic preservation related project, they can be compensated in another way like tax reduction or supports in company developing. Within the investment, the preservation project can be enhanced, while the requirements from the investors can be considered which not
the case without investments. For instances, some commercial activities can be allowed to carry on in a historic site which are not allowed before.

With this so-called constraint on investors strategically, long term coordination is able to be set.

(3) To form a multi-organizational coordination mechanism to integrate the social recourses.

Historic preservation project is done not only by a single organization but multiple from both the public and the private. The participants are responsible for forming and constructing the historic site and show it to the public. (Ashworth, 1994). Actually in Harbin, there are already multiple organizations related to each other. But currently the investigation and the planning work are assigned by urban planners while the final decision is made by governors, and the implementation work is done by real estate or construction companies. The latter is profit driven which brings much trouble to public and social interest such as violent expropriation or evictions.

Another risk of fewer-actor is that it creates a symmetric informative situation where the benefits lean to the powerful side, like the commercial companies or the government.

What is needed is to set a comprehensive mechanism to involve more related stakeholders coordinate with each other. The stakeholders should be analyzed deep to find out who has what kind of power or resources which benefits the social welfare. Additionally, embed the interests of investors into the development of historic districts to increase the caring and contribution from them.

Different actors are allocated different commitments to avoid overlap and conflicts as in a lifecycle management process. From the initial planning to construction and maintenance, different organizations will be assigned into different stages. Multiple organizations can likely provide more comprehensive and all-ranged recourses. As mentioned in chapter 5, non-government organizations like green peace party, educational institutions, volunteer groups and other environmentalists can be expected to make more efforts.

These five dimensions are the main outputs under this research according to model design. The recommendations are willing to inspire the policy makers for final decision. They are not the absolute approaches but will complement the weak nodes in Harbin. However, further problems can probably be brought by these steps. They need to be considered and treated specifically.

6.2 A practical test on commercial background district in Harbin

The commercial background district in Harbin composes two sites, traditional commercial streets in Daowai district (Daowai historic district), and Red Army Street - central museum area. Here we take Daowai historic district as an example to show how to transfer the recommendations from this research into it.

In this section, the historic elements of this district will be listed. Then the existing
preservation methods will be analyzed according to the input of conceptual model to see which part of them leads to problems. Based on these, a set of recommendations will be designed to these aspects trying to improve the management process.

6.2.1 Introduction of the area

Daowai district as the origination of Harbin city is the biggest entire district of “Chinese Baroque” in China which is the localized Baroque style. It used to be the administrative location and developed as national business trading area. It combined both eastern and western cultures therefore the historic value of this area is very high. Developed until nowadays, it has covered many different land use functions as seen in Figure 10. It is a fishbone-shape area, the main road in the middle with side roads vertically on both sides. In this traditional street, Chinese Baroque building style, linear visiting route, cozy and free environment. As a core center in the whole Daowai administrative district, the composition of this area is complex and the social influence of it is strong.

However along with time, as the first developed area, the living facilities and buildings are turning old and out of fashion. Limited by local recourses and the old conditions, the economic level of this region is stagnated thus the consuming power in this region is decreasing. Compare to the economic development in other administrative districts in Harbin, this one keeps falling behind. The integrated living standard is low and the historic atmosphere is decaying.

6.2.2 Historic cultural characteristics

Due to the colony period beginning from 20th century, Daowai historic district was influenced by multiple cultures both in material and non-material aspects. Material historic value includes buildings, Hutongs and streets, and yards while the non-material historic value includes the commercial environment, food culture and folk culture.

The multiple architecture styles: Chinese Baroque includes many modes such as Western Baroque, Art Nouveau, Eclecticism and Chinese traditional buildings modes. There are 125 Chinese Baroque buildings among which 25 are listed to be protected by the government. The color of the buildings is mainly hazel or grey wall with white decorations. The structure is double pitch-roof made of brick and wood in two or three layers.

