BEYOND THE FORMAL / INFORMAL DICHOTOMY
Towards a strategic perspective

The case of Warwick Junction in Durban

by Beryl Boonzaaier
motivation
theoretical framework
problem field
planning framework
spatial diagnosis
design
implementation
‘On average the size of the informal economy in Africa (in percent of GDP) was 42% for the years 1999/2000. Zimbabwe, Tanzania and Nigeria have with 59.4, 58.3 and 57.9% by far the largest informal economy. In the middle field are Mozambique, Cote d’Ivoire and Madagascar with 40.3, 39.9 and 39.6%. At the lower end are Botswana with 33.4, Cameroon with 32.8 and South Africa with 28.4%. In sum one realizes that the size of the informal economy which is more like a parallel economy in Africa is quite large’

The informal sector is a pervasive and persistent economic feature of most developing economies, contributing significantly to employment creation, production, and income generation.
FORMAL  +  INFORMAL

ONE ECONOMY
ACKNOWLEDGING THE DIFFERENT DEMANDS:

**ONE SYSTEM** that respond to both

**FORMAL** - Market driven approach responding to high-end formal market

**INFORMAL** - Struggling to be included into urban plans
Weakest group, losing out to the big pressure from the formal market
INTEGRATION OF THE VOICES OF THE WEAKEST ACTORS IN URBAN PLANS THROUGH A MORE PARTICIPATORY PLANNING APPROACH
theoretical framework
Strategic spatial planning is a **progressive and integrative**, socio-spatial and **participatory process** through which a **vision**, a set of **coherent actions** and the **means for implementation** are produced that shape and frame what a place is and might become. Strategic spatial planning identifies and gathers major social actors or stakeholders (public and private) and allows for decisions on concrete actions to be integrative of the voices of these actors, towards building a city collectively. Strategic planning is **selective and oriented to issues that really matter**. As it is impossible to do everything that needs to be done, ‘strategic’ implies that some decisions and actions are considered more important than others and that much of the process lies in making the tough decisions about what is most important for the purpose of producing structural responses to problems, challenges, aspirations and diversity (Albrechts 2004: 751-752).
Urban public space plays an important role in the livelihoods of the urban poor. The use of public space for personal and commercial purposes is common in cities of developing countries with the street being an asset as it provides space for commercial activities. Location thus tends to be of major importance to small scale operators. Brown, (2002) states that the access to the concentration of people and their assets and services are important to the urban poor. As well as being part of the public realm, the notion of shared space is important in this context, as it provides the opportunity for multiple uses. Public space is an important part of the social infrastructure for the urban poor, the flexible use of public open spaces increases the economic and social well being of the urban poor in developing countries.
As the morphology of the contemporary city has changed, its functions and forces have transformed. This change calls for new methods and models for viewing and understanding the city. As the dichotomy of city and country, nature and culture are weakened, landscape urbanism suggests a re-evaluation of landscape as a model to understand the cities of today and tomorrow. Bach and Clemmensen (2005) suggest that there is a particular functionality of the landscape, namely its ability to support and cope with natural and cultural processes over time. With this ability, Bach et. al (2005) suggest that interesting planning perspectives are raised since there is a potential to address processes in urban planning regarding both spatiality and temporality.
INFORMAL

Street Vendors

vs

Large Shopping Mall

FORMAL
TENSION BETWEEN THE FORMAL & THE INFORMAL ACTORS AND PROCESSES

SPATIAL FRAGMENTATION - NO CLEAR SPATIAL IDENTITY

LACK OF INTEGRATED PUBLIC TRANSPORT SYSTEM

LACK OF URBAN PLANNING COORDINATION

HIGH CONNECTIVITY OF TRANSPORT NODAL POINTS - CONGESTION & LOSS OF "SENSE OF PLACE"

problem statement
planning framework
Land Use Schemes

Environmental and built form guidance for geographic specific areas 1 - 5 year timeframe

Long Term Development Framework

Integrated Development Plan

Spatial Development Framework

Corporate / Multi-sectoral Strategic approach & intentions eThekwini Municipal-wide

Spatial Development Plan

Strategic / Multisectoral planning guidance for functional regions 10 - 20 year timeframe

Local Area Plan

Development guidance for geographically specific districts or precincts 3 - 10 year timeframe

Area-based management districts (ABM) in eThekweni (Durban)

