Between the Museum as City
and City as Museum

Stephan Bastiaans
MSc Thesis
Between the **Museum as City**
and **City as Museum**

Stephan Bastiaans
*taught by ir. Elise van Dooren*

MSc Thesis
Explore Lab
Faculty of Architecture
TU Delft

September 2020
# Table of Content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection of projects</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Physical continuity</strong></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permeable facade / Storefront for Art and Architecture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spatial continuity / Rietveld Pavilion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Visual connection</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Framed view / Whitney Museum of American Art</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City as scenery / Neue Nationalgalerie</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutual visibility / Towada Art Centre</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflected view / Hedge two-way Mirror Walkabout</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Art at threshold</strong></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dressed fortress / Museum Beelden aan Zee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sculpture garden / Museu de Arte Moderno de Sao Paulo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open-air gallery / MIMOGA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Art and architecture merged</strong></td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art as architecture / Tilted Arc</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture as art / Museo Guggenheim</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture as stage / Conical Intersect</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>City incorporation</strong></td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban fabric / M-Museum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban routing / Neue Staatsgalerie</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intrusiveness</strong></td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blockade / Design Museum Tank</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City branding / Museo Guggenheim</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dynamic museum</strong></td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobile museum / IBM Travelling Pavilion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary museum / A Arte Chegou ao Colombo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-museum / The Shed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Decentralised museum</strong></td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scattered museum / Insel Hombroich</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exhibition network / What a Wonderful World</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museum outpost / Tate Modern</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social inclusiveness</strong></td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusive location / Metro Louvre-Rivoli</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusive subject / Well Hung Lover</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conclusions and discussion</strong></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflection</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bibliography</strong></td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Image library</strong></td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

Much has changed between the first art museums and those of contemporary times. The Enlightenment belief that culture is a common right and can improve humankind resulted in the opening of private art collections to the public from the 18th century onward. Comprised of neoclassical architecture featuring colonnades, grand staircases and enfilades, museums were enclosed bastions of culture. The Parisian Musée du Louvre is one of the oldest examples. Originally a royal palace, it opened up displaying the French national art collection since 1793.

In the course of the 20th century the secluded museum architecture was increasingly questioned. Goodwin and Stone’s MoMA (1939) gently explored the potential of the art museum as a third place, a space of public encounter and community interaction. This idea was brought to a climax in Piano and Rogers’ Centre Culturel Georges Pompidou (1977), with its public plaza coming in and open-to-all shops, cafeteria and cinema. Piano and Rogers proved to have conceived a successful strategy, in the light of the many contemporary museums still employing their formula. I.M. Pei’s Carrousel du Louvre (1993) added a shopping centre to the existing museum; Neutelings Riedijk’s MAS (2010) had the outdoor public space extend into the building and spiral skyward, granting wide views on the city.

At the same time and nearly without exception, art in museums is still heavily isolated from the outside world. In exhibition spaces shaped as white cubes, the art is said to be free “to take on its own life” and to appear “untouched by time and its vicissitudes”. But despite its prevalence, the white cube is often criticised. Adorno, to whom museums and mausoleums share more than just phonetics, argues that art in museums owes its preservation more to historical consideration than present use.

This study is meant to explore which design principles can be distinguished that serve to improve the relationship between a work of art and its urban context. If art wants to regain and expand its present cultural, rather than historical significance, it needs to intensify contact with life. Under influence of society art’s meaning can be changed, its appearance transformed and its expression intensified; under influence of art society’s diversity can be enlarged, its creativity enhanced and its substance enriched. The introverted architecture of the white cube does not at all answer to those requirements. The city, a socially, economically and physically diverse environment layered together into a complex and dynamic structure of human co-existence, is eminently the most suitable platform to perform this exploration.

By precedent analysis of 40 projects both the material (e.g. architectural, urban) and immaterial (e.g. social) quality of prevailing art-city relationships was studied. The selection of projects is as precise as it is expansive. Included is a wide range of art venues and art manifestations, in order to avoid being confined to the conventions of the archetypical art museum. The selection stretches from Marcel Breuer’s Whitney Museum of American Art (1966) as most recognisable art museum, to Richard Serra’s Tilted Arc (1981-1989) as full fusion of art and architecture; yet all were chosen for, and thus have in common, a unique approach to the relationship between their content and environment.

The analysis was executed in three stages. As the particular interior-exterior relationship studied here has never before been submitted to a comprehensive architectural analysis, no frame of reference was available as guidance. In the first stage, a coarse and intuitive analysis of all 40 precedent projects helped to institute a framework, and patterns started to emerge as the study continued. It presented nine principles to focus on during the second stage. Examples are visual connection, city incorporation and social inclusiveness. When the findings were not longer novel but repetitive, the second analysis was started. This stage had a much more rational and methodical approach. Every project was studied in text and drawings, systematically and thoroughly in accordance to the established principles. It revealed a lot of variation and nuance amongst the projects within a principle. For the decentralised museum that resulted in three distinct elaborations: the scattered museum, exhibition network and museum outpost. In the final stage all projects were analysed for one last time, for the sake of finding the most suitable representation per elaboration to be included in this thesis. Naturally, the entire analysis was a highly iterative process as each new bit of information redefined the (sub)principles and decided whether a priorly selected precedent was still relevant or up for replacement.