The streets: The streets are composed by main road, side road and Hutongs with clear linkages between two roads. The landscape of the streets is high outstanding and integrated with the buildings on both sides. There are six themed Hutongs spreading in
The traditional yards: Encircled by traditional buildings, a yard is created. In total, there are 145 yards covering this area most of which is provided as residence and business trading, such the front building (or the upper layer) is used as business with the back yard (or the lower layer) as residence. These traditional yards present one of the most local characteristics in Daowai historic district.

Commercial environment: Three oldest factories were built in 1900s in this area. Four oldest stores established the commercial atmosphere for the whole region and the traditional business created a commercial cultural which lasted for a hundred years. But these businesses are declining conflicting by the modern shopping mall and the old fashioned business modes.

Food culture: The food customs with ten prestigious brands of food and restaurants as one of the traditional cultures influenced the image of this area. It constitutes part of the local attractions. Their business concepts include building credit standing, providing high standard service and best quality products.

Folk cultures: There are many folk artists performing in this area, such as acrobatics, open area drama or opera. The local citizens also enjoy after-supper walk. Every evening, the atmosphere on the streets is always busy and cozy.

All these activities form Daowai historic districts in a cozy civilian living style. Nevertheless, all these traditions involving with time and modernization are vanishing. Only under the particular way of protection, they could be revitalized.

6.2.3 Current preservations and problems
Since the historic preservation started in China in 1980s, this area has attracted much attention from both the government and the experts. A big quantity of research has been done and many preservation activities are taken. Surprisingly, many movements cannot conserve the local traditional characters. Some of these movements even destroyed much historic culture by leaving fake substitutes and sacrificing the residents’ interests.

Two rounds of Chinese Baroque Protection Movement determined by experts were supposed to be implemented in 2007 and 2010. But the Some problems can be found in them. In the first round of movement, the site planning endeavored to keep the original situation as much as possible. But in the implement it was totally changed. 25 traditional yards were shrank into 5, some of old buildings in preservation area were demolished, and in the preserved area all the other buildings were actualized as facidism that means only the front wall is kept. Besides, many of the historic decorations were damaged. Even more, in some area there were still habitants who did not agree on the compensation on expropriation. But the housebreakers still tried to evict them and demolish the buildings.

The local residents petitioned to the government to stop the expropriation. The Heritage Protection Committee, Cultural Relic Station and volunteers tried to persuade the housebreakers to stop demolishing, but the result could not be changed. The preserver Yizhi Zeng tried to prevent and negotiated with the principal of the
expropriation, but afterwards she was even hunted down by Security Supervision Bureau, City Management Administration and City Dismantlement Office.

So far, the third and fourth rounds of protection movement are undergoing.

6.2.4 Recognition of the inputs

According to the conceptual model of the research, five inputs are recognized as:

The planning as a professional and legal Operational guideline version of completed by Urban Planning Bureau and Urban Planning institutions of Harbin Institute of Technology. But the output drawings so far are site plans, function plans on a policy level. There is neither single guideline, training for the housebreakers on how to do the demolishment without ruining the protected parts, nor for local citizen users on how to maintain the elements with historic value. For the housebreakers, the constructions work is heavy and costing time. In order to complete the tasks quickly and reduce the construction cost, they just damaged most of the historic valuable buildings or decorations during the operation. For the citizen users, they do not know what elements in their life should be specially protected so during the using, they probably damage them.

In the regular way of working, the construction department follows the planning instruction to do the labor job. But the local users as public group do not realize that they need to maintain a certain area. Besides, they have no access to participate in the decision making process on how to preserve and develop the area. There is even no public Hearing Meeting happened concerning this issue. The single public participation procedure is to exhibit the final planning board on the wall of construction site to inform the public. In the past, the planning strategy is assessed by the urban planners with less investigation on the users and almost no involvement on the decision making from the public users. The violent expropriation is the most severe damage on the residents’ interests. They need higher compensation to move out which is always not the case with how much the government provides. Additionally, the citizens are not satisfied with the final planning on the preservation site. In some cases they know much more than the experts about the historic sites, so they will think the project plan cannot perfectly preserve the historic value.