LEGEND

- iTRUMP ABM
- SDB ABM
- CATO MANOR ABM
- INK ABM
- RURAL AND TRADITIONAL AREAS

MOBILISING STAKEHOLDERS

ISSUE AND CITY PROFILING

IDENTIFYING ISSUES

SPATIAL DIAGNOSIS

- involvement of all relevant social actors
- building consensus on key issues

PHASE 2

COLLECTIVE VISION DEVELOPMENT, ISSUE PRIORITISATION & STAKEHOLDER COMMITMENT

COLLECTIVE VISION AND URBAN PACT

- formal political and stakeholder commitment
- strategic alliance

PHASE 3

STRATEGY FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

LOCAL STRATEGIC PLAN

ACTION PLAN

LOCAL STRATEGIC PROJECT

INTEGRATING PROJECTS AND PLANS INTO STRATEGIC APPROACHES

MONITORING AND EVALUATION

UPSCALING AND REPLICATION

EVALUATION REPORT

INSTITUTIONALISATION

- formal political and stakeholder commitment
- strategy outlines

- involvement of all relevant social actors
- building consensus on key issues

PHASE 1

PREPARATORY AND STAKEHOLDER MOBILISATION

PHASE 4

MONITORING, EVALUATION AND CONSOLIDATION

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

FORMULATE STRATEGIC PLAN

NEGOTIATE AND AGREE ON ACTION PLANS
PHASE 1
PREPARATORY AND STAKEHOLDER MOBILISATION

MOBILISING STAKEHOLDERS

ISSUE AND CITY PROFILING

IDENTIFYING ISSUES

SPATIAL DIAGNOSIS
- involvement of all relevant social actors
- building consensus on key issues

METROPOLITAN SCALE

URBAN SCALE

LOCAL SCALE

MULTI-SCALAR CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK
METROPOLITAN ANALYSIS CONCLUSION

DMA ‘CORRIDOR OF POVERTY’

DMA ‘CORRIDOR OF WEALTH’

SPATIAL CONFLICT
Hierarchies of space

Urban grid

Informal spatial clusters
Exogenous

Formal spatial clusters
Endogenous

Hierarchies of space within urban structure
WHAT ARE THE SPATIAL EXPRESSIONS OF THE FORMAL AND INFORMAL ECONOMIES AND CONNECTIONS?

- **Flows of People and Movement Networks**
- **Formal Economic Activators**
- **Informal Economic Activators**
WHAT ARE THE VARIABLES THAT FACILITATE THE FORMAL/INFORMAL CONNECTION?

HIERARCHIES OF NETWORKS:

FUNCTIONAL CLUSTERS
- Social Infrastructure
- Cultural and Historic elements

INFRASTRUCTURE
- Road network and by-passes
- Public Transport system

TOPOGRAPHY
- Green and Blue elements
- Valleys, hills, rivers and ocean

[Diagrams of road network and by-passes, public transport system, social infrastructure clusters, cultural and historical elements, green and blue landscape structures]
WARWICK JUNCTION SPATIAL TRENDS
FACTS AND FIGURES

8000 daily traders
6 out of 10 are women
38 000 vehicles pass through/day
130 000 daily taxi departures
140 000 daily departures on train and bus
500 000 people passing through the site/day

RENTALS:
2x1m site without shelter has rent €3
with shelter has rent €5

EARNINGS:
monthly earnings of a trader R1000 (€73.5) - R8000 (€590)
€900-7000 annually

CONTRIBUTION TO THE ECONOMY:
GDP per capita: R30,392 (€2235)
1 billion (€73.5 million) annual turnover (informal)
Recognition of needs and demands of the **FORMAL ACTORS**

**Government:** public safety, access to finance capital and supporting institutional services

**Private Sector:** Access to services, office space, parking space safety and security
Recognition of needs and demands of the **INFORMAL ACTORS**

**Government:** public safety, access to finance capital, better access to licencing and registration offices

**Traders:** safety and security, more trading space, storage facilities, ablution facilities, access to services (water, sanitation, waste collection) child-care facilities, medical-care and shelter

**Homeless:** safety and security, short & medium term affordable accommodation, better quality of living conditions

**NGO’s:** support organisations, coordination and offices
STREET TRADER (NOMBEKO)

- Needs: Shelter & Security
- More space & Storage Facilities

TAXI WASHER/REPAIRMAN (LWAZI XABA)

- Needs: Access to Water Facilities
- Concerns: Harassment by police

INTERVIEWS

FOOD TRADER (CAROL SHANDU)