The nine deducted design principles correspond to the nine chapters of this thesis. Every chapter has an identical layout containing an introductory text, followed by the dissection of two to four projects that explain the principle in its distinct way. This is visualised through text, drawing and photomontage. Together they resemble a catalogue. The thesis ends with conclusions and a discussion, in which the results will be given meaning and turned into recommendations for professionals who may wish to apply them.
Selection of projects

**La Boîte-en-Valise**
- mobile
- Marcel Duchamp
- 1936

**Rietveld Pavilion**
- Otterlo, Netherlands
- Gerrit Rietveld
- 1955

**Neue Nationalgalerie**
- Berlin, Germany
- Mies van der Rohe
- 1968

**Métro Louvre-Rivoli**
- Paris, France
- unknown
- 1968

**Freetown Christiania**
- Copenhagen, Denmark
- various
- 1971

**P.S.1 Art Center**
- New York, USA
- unknown
- 1976

**Centre Pompidou**
- Paris, France
- Piano & Rogers
- 1977

**Museum for Pollock**
- unbuilt
- Peter Blake
- 1949

**Whitney Museum**
- New York, USA
- Marcel Breuer
- 1966

**MASP**
- São Paulo, Brazil
- Lina Bo Bardi
- 1968

**112 Greene Street**
- New York, USA
- unknown
- 1970

**Conical Intersect**
- Paris, France
- Gordon Matta-Clark
- 1975
**Tilted Arc**
New York, USA
Richard Serra
1981-1989

**IBM Traveling Pavilion**
mobile
Renzo Piano
1982-1986

**MAM Sculpture Garden**
São Paulo, Brazil
Roberto Burle Marx
1993

**Neue Staatsgalerie**
Stuttgart, Germany
James Stirling
1984

**Insel Hombroich**
Neuss, Germany
Erwin Heerich
1987

**Design Museum Tank**
London, UK
Conran Roche
1989?

**What a Wonderful World**
Groningen, Netherlands
various
1990

**MIMOCA**
Marugame, Japan
Yoshio Taniguchi
1991

**Storefr. for Art & Arch.**
New York, USA
V. Acconci and S. Holl
1993

**Beelden aan Zee**
Den Haag, Netherlands
Wim Quist
1994

**Garden of Fine Arts**
Kyoto, Japan
Tadao Ando
1994

**Groninger Museum**
Groningen, Netherlands
Allessandro Mendini
1994

**Chiesa Rossa**
Milan, Italy
Dan Flavin
1996

**Museo Guggenheim**
Bilbao, Spain
Frank Gehry
1997
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Builder/Designer</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Den Haag Sculptuur</td>
<td>Den Haag, Netherlands</td>
<td>various</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1998-2017</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tate Modern</td>
<td>London, UK</td>
<td>Herzog &amp; de Meuron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasher Center</td>
<td>Dallas, USA</td>
<td>Renzo Piano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleinmuseum</td>
<td>mobile</td>
<td>René van Engelenburg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2004-2007</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Well Hung Lover</td>
<td>Bristol, UK</td>
<td>Banksy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2006</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towada Art Center</td>
<td>Towada, Japan</td>
<td>Ryue Nishizawa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2008</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M-Museum</td>
<td>Leuven, Belgium</td>
<td>Stéphane Beel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Arte Chegou</td>
<td>Lisbon, Portugal</td>
<td>various</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2011-present</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mmuseumm</td>
<td>New York, USA</td>
<td>What? Studio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hedge two-way Mirror</td>
<td>New York, USA</td>
<td>Dan Graham</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fondazione Prada</td>
<td>Milan, Italy</td>
<td>OMA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2015</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAIT</td>
<td>Los Angeles, USA</td>
<td>various</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2016-present</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructionism</td>
<td>Philadelphia, USA</td>
<td>Pentagram</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2017-2020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Shed</td>
<td>New York, USA</td>
<td>DS+R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2019</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There is a vast discrepancy between the critical characteristics in terms of security, safety and climate that vulnerable art demands of its habitat, and the environment that the city offers by nature. Hence, the existence of the museum as contained microcosm with its own rules is legitimate, as is the collaterally emerging hard boundary between city and museum. Architecture is capable of making a smooth transition through such boundaries.

The *permeable facade* looks solely at the most prominent edge of the building, which can be minimised by dissolving it. In contrast, *spatial continuity* assesses the holistic building in its organisation of space.
PERMEABLE FACADE

The border between exterior and interior space dissolves as the facade, whose function it is to divide, is breached. Inside and outside are spatially distinguishable, but movement between is eased. Might conflict with security and climate demands.

Vito Acconci and Steven Holl

STOREFRONT FOR ART AND ARCHITECTURE New York, USA (1993)

The long facade of the narrow museum is punctured by pivoting panels. When opened, the interior space expands on to the exterior sidewalk. “Acconci and Holl challenged this symbolic border which underlines the exclusivity of the art world, where only those on the inside belong.”
SPATIAL CONTINUITY

Building spaces overlap at their intersection, which blurs their spatial demarcations as experienced by users and instead unifies the sequence of movement between outside-inside, inside-inside, and inside-outside into one flowing continuity.

Gerrit Rietveld
RIETVELD PAVILION Otterlo, Netherlands (1955)

“The hollow space and the light determine the value of the architecture within, around and inbetween the boundaries, which are only there to define the space”4, Rietveld said about his temporary exhibition pavilion in the Sonsbeek Park. In 1964 it was rebuilt in the sculpture garden of the Kröller-Müller Museum.
Glass tricks the mind: even though it may offer physical security from e.g. climatological threats, its quality to dematerialise the boundary between interior and exterior establishes a real dialogue between either side. Their perceptive spatial unity feeds the art with context and the city with culture, but opponents despise the disturbed autonomy of the artworks.