The supervision work does not cover much of the projects in Daowai historic district. If we search on internet on how the planning and construction project is going, little information can be seen. The journalist, Yizhi Zeng is a representative on preserving Daowai historic district. She covers many valuable investigations to appeal stop violent expropriation to the governmental organizations and on internet. Some social investigations from the media can be found as well. All these information reveals a negative and miserable phenomenon which is exactly opposite from the reports covered by official website. It reflects that the mass media was influenced or under the pressure from the official. They cannot supervise the quality of preservation projects.

Multiple organizations involved in this movement of Chinese Baroque Protection. In the above introduction, we know that some actors include the city governments, urban planning bureau, security supervision bureau, city management administration,
city dismantlement office, construction companies, developer companies, local habitants, historic heritage preservers and volunteers and so forth. All these actors can be divided into four types, as followed:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>actors</th>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Authority</td>
<td>City government</td>
<td>Policy power</td>
<td>City development, Tax revenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experts</td>
<td>Urban planners</td>
<td>Technique</td>
<td>Reasonable and sustainable design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developers</td>
<td>Construction companies, commercial developers</td>
<td>Construction power, money investment</td>
<td>Fast development, profit income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The public</td>
<td>Habitants, preservers, volunteers.</td>
<td>Maintenance convenience</td>
<td>Living better off</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There is a problem that within these four types of actors, the relationship is inclining instead of alignment. The commercial developers wish to do the constructions fast with fewer complexes which end up without considering the protected details. Therefore, they are willing to avoid from the planning from experts which costs more to pay attention to the protected elements. In this way, they raise an opposite from the experts. Violent expropriation is a “proper” choice from both the time and money consuming concerns treating the old buildings. But it goes against the local residents. Furthermore, facing the crappy living conditions in Daowai district, the government feels struggling in developing and renovation.

The funding for preservation is mainly from the state special fund and the local government. Due to the resource limitation, we seize the statistics that: since 2006, 8 million RMB from the state and the local has been put in the renovation of Confucius temple; in 2008, 2.49 hundred million was put to finalize the first round of Chinese Baroque Preservation Movement; in 2009, which is1million RMB from the state and 1million RMB from the local, from which only 200thousands was implemented; in 2010, 1.84 hundred million was planned to put in the second round of Chinese Baroque Preservation Movement, the updated number of which is not revealed yet.

Two issues can be concluded. The first one is that the money source is constrained by state special fund and the local government. But the real money is always hard to be realized so it delays the project. Additionally, only two fund sources seem not stable to keep the preservation movement in continuous paces.

6.2.5 Recommended policy transplantation

The above analysis has not revealed the comprehensive problems yet but addresses an analytical way on how to recognize the issues on certain area. Now some recommended policies on output mechanisms will be given trying to solve the related issues.

Operational guideline: preservation project with the site planning for the constructions from an upper level is essential to keep the historic culture in this area. But besides this, the daily using also determines the condition of these historic elements.
Therefore, they citizen users need a detailed guide on how to maintain the living surroundings with historic values. It aims at guiding the users in their daily life avoiding the misusing which easily causes unnecessary loss on these fragile historic elements, such as doors, windows, decorations on the roof, the street and curbs. Because the users should be assigned with responsibilities to keep the historic elements in a good condition, if any historic elements are damaged under the misuses of them, they can even take the punishment.

Public participation mechanism: In decision making process on how to make the planning strategy and construction project, the public citizens should be involved.

Therefore, two suggestions are that, to stimulate the Hearing Meeting, and try to keep the original citizens live on their site after the preservation project. The hearing meeting provide a platform to acquire more information on the history of the site, buildings and surroundings. And it provides a chance for public and the government to negotiate on the compensation plan. To keep the citizens living on their old site is to keep the local folk and culture and it reduce the disagreement on the eviction and compensation.

Supervisory mechanism: Make a compulsory rule to interpose the mass media in all the crucial decision making meetings and reveal the final decision from each meeting. Meanwhile, mass media should be a third party without any relation with all other participators. Therefore, they can be neutral and reduce the influence from the powerful part.