MOBILISING STAKEHOLDERS
ISSUE AND CITY PROFILING
SPATIAL DIAGNOSIS
IDENTIFYING ISSUES
ELABORATING ISSUES
BUILDING COLLABORATION AND FORGING A CONSENSUS ON FUTURE VISION
COLLECTIVE VISION AND URBAN PACT
- formal political and stakeholder commitment
- strategy outlines
STAKEHOLDER COMMITMENT
FORMULATE STRATEGIC PLAN
NEGOTIATE AND AGREE ON ACTION PLANS LOCAL STRATEGIC PLAN
LOCAL ACTION PLAN
LOCAL STRATEGIC PROJECT DESIGNING AND IMPLEMENTING STRATEGIC PROJECT INTEGRATING PROJECTS AND PLANS INTO STRATEGIC APPROACHES
MONITORING AND EVALUATION
UPSCALING AND REPLICATION EVALUATION REPORT
INSTITUTIONALISATION
 PHASE 1
PREPARATORY AND STAKEHOLDER MOBILISATION
 PHASE 2
COLLECTIVE VISION DEVELOPMENT, ISSUE PRIORITISATION & STAKEHOLDER COMMITMENT
 PHASE 3
STRATEGY FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION
 PHASE 4
MONITORING, EVALUATION AND CONSOLIDATION

METROPOLITAN SCALE
URBAN SCALE
LOCAL SCALE

EDGES
DESTINATIONS & FLOWS
Primary Destinations (Durban central city)
Secondary Destinations
Tertiary Destinations

Primary Destinations (CBD and Beachfront)
Secondary Destinations

Primary Destinations (CBD and Beachfront)
Secondary Destinations

Primary Destinations (CBD and Beachfront)
Secondary Destinations

Order of Priority
to Monty Naicker Road

to Monty Naicker Road

Order of Priority
to Monty Naicker Road

to Monty Naicker Road
1. Preamble
   Participants gathered in the present meeting recommend this Urban Pact for approval by the Municipal Council
   - Key events which preceded this meeting (e.g., earlier consultations, decisions)

2. Mandates
   - Recall formal mandates and agreements, going down from international level to local level (e.g., Agenda 21, Habitat Agenda, national poverty reduction plan, local development plan, local by-laws)

3. Fundamental Principles
   - Potentials and constraints concerning the development of the city (spatial, social, economic)
   - Take note of ongoing initiatives (e.g., investment plans, new policies)
   - Express a shared vision on the future (e.g., how do we want our city to be in 2015)

4. Commitment Package
   - Specify the measures agreed upon according to thematic categories; this is the largest part of the Urban Pact (e.g., to undertake a survey; to demonstrate a technology; to revise legislation)
   - Specify communication mechanisms (e.g., further mini-consultations; awareness campaign; relations technical - political officers)  
   - Propose institutional set-up (e.g., advisory board; working groups)

5. Resources
   - List partners commitments to contribute resources (e.g., human, technical, information, financial)
   - Describe intention to mobilize resources at different levels e.g. rationalize municipal revenues; approach to external support agencies.

6. Monitoring and evaluation
   Specify timing and modalities for review of agreements (e.g., frequency of review meetings; need to produce new version of Urban Pact: No.2, No. 3)

7. Approval
   Date and signatures of key partners (on behalf of the consultation group)
The main aim of this design is the recognition of diversity and identity of Warwick Junction within the Durban metropolitan area, using a multi-scalar approach in the analysis of space in order to evaluate the conflict of actors towards the inclusion of the weakest groups and to reinforce the spatial identity of the area.
DESIGN HYPOTHESIS

Through reinforcing the three main components of the central nodal point with it’s activation as a diversified system each with its’ own diverse supporting networks, the unique identity of Warwick Junction can be recognised and reinforced, giving space to the demands of the informal through a hybrid approach with the restructuring of streets and sidewalks by means of an urban programmatic landscape facilitated by an integrated public transport system.
PHASE 3
STRATEGY FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

- Formulate strategic plan
- Negotiate and agree on action plans
- Designing and implementing strategic project
- Integrating projects and plans into strategic approaches

METROPOLITAN SCALE

URBAN SCALE

LOCAL SCALE

INSTITUTIONALISATION
- formal political and stakeholder commitment
- strategy outlines
- involvement of all relevant social actors
- building consensus on key issues

PHASE 1
PREPARATORY AND STAKEHOLDER MOBILISATION

PHASE 2
COLLECTIVE VISION DEVELOPMENT, ISSUE PRIORITISATION & STAKEHOLDER COMMITMENT

PHASE 4
MONITORING, EVALUATION AND CONSOLIDATION

PHASE 3
STRATEGY FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

LOCAL STRATEGIC PLAN
LOCAL ACTION PLAN
LOCAL STRATEGIC PROJECT

ORDER OF PRIORITY

MEMORIAL AND FEED FORWARD SQUARES
CHURCH MARKETPLACE
BROOKE STREET & ART’S AND CULTURE
TO MONTY NAIKER ROAD

MEMORIAL AND FEED FORWARD SQUARES
CHURCH MARKETPLACE
BROOKE STREET & ART’S AND CULTURE
TO MONTY NAIKER ROAD

MEMORIAL AND FEED FORWARD SQUARES
CHURCH MARKETPLACE
BROOKE STREET & ART’S AND CULTURE
TO MONTY NAIKER ROAD
Perspective impression of street market alongside a pedestrian boulevard within the urban corridor
METROPOLITAN SCALE: PROPOSAL FOR A FUNCTIONALLY INTERRELATED REGION