The most obvious, though not common expression of visual connection is the regular window in *(framed view)*. Reflection plays an important role in the ability to see through glass. It separates the unilaterally transparent *(city as scenery)* from the bilateral *(mutual visibility)* and the *(reflected view)*, which superimposes the reflection on the view of interior and exterior.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FRAMED VIEW</th>
<th>CITY AS SCENERY</th>
<th>MUTUAL VISIBILITY</th>
<th>REFLECTED VIEW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Whitney Museum</td>
<td>Neue Nationalgalerie</td>
<td>Towada Art Center</td>
<td>Hedge two-way Mirror</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S.1 Art Center</td>
<td>MASP</td>
<td>Museum for Pollock</td>
<td>Design Museum Tank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insel Hombroich</td>
<td>Centre Pompidou</td>
<td>Rietveld Pavilion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groninger Museum</td>
<td>IBM Travelling Pavilion</td>
<td>MAM Sculpture Garden</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fondazione Prada</td>
<td>Insel Hombroich</td>
<td>Insel Hombroich</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beelden aan Zee</td>
<td>What a Wonderful World</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fondazione Prada</td>
<td>Nasher Sculpture Center</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FRAMED VIEW

Windows contradict programmatic museum demands such as maximised wall space, and are not needed for their ventilating and lighting qualities. They do provide connection to the exterior as a relief from the completely contained interior.

Marcel Breuer
WHITNEY MUSEUM New York, USA (1966)

The visual distraction the windows offer is amplified by their distinct trapezoid shape and slight angle, in contrast to the frontally viewed rectangular paintings. The 20º to 25º angle prevent direct sunlight from coming in.
CITY AS SCENERY

From the museum interior, wide views of the cityscape are granted as backdrop to the art. It allows the art to interact with the urban environment. The relationship is single-sided as the museum is visually inaccessible from the outside.

Ludwig Mies van der Rohe

NEUE NATIONALGALERIE Berlin, Germany (1968)

Implementation of Mies’ 1943 Museum for a Small City study. The slightly elevated temporary exhibition space is enclosed by a full glass facade. According to Mies, “the connection between art and reality must be irrefutably apparent” Critics believed the space was inhospitable.
MUTUAL VISIBILITY

Besides having the city as scenery to the art, the interior is now visible from the street as well. Like storefronts, it allows the urban environment to interact with the displayed. This way it not only communises art, but as corporate strategy also lures people in.

Ryue Nishizawa
TOWADA ART CENTER Towada, Japan (2008)

“This building, as an integral part of the concept of transforming [...] Kanchogaidori avenue into an art museum, inevitably needs to be open and approachable.”7 Through the glazed facades of the gallery boxes, each of which are designed for a specific work, lives the art in symbiosis with the surrounding nature and cityscape.
REFLECTED VIEW

Half-mirrored glass adds a third player to the visual relationship between interior and exterior: oneself. It forces the audience to take a participatory role, actively communicating through the reflection of their own body with the art and the city.

Dan Graham
HEDGE TWO-WAY MIRROR WALKABOUT New York, USA (2014)

“[...] the inside and outside views are both quasi-reflective and quasi-transparent, and they superimpose intersubjective images of inside and outside viewers’ bodies and gazes along with the landscape”. Dan Grahams half mirrored glass pavilions need people moving in and out of them and are thus social, not minimal-art sculptures.
ART AT THRESHOLD

The threshold refers to the moment where the interior, conditioned home to the art, meets the exterior, public home to society. As the former principles focused on pulling in society, the threshold could also be softened by pushing out the art so that the exterior becomes an extension of the interior, instead of the opposite. However, its feasibility partly depends on the sturdiness of the works of art and the friendliness of the environment. Sculptures and replicas seem most suitable.

The way architecture complies to this principle ranges from the passive *dressed fortress* to highly active *open-air gallery*, with the *sculpture garden* in between as perhaps its most famous expression.

DRESSED FORTRESS  SCULPTURE GARDEN  OPEN-AIR GALLERY

Beelden aan Zee  MIMOCA
Métro Louvre-Rivoli  Rietveld Pavilion
Museo Guggenheim  P.S.1 Art Center*
Constructionism  Towada Art Center

*at present the principle applies to this project, but it did not upon establishment*
DRESSED FORTRESS

Art surrounding the outside of the impenetrable museum building forms an imaginative transition belt. In a similar way, the neoclassicist facades of Enlightenment museums were decorated with sculptures of the ancient Greek Muses.

Wim Quist

BEELDEN AAN ZEE Den Haag, Netherlands (1994)

The museum is introvertedly dug into the Scheveningen dunes and withdrawn from the boulevard to become one with its natural environment. It is surrounded by 30 fairytale-inspired sculptures by Tom Otterness.
SCULPTURE GARDEN

The public realm of the city and the outwardly expanding museum overlap at their intersection, combining as an open recreational park as much wider transition zone between the two. The museum building is not (necessarily) an enclosed fortress.

Roberto Burle Marx

MAM SCULPTURE GARDEN São Paulo, Brazil (1993)

The Museu de Arte Moderna sits in a Lina Bo Bardi-transformed canopy structure in the metropolitan Ibirapuera Park, originally designed by Oscar Niemeyer. 30 modern sculptures by primarily Brazilian artists are scattered across the park.
OPEN-AIR GALLERY

Opposite to its interior expanding out, the museum is now physically penetrated by the city. The architecture takes an active role in capturing this confrontation, merging in and out harmoniously together into an open-air gallery space.