Additionally, they should be endowed with right to track the project in-phase within the construction. As long as the anti-planning behavior happens, it should be exposed. An assistant rule is to obligate the decision makers to reveal the decision and give the interpretations through media.

Multi-organizational coordination mechanism: a principle is to strengthen the power of NGOs to provide more resources on historic preservation and help the preservation projects go well. Therefore, the social organizations as a weak side can compose a committee in charge of the interest of public citizens and local users. The committee has right to vote and express in Hearing Meetings. In this way, the local individuals can express formally.

The other groups like educational institutions from universities and colleges should be involved in the field investigation process. Field investigation is a detailed and hard work. Sometimes the lack of time from the government and planning bureau will neglect much information on final strategy. Therefore the assistant from the educational system can cover this possible weakness. And the historic preservation work can stimulate the responsibilities for the students and experts that they will do more research on this topic in an academic view. The traffic department should also involve and provide an expertise strategy on how to solve the traffic problems in this historic district.

Financial mechanism: since the money from the government is limited, we can firstly generate it from the commercial organizations from local, including the factories
nearby, the companies or local restaurants. With the investment from these possibilities, they can be provided with policies to expand their business from the government, or tax related supplement. Secondly, a certain quotas on preservation can be assigned on those who will bring negative impacts on historic values. Next, the local companies and restaurants users can be charged a maintenance fee every year like what is doing in historic city center in Europe.

6.2.6 Difficulties and possible risks

The above suggestions are possibilities but not comprehensive. They show a method how to come up with a solution to solve the issues. But the final decisions should be made by the governments and urban planners.

There are many difficulties to implement them. Every suggestion costs time and money. And the agreement is hard to reach due to different interests from stakeholders. For example, the commercial developers will not like to compromise time and cost to do a considerable construction work. In terms of this, the compulsory rule can constraint them. The citizens are not used to take care of their daily goods just like in the past years. They will be even more against the regulation to pay the maintenance tax. And how to combine more organizations from which some will used to be no business in these projects. It all needs strategic persuasion. Therefore, time and patience is important to implement the suggestions.

6.3 Limitations of the research

Lesson-drawing is a political process with a perception uncertainty hence it may not accustom to the local characters and no guarantee for desirable and practical (Rose, 1991). Theory implementation and designed model should consider the limitations of this approach while seeing possibilities.

(1) Constitutional level out of the scope

Due to the theory from Rose, the root of legal and cultural background from donor and acceptor side is not an obstacle for lesson learning and policy transferring. Also in constitutional level of transplantation (Toonen, 1990) which contains that the legislation system and cultural system is out of the scope of this research. Chinese society as Communitarian Family diverges away from the Netherlands and UK. This discrepancy increases the difficulty of learning process, because they set up the misunderstandings on social instruments of Europe, and influence on social behaviors of actors in Harbin.

(2) Bounded rationality

Dolowitz and Marsh pointed out a problem of the policy transplant that people involved might be influenced by their personal perceptions and limited acquaintanceship of situation instead of the objective rationality (perfect rationality) which leads to an farfetched consequence (Dolowitz & Marsh, 2000). In this case, the decision making process may be bounded. From the research by Mossberger and Wolman, most policy transplantations in fact occurred in a bounded rational process (Mossberger & Wolman, 2003). This easily leads to the unilateral effect of
implementation in Harbin.

(3) Willingness to accept

Another risk is from the acceptors side. De Jong and Mamadouh (2002) stated that the domestic actors should be voluntary to pull the institution in and reframe it based on their own situation (de Jong, Lalenis, & Mamadouh, 2002). Because these actors are inspired by sporadic consequences of a certain policy from another country, they should have a belief that this policy might be workable for their own country. However, without social-cultural resonance, potential interests for stakeholders and even with the resistance from local people, people might not be willing to accept a certain policy if their interests cannot be researched.