PROGRAMME (Phase 1):
- Infrastructural linkages - rail & road
  - mixed housing
  - mixed uses - commercial & services

PROGRAMME (Phase 2):
- Economic zones
  - industrial
  - business parks
  - service & logistics
  - small & medium enterprises
PHASE 3
STRATEGY FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

FORMULATE STRATEGIC PLAN
NEGOTIATE AND AGREE ON ACTION PLANS
DESIGNING AND IMPLEMENTING STRATEGIC PROJECT
INTEGRATING PROJECTS AND PLANS INTO STRATEGIC APPROACHES

LOCAL STRATEGIC PLAN
LOCAL ACTION PLAN
LOCAL STRATEGIC PROJECT

METROPOLITAN SCALE

URBAN SCALE

LOCAL SCALE

EDGES DESTINATIONS & FLOWS
Memorial and Feed Forward Squares
Church Marketplace
Brooke Street & Art's and Culture
Order of Priority
to Monty Naicker Road
to Monty Naicker Road

PHASE 2
COLLECTIVE VISION DEVELOPMENT, ISSUE PRIORITISATION & STAKEHOLDER COMMITMENT

PHASE 1
PREPARATORY AND STAKEHOLDER MOBILISATION

PHASE 4
MONITORING, EVALUATION AND CONSOLIDATION

INSTITUTIONALISATION
- formal political and stakeholder commitment
- strategy outlines
- involvement of all relevant social actors
- building consensus on key issues
GRID (organisational device)

THREADS (circulation and linear pathways)

MATS (surfaces and fields)

ISLANDS (clusters and groups)

POINTS (scattered network of buildings)
The threads are divided into that which support the pedestrian network and the infrastructure which support the servicing and maintain the connectivity of the area to other areas. The pedestrian network is divided into pathways which facilitate slow movement (the curved element) and fast movement (linear) through the site. Secondary threads indicate permeable pedestrian connections through the site which link our intervention area to the rest of the surroundings in order to better activate the adjacent areas surrounding the local corridor.

The vehicular circulation routes are re-organised to diminish the pressure of vehicular flows but at the same time also enable the markets and other areas to be accessible and to be serviced. There are dedicated bus and cycling lanes as the supporting network to the primary pedestrian area. In other areas, where it was necessary to maintain the vehicular circulation in order not to cause a blockage in the system, priority has been given to pedestrians and cyclists crossing the street, this is indicated through a different surface material which causes motorists to realise slow down and drive with caution.
The concept of points are used in order to define the location and arrangement of the clusters of social and public infrastructure. These clusters are scattered through the site at strategic points creating a network of social spaces. These act as attractors and distributor spaces within the local area of intervention and activates the space. The points are connected by the threads, which are the linear pathways and circulation through the site.

The clusters of social infrastructure are based on the organisational concept of the traditional Zulu commune, this makes it easier for people to relate to and identify these clusters within the public space network. The services these clusters provide include: healthcare, small business support centres, municipal pay-points, public ablutions and information kiosks.

The clusters of public infrastructure are larger in size and their make-up, they are landmark spaces and mark the storage spaces within the area. These clusters provide the services of short-term affordable accommodation, storage areas for the markets, child-care services, workshops and training centres and waste recycling centres.

EXISTING SITUATION A-A

PROPOSED NEW CONDITION A-A

EXISTING SITUATION B-B

PROPOSED NEW CONDITION B-B

POINTS - social spaces
MATS - cultural spaces

EXISTING SITUATION A-A

EXISTING SITUATION B-B

PROPOSED NEW CONDITION A-A

PROPOSED NEW CONDITION B-B

Social Infrastructure

Informal markets & public space

Unused dilapidated space

Taxi transportation infrastructural hub

Waiting area & pick-up points

Taxi waiting & parking area

Exit road for Taxi's
This strategy deals with the creation of a public space network in the form of islands, which consists of clusters and groups of trees (landmarks), linked through rows of trees that bind these elements into a network of public spaces. By integrating better the green structures, this reinforces the possibility of the flows in a more variety of experiences than what currently exists which at the same time structurates the public open space system, and to be a pedestrian activator of the whole system.