Yoshio Taniguchi
MIMOCA Marugame, Japan (1991)

MIMOCA is the autographic museum for artist Genichiro Inokuma. Station Plaza extends into the museum under a loggia-like structure as public interior space, comparable to Loggia dei Lanzi of the Uffizi Galleries in Florence, Italy.
ART AND ARCHITECTURE MERGED

This study considers the relationship between art and the city with the building (usually the museum) as connecting member: art — architecture — city. An alternative approach to smoothening the transitions at their joints is to clear up the tie by synthesis of “art” and “architecture”, cutting the distance to society in half: art/architecture — city. A known typological example is the folly. If the building remains a museum, its sculptural quality might start to compete with the exhibited art.

The synthesis can be approached from both sides: art being spatial in {art as architecture}, or architecture being sculptural in {architecture as art}. The building is an autonomous object in {architecture as stage}, but with a much tighter connection to the work of art it exhibits.

ART AS ARCHITECTURE  ARCHITECTURE AS ART  ARCHITECTURE AS STAGE

Tilted Arc  Museo Guggenheim  Conical Intersect
La Boîte-en-Valise  Freetown Christiania  Chiesa Rossa
Hedge two-way Mirror  What a Wonderful World  What a Wonderful World
Groninger Museum  Pleinmuseum  Well Hung Lover
ART AS ARCHITECTURE

When the artist turns to the architect's toolbox in terms of scale, materiality, light, creation or modification of the way space is used, his work can be considered architecture as well. The interaction between viewer and object is much more explicit.

Richard Serra
TILTED ARC New York, USA (1981-1989)

“I attempt to use sculptural form to make space distinct”

The 37m long, 3.7m tall corten steel sculpture resembles an architectural wall by its dimensions and solidity. Serra wanted the public to engage with his sculpture in a physical, rather than visual way.
ARCHITECTURE AS ART

When the architect emphasises the sculptural nature of the architecture, the public will not only consider the building by its functional and social, but also by its artistic qualities. It becomes a public work of art, culturally enriching the city.

Frank Gehry
MUSEO GUGGENHEIM Bilbao, Spain (1997)

“I don’t know where you cross the line between architecture and sculpture. For me, it’s the same. Buildings and sculpture are three-dimensional objects”², according to Frank Gehry at the Guggenheim opening eve.
ARCHITECTURE AS STAGE

The museum is a container of art, but their relationship can be much more intimate. When the work of art parasites on the architecture, i.e. inherently needs the building to exist, it is symbiotic. They may go as far as becoming a gesamtkunstwerk.

Gordon Matta-Clark

**CONICAL INTERSECT** *Paris, France (1975)*

Although trained as architect at Cornell University, avant-garde Matta-Clark explored space through de(con)structive interventions such as cutting and splitting, labelled ‘anarchitecture’: “Anarchitecture is about making space without new building it”\(^3\)
CITY INCORPORATION

Since the city is made up by its constituents, the constituent (in this case a building) carries a part of the city by definition. Its distance to the art would decrease in case of a harmonious merger of both. Architecture could change the face of a city, but considering the impact needed to achieve that it is much more efficient for the building to adapt to the city. A true synthesis between the two, like *art and architecture merged*, is in fact only conceptually possible.

For the elaboration of this principle the city is coarsely split in two layers. The incorporation of architecture into the visible structure of the city, such as form and material, is evaluated in *(urban fabric)*, whereas *(urban routing)* takes on the integration in city logistics as invisible structure.

### URBAN FABRIC

**M-Museum**  
Conical Intersect  
P.S.1 Art Center  
Beelden aan Zee  
Chiesa Rossa  
Tate Modern  
Well Hung Lover  
Mmuseumm  
Fondazione Prada

### URBAN ROUTING

**Neue Staatsgalerie**  
Métro Louvre-Rivoli  
Design Museum Tank  
What a Wonderful World  
Groninger Museum  
Den Haag Sculpptuur  
A Arte Chegou Colombo
URBAN FABRIC

The museum or work of art responds in its manifestation to the precise physical conditions of the urban environment in terms of e.g. form, scale, density and materiality. Such site specific approaches result in a strong cohesion between object and city.

Stéphane Beel
M-MUSEUM Leuven, Belgium (2009)

“the spatial, social and cultural elements of the surroundings shape the design, yet are also transformed by it. [...] The new strengthens the old while distracting itself from it” says Beel. M integrates through travertine cladding and line articulation, but confirms its autonomy in form language, confronting yet complementing the old buildings.
URBAN ROUTING

The organisation of the museum is interlaced with the city logistics as a public passage leads through its core, connecting two detached parts of the city. It is up to the architectural elaboration to confirm whether the art itself becomes part of this braid.

James Stirling

**NEUE STAATSGALERIE** Stuttgart, Germany (1984)

Stirling’s 20th-century modern art museum leads pedestrians from Urbanstraße (r), around its central rotunda and via two ramps, towards the Stuttgart city centre.
Like *city incorporation*, the focus of this principle lies on the tie between “architecture” and “the city”, but now seeks for maximal upset rather than maximal integration. The building breaks from the prevailing urban conditions in scale, style, position with such magnitude that it forces the city to rearrange in accordance with the new situation. The relationship that emerges is comparable to one between protagonist and nemesis – violent yet tight. It is an aggressive strategy with an impact on society. The impact may be physical on a microscale, as in *blockade*, or psychological on a macroscale, as in *city branding*. Naturally, other compositions are possible as well.

### INTRUSIVENESS

**BLOCKADE**
- Design Museum Tank
- Tilted Arc
- Storefront for Art & Arch.
- Pleinmuseum
- A Arte Chegou ao Colombo

**CITY BRANDING**
- Museo Guggenheim
- Centre Pompidou
BLECADE

Shamelessly conspicuous placement of the museum or artwork in the public realm has it interfere with the way people use the space. But, whilst pedestrians and cyclists have to circumvent this obstacle, they also become more aware of its presence.