(4) Too specific instruments

Some successful elements generated from the cases come from a micro level, for instances the specific instruments. If the advices or lessons are too detail, they must fit the new context perfectly otherwise they will easily raise much unfitness. Although tailoring these details according to local situation will adaptively or integrated help to lease the inapplicability, they might lead back to the former consequence.
Chapter 7 Conclusion and reflection

To close the research, this chapter will present the achievement and answer all the research questions raised in chapter 1. Furthermore, the final adaptive mechanism recommendations will be set for urban planning bureau and government of Harbin. Nevertheless, there are still knowledge gaps and limitations during the research which will be delineated in the following content in order to give facilities for further study.

7.1 Conclusion of the research

The main objective of this research is to figure out **How can lessons be drawn from European historic preservation experiences and how can they be applied in historic districts of Harbin in order to improve managerial processes of historic preservation planning?**

It is a practical discussion and the final answer should present the potential practical solutions. The theoretical sub-questions and empirical sub-questions help to respond it while the former indicates why it is necessary to preserve the historic districts and how the research will instruct, and the latter practically try to transplant the essences from Europe to Harbin.

Theoretical sub-question:

**What is the meaning to preserve historic districts and how to conduct a helpful research?**

Historic preservation makes efforts on properties with significant historic cultural value to keep the building styles, historical views, environment and other artificial. The objective is to improve the difficulties in historic preservation projects in order to increase the quality of living environment for citizens. The direct effect of this behavior will be to maintain and enlarge the cultural values which influence on people’s sense of belongings. With the feeling of belongings, people are willing to contribute to the environment and the quality of a place will be stimulated.

The current situation of historic districts in Harbin is elaborately described and the current issues in this topic are defined. After identifying the issues Harbin is facing, together with the willingness of policy makers, European experiences are introduced being expected to learn from. Lesson-drawing approach raised by Richard Rose guides the research theoretically. Combined the lesson-drawing steps of Janssen-Jansen et al and Rose, an indicative research process is given to instruct the research in a reasonable way (see Figure 11).

![Figure 11 Summary of thesis framework](image-url)
Empirical sub-question:

**How to use European experiences to solve relevant issues in Harbin?**

Although policy makers of Harbin have already made much effort on historic preservation, the managerial process still turns out complex and problematic. In order to improve the effect of preservation, this process should also be optimized aiming to resolve the current issues. Main issues in this field are discovered in Chapter 3 where the issues are abbreviated in key words:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 7-1 Current issues list in Harbin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) Decaying of cultural value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Old facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Illegal self-built houses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Illegal violent eviction and expropriation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) Detailed but practical planning instruments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) Traffic problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(g) Few people visiting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(h) Lack of financial support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Lack of public participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(j) Lack of coordination and supervision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(k) Aging group of users</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These issues fundamentally stem from operational perspective including operational guidance and public participation, and policy perspective with supervisory mechanism, financial mechanism and multi-organizational coordination mechanism. The European case studies are spread according to these aspects consistently. Firstly, Chapter 4 expatiates two cases from England region and Amsterdam area where in the end of each the essence is generated. On one hand, the comparability analysis shows that the situations of them are similar and related therefore the success probability of policy transferring from the case is higher. On the other side, the applicability analysis indicates that these cases are capable to solve the issues for Harbin. Case 1 in total is able to contribute on all the issues but workable on issue a, b, c, d, f, h, i and j. while Case 2 is workable for issue a, b, d, h, i, j. Outwardly all the issues are available to be touched, however, many obstacles easily hamper the learning process such as the social participation stereotype or resource insufficiency. As a result, the instruments generated from cases are adaptively redesigned to cope with local conditions.