These clusters of trees are landmarks within the public space network that allow for the legibility and the readability of the area. They are also places of rest and relaxation and play that offer a variety of activities within the local area and seeks to minimise the heat effect from the heavy infrastructural connections that converge within the site.

The issue of rain and stormwater is also taken into account in the creation of these clusters. The paving of the market street is made of porous paving which lets the water seep into the ground below, forming a water retention structure that allow the nourishment of these clusters with natural rainwater harvested through this network. The clusters are connected to each other by rows of trees that provide shade along the main circulation and secondary streets, facilitating movement and legibility and leads to the activation of adjacent spaces around the market area, to develop new uses and functions that take advantage of the pedestrian flows.

**Climatic Considerations**

Heat radiated from buildings, cars, roads, causes urban heat effect in city

Hot air spreads and cools down slightly

Heavy infrastructures increase the urban heat effect in the area

Hot air is cooled down more through the clusters of trees as it falls

Cool air is then drawn into the local area and city due to decrease in air pressure
CURRENT SITUATION
1. Establishment of a
WORKGROUP COMMITTEE + LOCAL COMMITTEE

2. negotiation with
MUNICIPALITY + INDIVIDUAL OWNERS

3. implementation
MUNICIPALITY + LOCAL COMMITTEE

4. maintenance & utilities cost
NGO or with
MUNICIPALITY or with
LOCAL COMMITTEE

- New programme
- Possible locations
- Spatial transformations
- If needed

100m
Decaying / Dilapidated
Vacant

0m 200m 500m N

MUNICIPALITY VACANT <2 YEARS
VACANT <5 YEARS
PRIVATELY OWNED BUILDINGS
SQUATTER BUILDINGS
Formula 1 Hotel (night)
Educational Facility (day)
Childcare Facility (day)
Affordable Shared Housing
Workshops & Training Centre
Healthcare One-Stop Centre
Creche playground
Library & learning
Affordable room rental & dining

Formula 1 Hotel (night)
Educational Facility (day)
Library & learning
Affordable room rental & dining

Homeless, Women & Children priority

Workshop & Training Centre
Healthcare One-Stop Centre

LOCAL COMMITTEE
VULNERABLE SOCIAL GROUPS
INDIVIDUAL OWNER
NGO's

SOCIAL TENURE
PLANNING INSTRUMENT
STAKEHOLDERS
TYPE
PROGRAM
PROCESS OF ACTIVATION
MONITORING & EVALUATION

2. negotiation with
3. implementation
- Acquisition of land by municipality
- New programme
- Possible locations
- Spatial transformations
- If needed

- New programme
- Collective community management
- Committee or NGO manages the distribution
- Monitor the process
MOBILISING STAKEHOLDERS
ISSUE AND CITY PROFILING
SPATIAL DIAGNOSIS
IDENTIFYING ISSUES
ELABORATING ISSUES
BUILDING COLLABORATION AND FORGING A CONSENSUS ON FUTURE VISION
COLLECTIVE VISION AND URBAN PACT
STAKEHOLDER COMMITMENT
FORMULATE STRATEGIC PLAN
NEGOTIATE AND AGREE ON ACTION PLANS LOCAL STRATEGIC PLAN LOCAL ACTION PLAN LOCAL STRATEGIC PROJECT
DESIGNING AND IMPLEMENTING STRATEGIC PROJECT
INTEGRATING PROJECTS AND PLANS INTO STRATEGIC APPROACHES
MONITORING AND EVALUATION
UPSCALING AND REPLICAION INSTITUTIONALISATION
EVALUATION REPORT

PHASE 1
PREPARATORY AND STAKEHOLDER MOBILISATION

PHASE 2
COLLECTIVE VISION DEVELOPMENT, ISSUE PRIORITISATION & STAKEHOLDER COMMITMENT

PHASE 3
STRATEGY FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

PHASE 4
MONITORING, EVALUATION AND CONSOLIDATION
physical separation = social segregation
integration = social symbiosis

“Urban design is a powerful tool. It plays a key role in the formulation and realization of strategic urban projects. It is a crowbar for innovation and a gate to unexpected solutions. It has the capacity to serve as a medium for negotiation and consequently leads to strong, stimulating and simultaneously open-ended plans, leaving margins for evolution and adaptation; contradictions can transcend into productive paradoxes.” (‘Urban Trialogues’, p.196)

“Vision is the art of seeing the invisible”
Jonathan Swift pg. 23
THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION!

questions??