Conran Roche
DESIGN MUSEUM TANK London, UK (1989?)
In front of their (now former) residence along river Thames, the Design Museum occupied the riverside walk with a 45m³ permanent glass installation space. Artists, design studios and creative agencies like Vitra and Paul Smith were invited to temporarily showcase their work in a site specific exhibition.
CITY BRANDING

Named after the following project, ‘Bilbao effect’ describes the phenomenon where the combination of cultural investment and iconic architecture catalyses local economic development. Rather than adjusting to the city, the museum becomes its new face.

Greetings from BILBAO

MUSEO GUGGENHEIM Bilbao, Spain (1997)

Museo Guggenheim is the namegiver and one of the few succesful examples of the Bilbao effect. Gehry’s design was the cornerstone in the regeneration of an industrial city in decline to a tourist magnet, as its grandness transformed Bilbao’s skyline not only physically: it also equals the city in name and fame.

Frank Gehry

search = “bilbao”
results = 84
results containing Guggenheim = 37
contribution = (37/84)*100% = 44%
The city is a dynamic place and so is its society, but its built property is rigid. Once constructed, most buildings leave little room for different use without severe adaptation. This causes trouble over the years when the building can less and less meet the city’s changing demands. A more flexible architecture would be able to remodel itself to society, sustaining their strong relationship in the future. Implementation of the dynamic museum can have beneficial side effects. As it turns out, it unlocks opportunities within the urban realm such as access to prime locations in the cases of the *mobile museum* and *temporary museum*, respectively flexible in the spatial and temporal dimension. Space sharing in the *co-museum* ensures the utilisation of precious public space outside opening times.

**MOBILE MUSEUM**

- IBM Travelling Pavilion
- La Boîte-en-Valise
- Pleinmuseum

**TEMPORARY MUSEUM**

- A Arte Chegou
- Den Haag Sculptuur
- GAIT

**CO-MUSEUM**

- The Shed
- Chiesa Rossa
MOBILE MUSEUM

The mobile museum is highly accessible because it can actively go out to the people, instead of having to await their visit. Its connected size and demountability makes it easy to settle at central and/or densely populated such as urban parks and squares.

Renzo Piano

IBM TRAVELLING PAVILION mobile (1982-2986)

The demountable pavilion travelled across Europe in an attempt to promote advancing computer technologies. The 48 x 12 x 6m structure landed in urban parks in the centre of 20 major cities, like the Champ-de-Mars in Paris and Parco della Mole Adriana in Rome, for one month each. The exhibition was ultimately visited by 1.5 million people.
TEMPORARY MUSEUM

Temporary exhibitions are vital for museum success, i.a. to keep drawing people in (having nothing new to see is a main reason not to visit\(^\text{10}\)) and to react to changing communities. It may also prevail autonomously, as a dynamic event in urban activity.

A ARTE CHEGOU AO COLOMBO Lisbon, Portugal (2011-present)

A temporary art gallery returns every summer to the atrium of the Colombo shopping mall. Each year focuses on a different artist (such as Andy Warhol in 2013 and Roy Lichtenstein in 2018), in collaboration with a different art institution, and dwelled by a different architect. Freely accessible, the exhibition averages 1000 visitors per day.
CO-MUSEUM

The concept of “space sharing” creates a dynamic relationship between the city and its interiors, as a wider range of people makes use of the building at, potentially, a larger part of the day. It shows similarities to the idea of the museum as third place.

Diller Scofidio + Renfro
THE SHED New York, USA (2019)

The Shed is a nonprofit cultural organisation for the presentation and performance of art across all disciplines in the Hudson Yards. The buildings features a protractable outer shell of ETFE panels that can turn the adjacent public plaza into a 1600m² climatised space for installations, performances and events.
DECENTRAL MUSEUM

Decentralisation is a concept that has the museum entity divided in multiple separate pieces rather than remaining one unity. In its new capacity, the museum can disperse across a larger area and dissolve like a chemical suspension in the urban fabric. In addition, the typically internal circulation space of the museum moves to the exterior, overlaying and interlacing with the running networks of the city. The \{scattered museum\} describes the museum entity split up in dispersed art spaces, whereas the \{exhibition network\} turns it around and merges autonomous art spaces into one chain. The best-known method of decentralisation is probably the \{museum outpost\}, which has the museum founding branches of its own institution on an urban, national or global scale.

SCATTERED MUSEUM  EXHIBITION NETWORK  MUSEUM OUTPOST

Insel Hombroich
Rietveld Pavilion
Freetown Christiania
Design Museum Tank
Fondazione Prada

What a Wonderful World
Den Haag Sculptuur

Tate Modern
La Boîte-en-Valise
Whitney Museum*
Neue Nationalgalerie
P.S.1 Art Center*
Centre Pompidou*
Museo Guggenheim

*at present the principle applies to this project, but it did not upon establishment
SCATTERED MUSEUM

The gallery spaces are separated and spread over a larger area. The environment (natural or urban) is its new corridor, becoming part of the museum experience as the alternation between inside and outside relieves the mind from the viewing of art.

Erwin Heerich

INSEL HOMBROICH Neuss, Germany (1987)

Made up of 12 pavilions, similar in material and geometric sculpturality but distinct in shape and arrangement, the museum is scattered out across a natural landscape. Initiator Müller wanted a museum “where nature is as important as art”, equating interior with exterior.
EXHIBITION NETWORK

Rather than an overall museum broken up, there is a collection of structures for art exhibition spread across the city that can either operate independently, or make up a network together. Often they have an event, not an institution in common.