Seven methods of redesign are introduced and three of them are used as lesson drawing. They are adaptation, synthesis and hybrid while the difficulty of them escalates. Specifically based on each instrument generated from the case, the applicability analysis and implementation assessment have sketched a possible model design to deliver to the policy makers. Instead of delivery of the whole portfolio, some key elements diversifying from Harbin context but elementary in the success of cases are found:

1. The potential influence of the public

From both cases, the public participation strongly impacts on either the process or the final decision. In England case, the preservation movement is aiming to spread out among the public and the public participation determines the effects of the movement.
In Amsterdam case, without the public participation, the Jordaan district might not be preserved at all. As a result of public, the streets quality can be improved and the Jordaan district can be created as a peaceful and charming place. Additionally, the policy makers from the cases turn out a positive attitude on public participation. This sets a type of cooperation between the upper architecture and the bottom users. For policy makers, the reflection and a basic desire from the society should outweigh the political or profit concerns. Due to this cooperation, the quality of projects and environment are ensured.

(2) The potential value of inter-organizational coordination

Another merit from the cases is the coordination among different organizations. Under a proper coordination mechanism, the efficiency of preserving projects will be optimized. England case concludes more than 10 organizations in the implementation process. Jordaan case also involves approximately 10 organizations in the whole process. On the contrast, it increases the complexity of stakeholders and the lifecycle is risky enlarged which we should also be aware.

7.2 Research contribution

This research covers both urban planning and public policy domains each of which is explored by experts globally. However, the cross research is still expected to be deepen. The contribution can be seen from some specific perspectives:

(1) To fill in the gap of instructive suggestions. In Harbin, much theoretical research is done in the past than instructive work. Due to lack of recourse accesses, the work cannot be done specifically. This research started from theory, but goes down to operational level which fills in the gap of the operational suggestions.

(2) To correlate policy analysis with urban planning that creates a framework of how to systematically deal with planning issues in a managerial way. Although urban planning keeps a regulatory function for decision makers, the constitutional level changes are not accessible from case study. Policy level and operational level are more feasible to implement.

(3) To track preservation movement on an international stage. The case of Jordaan is from 20 years ago while the English one started in 2004. The latest attention is put on historic industrial areas and idle areas. In this way, people can see the current effects of the merits from different stages. These clues help the researcher of Harbin stay on an international level and fresh the embarrassing thoughts that out of date.

7.3 Potential further research

Limited by time and recourses, this research can be enriched and added more values in following steps.

(1) More cases can be conducted for policy makers to acquire an integrated picture of how Europe works in this domain. The cases occurred in the research are still part of the merits in Europe. The lessons drawn from these two cases still have evitable limitations. Thus more cases study and the field investigation for policy makers are
suggested.

(2) The last four steps from Richard Rose can be completed by further research with the cooperation with the policy makers in Harbin. In this research, only the first six steps of the policy reasoning and policy recommendation are finished, but the final decision if to adopt the lessons and the lesson assessment part is not done yet. In the further research, this part can be worked.

(3) To expand from listed historic districts to wider range, like the historic preservation developed from single building to building groups then to regional environment preservation. Historical cultural value preservation can spread to a wider region of modern sites. Actually, the final goal is to improve the living quality in our Harbin. Currently, European communities are paying much attention on historical industrial area and the reuse of idle sites. Meanwhile, the buildings are considered to switch the vitalization the historical value to adapt the changing of community. For instance, Schoolwoning in the Delft now is used as a school locating a residential area, and it will be changed into a living building within decades because that the analysis indicates that this area will no longer need much school recourses due to the emigration and aging process. This forefront attitude will reuse much recourse in order to save the energy and sustainably develop.

(4) Build up working agency or community to track the preservation work specifically. In the assessment of policy transfer, Dolowitz and Marsh stated that there are basic three failures of factors (Dolowitz & Marsh, 2000): uninformed transfer, incomplete transfer, inappropriate transfer. If the job abolishes during the process, the transferring task will fail. In order to avoid this possibility, a professional group can be created to track the historic preservation project.

In the process of lesson-drawing, it can be found that many advantages in Harbin are worth be learnt by Europe. Take the construction lifecycle as an example, a constructive project in Europe can easily last years-long over consumed money and energy. But in China, the equivalent project will just take months work. Within this process, there might be much neglect for stakeholders but also saves large quality of recourses. Therefore, mutual learning process and even cooperation can be addressed in future.
Reference


Irit. (2005). Synerg between urban planning, conservation of the cultural built heritage and functional changes in the old urban center=the case of Tel aVIV. *land Use Policy(22)*, pp. 291-300.