WHAT A WONDERFUL WORLD Groningen, Netherlands (1990)

For the 950th anniversary of the city of Groningen, the manifestation ‘What a Wonderful World: Music Videos in Architecture’ was launched. Five pavilions explored the relationship between digital art, architecture and the public realm.
MUSEUM OUTPOST

Establishment of external satellites of an institution, in comparison to internal expansion, maintains a more manageable museum size for the audience. As autonomous branches they dissolve and consequently reach a larger public.

Herzog & de Meuron


Tate Gallery consists of four museums: Tate Britain (1897) and its outposts Tate Liverpool (1988), Tate St. Ives (1993) and Tate Modern (2000).
SOCIAL INCLUSIVENESS

The distance between art in museums and urban life is not only the result of physical obstacles. The city is a socially highly diverse place containing people of all ethnicities, ages and socio-economic classes, but social barriers complicate some groups to establish a strong relationship with the museum. Whether this is truly due to poor inclusivity or not, certain stigmas must be resolved to make the museum audience an honest representation of civil society.

*inclusive location* reconsiders the museum as a place, socially inaccessible by its mere existence. *inclusive art* does not so much address architectural issues but suggests to exhibit a more diverse collection. Under these circumstances museums may appeal to a wider audience.

ACCESS: LOCATION

Métro Louvre-Rivoli
La Boîte-en-Valise
112 Greene Street
Freetown Christiania
Conical Intersect
PS1 Art Center
Tilted Arc
Design Museum Tank
What a Wonderful World
Chiesa Rossa
Den Haag Sculptuur
Pleinmuseum
Well Hung Lover
A Arte Chegou
Mmuseumm
Constructionism

ACCESS: ART

Well Hung Lover
La Boîte-en-Valise
Tilted Arc
IBM Travelling Pavilion
Design Museum Tank
What a Wonderful World
Chiesa Rossa
Hedge Two-Way Mirror
Museum attendance is not equally high among all social groups: people of lower education or of ethnic origin other than white describe to feel out of place\textsuperscript{12}. Placement of art in diversified public places takes away both that social barrier.

\textbf{André Malraux}

\textbf{MÉTRO LOUVRE-RIVOLI} Paris, France (1968)

Former French minister of culture had replicas of famous ancient artworks from Musée du Louvre, such as Venus de Milo, placed in metro station Louvre-Rivoli. The diversity of people making use of the metro, and thus encountering the works of art in this \textit{antichambre} of the museum, is far wider than in the museum itself.
INCLUSIVE ART

Although the establishment of the museum diminished its exclusivity, visual arts are generally regarded as ‘high’ (in contrast to ‘mass’) culture. But the arts can appeal to a wider audience, as anti-bourgeois movements like dada and pop art proved.

Banksy
WELL HUNG LOVER  
Bristol, UK (2006)

Banksy addresses political, social and moral issues with humour, satire and a popular visual language. “This is the first time the essentially bourgeois world of art has belonged to the people,” he said. Well Hung Lover, on the side wall of a sexual health clinic, is about the earthly themes of love, sex and trust.
Conclusions and discussion

The connection between art and the city is in many cases one between the public interior and exterior of a building, a common encounter in architecture. This report has presented nine design principles that could be adopted in order to improve their relationship. In *physical continuity* the spatial progression from exterior to interior (and vice versa) was addressed, followed by its visually perceived continuity in *visual relationship*. The art itself as uniting force stood central in *art at threshold*. It turned out that the tie between art and the city could be shortened when two players involved would be combined, respectively art and architecture in *art and architecture merged*, and the city and architecture in *city incorporation*. *Intrusiveness* is an aggressive strategy that forces the art on the city. The *dynamic museum* questioned the capacity of conventional museums to adapt to a changing urban environment, and the *decentral museum* the role of scale in its assimilation by the city. Finally, *social inclusiveness* looked beyond the architectural and searched society for an answer to the problem.

The principles could be found in precedent projects in various shapes. As an example, a *visual relationship* between interior and exterior can be one-way or two-way, in framed or panorama view and reflected or not: each of such elaborations has unique consequences on the way the relation is perceived by the public. Therefore they all carry value. With two to four distinct elaborations per principle, each visualised with one existing project, a nearly complete image was created of the factors that influence the tie between art and the city.

However, a number of differences between themselves makes it difficult to compare principles to each other. The most fundamental difference is the sphere they apply to. Besides architecture, the studied relationship involves the fields of art and the city. Art and the city are not numb, but many-faced variables in their own interrelationship that can be designed, or else be designed with. The city, being a complex system of human co-existence, can be described in a physical (e.g. *city incorporation*) as well as psychological (e.g. *intrusiveness*) and social manner (e.g. *social inclusiveness*). Art too can take different roles of which the report has shown a few. For example, in contrast to the gallery-exhibited art in most projects, art as design instrument (*art at threshold*) and public art (*social inclusiveness*). The urban strategies differ from the artistic in substance, like both do from the architectural (e.g. *physical continuity*). That also means that not all of the presented principles are practically useful to every professional. As an example, the architect’s influence on the location, collection and philosophy of a museum is negligible.

Although they cannot all be compared, it is possible to learn lessons from the principles, individually or grouped. Those lessons can in its turn be understood as recommendations for those in architecture, urbanism, art or the museum business who may wish to put them in practice.

In the first place it is not essential to treat the transition from art, through architecture, to the city (and vice versa) as one whole. Yes, the most elegant form of architecture here would reach out to either side and smoothly connect interior to exterior, but that is sometimes not possible. One could be dealing with protected heritage which only allows minimal modification, or a troublesome location. Instead, the tie could be divided in two:
from art to architecture, and from architecture to city. The former can be explained by \{city as scenery\} as one-sided visual relationship, and the latter by \{urban routing\} in city incorporation. Whilst either on itself does not carry much significance in this study, their combination would achieve a strong, integral transition from inside to outside.