Landmarks Law.


The leadership conference on conservancy and development.


Yan, Y.-j. (2007, 3). Distinction Between Cultural Regions and Regional Culture Regions. *Journal of Tianjin University*, pp. 115-120.

# Appendix

## Appendix 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Seq.</th>
<th>Name of historical districts</th>
<th>Architecture Classification</th>
<th>Seq.</th>
<th>Name of historical districts</th>
<th>Architecture Classification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Central pedestrian street</td>
<td>Western culture</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Residential area of Dong'an</td>
<td>Residential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>中央大街</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>东安家属区</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Traditional commercial streets in Daowai</td>
<td>Civil type Baroque culture</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Residential area of Harbin Airplane</td>
<td>Residential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>道外传统商市</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>哈飞家属区</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Hongjun Street - Central Museum area</td>
<td>Revolution &amp; commercial</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>The Remains of the War Crimes by Unit 731 of Japanese Invading Army</td>
<td>Revolution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>博物馆</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>侵华日军 731 部队罪证遗址</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Garden Street</td>
<td>Residential</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Sofia Church area</td>
<td>Religious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>花园街</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>索菲亚教堂</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Confucian Temple</td>
<td>Religious</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Railway Station Bureau</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>文庙</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>铁路局</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Jile Temple</td>
<td>Religious</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>Harbin Engineering University</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>极乐寺</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>哈尔滨工程大学</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Residential area of Linen Factory</td>
<td>Residential</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Harbin Medical University</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>亚麻厂家属区</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>哈尔滨医科大学</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Sun Island</td>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Binjiang Daoshu Historical and Cultural Park</td>
<td>Entertainment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>太阳岛</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>滨江道署历史文化公园</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Former Residence of Xiao Hong</td>
<td>Memorial</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Judaic Cemetery</td>
<td>Religious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>萧红故居</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>犹太公墓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Memorial Temple</td>
<td>Memorial</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Provincial Cadre Healthcare Resort</td>
<td>Entertainment &amp; Residential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>石公祠</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>省军区第一干休所</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Stalin Park</td>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Ma Zhongjun Graveyard</td>
<td>Memorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>斯大林公园</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>马忠骏墓园</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2

The audit form for England Streets Protection\(^\text{10}\):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street</th>
<th>Town</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tell us if you have a special point of view: are you...

- Carer with buggy
- Unsure on foot
- Wheelchair user
- Other?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paving</th>
<th>Obtrusive adverts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Messy</td>
<td>Too many</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broken or uneven</td>
<td>On walls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badly repaired</td>
<td>On bus shelters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anything else!</td>
<td>Anything else!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signs</th>
<th>Street lighting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Too many</td>
<td>Too much</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the way</td>
<td>In the way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ugly</td>
<td>Not enough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anything else!</td>
<td>In the way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anything else!</td>
<td>Covered in graffiti</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guardrails</th>
<th>Benches</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Too many</td>
<td>Broken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the way</td>
<td>In the way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not right for here</td>
<td>Not right for here</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anything else!</td>
<td>Covered in graffiti</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Telephone boxes</th>
<th>Plant containers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broken</td>
<td>Broken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not right for here</td>
<td>Not right for here</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the way</td>
<td>In the way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Covered in adverts or graffiti</td>
<td>Covered in adverts or graffiti</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bollards</th>
<th>Anything else?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broken</td>
<td>Your details</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the way</td>
<td>Name:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not right for here</td>
<td>Address</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Covered in adverts or graffiti</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Litter bins</th>
<th>Bus stops/shelters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broken</td>
<td>Broken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the way</td>
<td>In the way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not right for here</td>
<td>Not right for here</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Covered in adverts or graffiti</td>
<td>Covered in adverts or graffiti</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{10}\) The reference can be tracked from:

http://www.english-heritage.org.uk/professional/advice/advice-by-topic/planning-and-transport/streets-for-all/street-clutter-audit/