Secondly, the relationship between art and the city is bidirectional, i.e. about the transition from both outside to inside and inside to outside, but not all principles necessarily are. \{city as scenery\} in visual relationship can again exemplify this. It does not mean that the application of such principles should be avoided. A unidirectional relationship between art and the city may be desired, depending on the (urban, artistic) conditions of a museum-like building. In general, however, a bidirectional relationship is preferred because of the positive influence it can have on both the art and urban environment.

On a more technical note, some of the presented principles could be in conflict with each other or with different building demands. For example, it would be difficult to combine the inherently contradicting city incorporation with intrusiveness. More problematic are the technical requirements of art exhibition spaces for security, safety and climatic conditions such as temperature, humidity and light. After all, conservation of art is also one of the core tasks of the museum. To keep heat or cold, rain, wind and sunlight, vandals or thieves out means nearly automatically to impose hard boundaries between the exterior and interior of a museum. In practice, the execution of a principle like physical continuity is hardly feasible but for a few exceptions shown in the studied precedents: when the displayed is of low monetary value (Storefront for Art and Architecture), or robust and secure enough by itself (Rietveld Pavilion, or public art like Tilted Arc). In one case the most vulnerable art was exposed to the climatic conditions of the outside by conviction of its owner Müller: Insel Hombroichs decentralised museum is largely uninsulated, unclimatised and open-doored. Even transparent facades to establish a visual connection can cause problems with preservation (ultraviolet light) and presentation (uncontrolled lighting): the Neue Nationalgalerie used to cover its glass facade with curtains. It only shows how sensitive museums are when dealing with such potentially dangerous principles. If applied, their architectural elaboration should be delicate and precise.

Besides the technical, the ethical desirability of specific principles should be questioned as well. This concern is mainly relevant to intrusiveness, the pompous method of aggressively imposing art on a site. Even though the demonstrated projects at first glance did not do any harm to the city, many other precedents show how critical its application can be. Tilted Arc as \{blockade\} was removed after years of turmoil and lawsuits, and, despite the economic catalyst Museo Guggenheim has become, the Guggenheim effect as \{city branding\} has barely been successful after. Disruption of the city comes with a high price, and designers will have to ask themselves whether that is worth it.

A fifth remark that must be made is that thoughtless implementation of any of the presented principles will in most cases fail to result in a strong relationship between art and city. Naturally, there are certain more general preconditions to which a project must answer. Location is essential. If a location is not (highly) urban, neither will the interior be regardless of all possible effort. Similarly, an outward-oriented internal organisation of gallery spaces is often desired. A visually connected museum is not uncommon, but in nearly all cases established with servant interior spaces like circulation and shops rather than the exhibition rooms. The principles are precise and so should their application be.
As compromise between art preservation and presentation the museum has proved to
be a rather fruitful concept, but the absence of architecture would, as is shown, bring art a
lot closer to the audience. So, finally, the institution itself is up for reconsideration as well.
This report has put forward a few alternatives to the archetypical museum. Smart models
as a decentralised configuration or a moveable architecture unlock unprecedented oppor-
tunities in terms of accessibility, but at the same time demand all institutional conventions
to be revised and rebuilt. Perhaps it is not necessary to go as far as to replace, but can
those models complement the museum. A Arte Chegou ao Colombo is a good example
of a collaboration between a shopping mall and (changing) museum. Besides the fact that
the returning exhibition at such a central spot democratises art, both the mall and museum
benefit from the publicity.

Earlier in the conclusion it was stated that this thesis created a nearly complete image of
the factors that shape the relationship between art and the city. That does not mean that
the results are definitive and restrained from discussion. The process of precedent analy-
sis is structured yet subjective, and leaves room for personal interpretation by the author.
That is why the notions of “true” and “false” are of less relevance in studies like these. It
is perfectly possible that the execution of the same study by another author would result in
more or fewer principles differently named, differently organised and by different projects
explained. However, in its core those principles would touch upon the same reality as the
ones presented here.

One controversy that the report leaves open is whether a stronger relationship between
art and the city is in fact favourable. As precedent projects like Insel Hombroich and Riet-
veld Pavilion have shown, the positive influence of nature on the museum visitor experi-
ence has already been embraced. In case of the city, both voices sound loud but are usually
grounded in personal belief rather than scientific proof. Monitoring and surveying of mu-
seum audience could give a definitive answer in that respect. In any case does this report
provide useful tools and ideas to keep the development of the museum on its toes.
Reflection

In over 12 months a general interest in museum architecture had developed into a study, and the study in its turn in a design proposal. This tie was as close as it sounds. The concrete design principles, which were derived from a number of precedent analyses in the research phase, formed the unambiguous guideline towards, and foundation of the established “Leiden Civic Museum”.

Unsurprisingly, precedent analysis proved to be a suitable research method in this instance. The results showed great variation in relevant and approved real-world possibilities, ready to be used by different professionals in the fields of architecture, urbanism or art (including art exhibition) as I did in my design project. The study is a tool to achieve a stronger relationship between the public and its cultural heritage. However, caution and precision is needed in the implementation of the design principles. Some may conflict each other, the situation or may touch upon ethical dilemmas, e.g. Guggenheim Bilbao in City Branding.

Fragments of the Leiden Civic Museum are obviously or more subtly traceable to the thesis. Some ideas were directly translated into architecture. Others were redeveloped, remodelled or reinterpreted before application. One example is the principle Spatial Continuity, explained by Rietveld Pavilion, which is the backbone to the developed system of buffer zones between interior and exterior along the promenade architecturale. Arguably the precedent analysis handed me knowledge and inspiration as well to complete the graduation design.

Over the course of last year I received moderately positive feedback from my tutors. Instead of actively steering me, I was handed points of consideration, left free whether, and how to implement them into the project. This approach worked well for me. Elise supported me on the development of the concept, Engbert on its enforcement, Jan on its technical development.

Over the last 12 months, the graduation project taught me a great deal. The dynamics between research and design most importantly provided me with new tools to approach the design process. On a more general note, I gained more experience in constructing a project, by argument founded in society, rather than designing a building. Additionally, the COVID-19 situation that emerged in the beginning of 2020 asked to develop new ways of (co)working. The necessity of clear, well prepared verbal and visual presentation in order to successfully pass tutorials was confirmed. In that respect the situation prepared me for efficient cooperation with other design parties in a professional setting.
Bibliography


Idema, Johan & Roel van Herpt. Beyond the Black Box and the White Cube. Amsterdam: LAgroup, 2010


www.stevenholl.com/projects/storefront-for-art-and-architecture


London: Strategic Urban Futures Ltd, 2004


Image library

cover moma.org/collection/work/165001
4 britannica.com/topic/Colonnade-architectural-feature-Paris-France commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Salon_du_Louvre_1787.jpg
nybooks.com/articles/2019/12/05/megalo-moma/
artfixdaily.com/artwire/release/6630-moma-unveils-its-450-million-expansion
7 antronaut.net/post/180343204247/marcel-duchamp-la-boîte-en-valise-19361968
riksmonumenten.nl/monument/523562/krailler-maller-museum/otterlo/
archdaily.com/128627/ad-classics-whitney-museum-marcel-breuer
pinterest.it/pin/52734343759459331/
g1.globo.com/sp/sao-paulo/noticia/2018/12/08/avenida-paulista-completa-127-anos.html
pinterest.at/pin/118430665175121918/
tate.org.uk/research/publications/in-focus/walls-paper/112/greene-street
regis.com/apps/MapJournal/index.html?appId=08e407553554990be57b1f565b0393d
twitter.com/abasolo/status/639244839578652672/photo/2
moma.org/about/who-we-are/momaps1-history
flickr.com/photos/osbornb/63286740
8 publicdelivery.org/richard-serra-tilted-arc/
plusarchitect.tumblr.com/post/111895999344/then-travelling-pavilion-renzo-piano-building
phaidon.com/agenda/architecture/articles/2013/april/18/a-brazilian-show-for-a-gallery-never-to-be-built/
archdaily.com/242847/notes-from-the-archive-phanes-fraser-stirling
rrw-vakantie.nl/o-een-dag-in-het-museum-insel-hombroich-en-een-nacht-op-een-rakerbasis
hayustudio.com/design/lonodn-design-museum/
stephenvaradarchitecturavell.com/2016/06/01/groningen-glazen-video-gallery-netherlands/
mimoca.org/en/about/mimoca/
elisabets.nl/museum-rondeIedingen/rondeIeding-beelden-aan-zee-scheveningen/
pinterest.com/pin/8373949284910720/
groningermuseum.nl/
fonadazioneprada.org/project/chiesa-rossa/
pinterest.de/pin/53803948673390953/
9 kunst.blog.nl/kunst-in-openbare-ruimte/2012/06/08/den-haag-sculptuur-in-beeld
qz.com/706723/the-tate-moderns-new-wing-is-so-modern-it-only-has-one-painting/
dmagazine.com/arts-entertainment/2018/10/the-nasher-sculpture-center-celebrates-15-years/
dropstuff.nl/project/pleinmuseum/
en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Well_Hung_Lover
designboom.com/architecture/towada-art-center-ryue-nishizawa-12-27-2016/
pinterest.co.uk/pin/54036165527190749/
mmuseumm.com/
ft.com/content/54bb669a-d152-11e0-8146-001446cabe0
architectencentre.nl/nieuws/artikel.aspx?ID=36784
contemporaryartreview.la/slippery-when-wet-at-gait/
workingonworking.com/projects/141807-philadelphia-museum-of-art-constructionism
nrc.nl/nieuws/2019/04/10/the-shed-luxe-speeltuin-voor-de-sterren-a3956402
riksmonumenten.nl/monumenten/523562/krailler-maller-museum/otterlo/
archpaper.com/2012/07/on-view-aestheticsanesthesias-at-the-storefront-for-art-and-architecture-through-july-28/
43 stephenvaradyarchitraveller.com/2016/06/01/groningen-glass-video-gallery-netherlands/
    Google Earth
    coop-himmelblau.at/architecture/projects/video-clip-folly
    hiddenarchitecture.net/music-video-pavilion/
    hiddenarchitecture.net/groningen-music-video-pavilion-peter/
    stephenvaradyarchitraveller.com/2016/05/30/groningen-video-gallery-bus-stop-netherlands/
44 qz.com/706723/the-tate-moderns-new-wing-is-so-modern-it-only-has-one-painting/
    maproom.net/shop/central-london-map/
    ontheworldmap.com/uk/england/england-road-map.html
45 pinterest.at/pin/118430665175121918/
    en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Well_Hung_Lover
46 pinterest.at/pin/118430665175121918/
    anousparis.fr/a-voir/lhistoire-de-la-ligne-1-du-metro-parisien-en-3-stations-emblematiques/
    dailyphotoparis.blogspot.com/2010/11/different-subway-station.html
47 en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Well_Hung_Lover
    foodtravelphotography.com/doen-in-brisol/
    skalgubbar.se/2012/11/26/191-during-the-architecture-study-trip-back-in-june/